

**The House met at eleven of the clock,  
Mr. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.**

-----

**REFERENCE TO VICTIMS OF AMRI HOSPITAL FIRE IN  
KOLKATA**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, as you are aware, a devastating fire swept through a seven-storied annexe building of AMRI hospital in Dhakuria in Kokata, in the early hours of 9<sup>th</sup> December, killing more than 90 persons, mostly patients, and injuring several others.

It is reported that most of them died due to asphyxiation. The loss of so many precious and innocent lives is indeed tragic and unfortunate. I am sure, the whole House will join me in expressing our heartfelt condolences and sympathy to the bereaved families and also pray for the speedy recovery of the injured.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

I request the hon. Members to rise in their seats and observe silence for one minute as a mark of respect to the memory of the departed.

**(Hon. Members then stood in silence for one minute)**

(Ends)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question No. 261.





































**Q.No. 261**

**श्री धीरज प्रसाद साहू:** माननीय सभापति महोदय, आपने मुझे यहाँ बोलने का जो मौका दिया है, उसके लिए मैं आपको धन्यवाद देता हूँ।

महोदय, मेरा पहला पूरक प्रश्न माननीय मंत्री जी से यह है कि कई राज्यों में, विशेषकर झारखंड राज्य में, कई ऐसे सुदूर गाँव हैं, जहाँ SC/ST एवं BPL, विशेषकर नक्सल-प्रभावित आबादी है, जहाँ ग्रिड द्वारा बिजली नहीं पहुँचाई जा सकती है और गैरपरम्परागत ऊर्जा स्रोतों से भी बिजली उपलब्ध नहीं कराई जाती है। यदि हाँ, तो तत्संबंधी ब्यौरा क्या है?

**SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL:** Sir, in Rajiv Gandhi Vidyutikaran Yojana, the plan is to provide access to electricity to the rural households of the country, including the BPL. So far, Sir, we have completed the work of connecting 1,00,100 villages all over the country. Also, we have completed the work of connecting 1.76 crores of BPL households; they have been provided electricity connection till the date.

As for question of the hon. Member regarding Left Wing Extremism affected areas as also the areas of the Scheduled Castes, we are concerned about the fact; we are concentrating on these areas to provide access to electricity for the families living under the BPL as

**Q. NO. 261 (CONTD.)**

also to the families affected by the Left Wing Extremism affected areas. We are providing electricity to them.

**श्री धीरज प्रसाद साहू:** महोदय, क्या यह सच है कि कुछ राज्यों में, विशेषकर झारखंड राज्य में, राजीव गांधी ग्रामीण विद्युतीकरण योजना धीमी गति से चल रही है एवं योजना के नाम पर घोटाला भी धड़ल्ले से चल रहा है? क्या इसकी जानकारी सरकार को है? यदि हाँ, तो सरकार ने उसको रोकने के लिए क्या कदम उठाए हैं?

**SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL:** Sir, we appreciate the concern of the hon. Member with regard to Jharkhand. There is a little delay in executing the projects. That is due to various reasons—land acquisition, forest clearance as also the Left Wing Extremist problem. There is a CBI inquiry going on in three districts. Therefore, works in Jharkhand are going in a slow process. We, from the Central Government, are monitoring the entire thing. A committee under the chairmanship of the Power Secretary is monitoring. We have also requested the State Governments to monitor projects under the Chief Secretary level. There are also committees at the district-level, including the Member

**Q. NO. 261 (CONTD.)**

of Parliament. We are closely monitoring the projects specially in Jharkhand, Sir. Now, the position in Jharkhand is somewhat better.

(Contd. by tdb/1b)

TDB/1B/11.05

**SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL (CONTD.):** For all these 22 districts, we have already sanctioned, at a revised cost, Rs.3,325.37 crores; out of which, Rs.2,905.7 crores have been released till 30<sup>th</sup> of this November, Sir.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, this question relates to rural electrification, and the hon. Minister has said that their target is to electrify one lakh villages. I think, he has made an attempt to show the details of all the villages to be electrified in various States, including the State of Jharkhand. I have a very simple question for the hon. Minister. I just would like to know from the hon. Minister, if one lakh villages have to be electrified and 24 hours of electricity has to be provided to them, then, what would be the total requirement of power for this purpose? What would be the total demand for these total villages to have power supply for 24 hours? Sir, the total number of

**Q. NO. 261 (CONTD.)**

villages in this country is around six lakh. What would be the total peak requirement of power for these six lakh villages having 24 hours of power supply in this country?

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, the hon. Member has asked a very wide question to me. Sir, under the first UPA Government in 2005-06, the programme was started to electrify all the villages in the country. At that time, the number of villages to be electrified was counted as one lakh twenty five thousand. But, subsequently, when the DPRs were actually called, the number of villages came to one lakh ten thousand. Out of those one lakh ten thousand villages, this House should appreciate the way we have electrified one lakh one hundred villages in the country. As far as the remaining villages are concerned, we are going to do it very fast.

Sir, when I joined this Ministry in January, 2005, the total installed capacity of this country was 1,22,000 MW. As on today, it is 1,85,000 MW. This much of increase in the installed capacity was never achieved in the history of India. Sir, we have added 10,000 MW every year. In the last five-and-a-half years, we have added 60,000

**Q. NO. 261 (CONTD.)**

MW. Earlier, in a Five Year Plan period, we used to do 8,000 MW or 10,000 MW. The installed capacity has been increased at a very high speed under the leadership of Dr. Manmohan Singh. Sir, power is one of the basic infrastructures of the country which our Government wants to develop fast.

The hon. Member wanted to know as to how much power is required. At the moment, we have a total installed capacity of 1,85,000 MW. (Interruptions) and our consumption is 1,08,000 MW only. As you know, power is on the Concurrent List. The States have to generate power as per their own capacity. Under the Rajiv Gandhi Gramin Vidyutikaran Yojana, the basic principle is that at least six to eight hours power supply is to be given to villages. After obtaining an undertaking from the States, this power is given for village electrification. At the moment, there is no shortage of power, as such. But, many States have not done capacity addition, and that is the reason why we are facing this difficulty. Jharkhand is one of the States which is facing the difficulty of power generation.

**Q. NO. 261 (CONTD.)**

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, I need your protection. It is a very simple question. What is the peak demand for providing 24 hours of electricity to all these six lakh villages? This is the information which is required in this House. Sir, actually, this country is of six lakh villages.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** This information can be furnished.

(Followed by 1c-kl)

KLS-DS/1C/11.10

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, another aspect which I would like the Minister to clarify is that the Eleventh Plan has stipulated one lakh MW and you have fallen short by about 40000 MW. You give an answer for that because you are getting 60000 MW but your Plan figure was one lakh MW. So, you should also tell why you have failed.

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** Sir, I must reply it because this is a major question in the Eleventh Plan and it has been under discussion also. In the Tenth Plan, the target given was of 42000 MW and the country could produce only 21000 MW. Keeping this in view, a target was to be given. ...(Interruptions).. The target given was 78777 MW, four times bigger than this, which this country had never done. We



**Q. NO. 261 (CONTD.)**

had no manufacturing companies for power equipments. ... (Interruptions)... You have to listen. ... (Interruptions)... Only BHEL was there. With the efforts that we made, the Prime Minister appointed a Committee and a decision was taken. Earlier we had only companies like BHEL, but now, in addition to BHEL, six more companies in the joint sector are coming. Therefore, this country will not have any problem. We were setting such a big target but with no equipments.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Why?

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** That was the situation earlier in the country. Now, Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am quite confident that this country will even export power equipments to other countries. I feel proud of this achievement of the UPA Government. ... (Interruptions)..

**श्री सभापति:** थैंक्यू। प्रो. अनिल कुमार साहनी।

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** Sir, there should be Half an Hour Discussion on that.

**Q. NO. 261 (CONTD.)**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please give notice for that. ...(Interruptions).. You cannot convert Question Hour into 'discussion hour'.

**SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY:** I will give notice, Sir.

**प्रो. अनिल कुमार साहनी:** माननीय सभापति महोदय, मैं मंत्री महोदय से सिर्फ सीधा-सीधा प्रश्न करना चाहता हूँ।

**श्री सभापति:** आप सवाल पूछिए।

**प्रो. अनिल कुमार साहनी:** सर, हम सवाल ही पूछ रहे हैं। आपने "राजीव गांधी ग्रामीण विद्युतीकरण योजना" के अन्तर्गत हर जगह बिजली दी है और रिपोर्ट में आपने यह जानकारी दी है कि 1,00,1,00 गाँवों में बिजली लगा दी है। लेकिन, एक तरफ आप लाइन लगाते जाते हैं, दूसरी तरफ ट्रांसफॉर्मर्स जल जाते हैं, क्योंकि वे टुल्लू ट्रांसफॉर्मर्स हैं। आप हर जगह छोटे-छोटे ट्रांसफॉर्मर्स लगा देते हैं, जिस कारण ..

**श्री सभापति:** आप सवाल पूछिए, भाषण मत दीजिए।

**प्रो. अनिल कुमार साहनी:** सर, सवाल यही है कि आप उन ट्रांसफॉर्मर्स को बदलने का क्या उपाय कर रहे हैं? आप बड़े ट्रांसफॉर्मर्स कब तक लगाइएगा? आप जो छोटा ट्रांसफॉर्मर लगाते हैं, उसके कारण गाँवों की समस्या और भी बिगड़ती जा रही है, वहाँ "चार दिन की चाँदनी और फिर अंधेरी रात" हो जाता है।

**Q. NO. 261 (CONTD.)**

**श्री सभापति:** आप सवाल पूछिए।

**प्रो. अनिल कुमार साहनी:** सर, मेरा सवाल यही है कि आप बड़ा ट्रांसफॉर्मर क्यों नहीं लगाते हैं, आप टुल्लू ट्रांसफॉर्मर क्यों लगाते हैं?

**श्री सभापति:** थैंक्यू, बैठ जाइए।

**श्री तारिक अनवर:** मुख्य मंत्री जी से बोलिए। ..(व्यवधान) ..

**श्री सभापति:** प्लीज़। ..(व्यवधान) ..

**प्रो. अनिल कुमार साहनी:** हम मुख्य मंत्री जी से कैसे कहेंगे? क्या इसे लगाना मुख्य मंत्री जी के हाथ में है? इसको लगाने का काम केन्द्र का है और ये लोग टुल्लू ट्रांसफॉर्मर लगा रहे हैं। ..(व्यवधान) .. आप उनके नाम से योजना बना दीजिए।

**SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL:** Sir, under RGGVY Scheme, HVDS is envisaged. In HVDS scheme, Sir, 11 KV lines are taken closer to households for giving power. This will not only reduce distribution losses but also prevent theft and pilferage. In HVDS more transfers are provided for giving connections to household. Depending upon the requirements of habitation area, more number of small transformers are provided. We have already requested the State Governments that if there are any more requirements of small

**Q. NO. 261 (CONTD.)**

transformers, they should put up a DPR. We are ready to give more small transformers. ...(Interruptions)..

**प्रो. अनिल कुमार साहनी:** सर, जो छोटा ट्रांसफॉर्मर होता है, वह जल जाता है। हमारा प्रश्न यह है कि आप उसको बदलने की क्या व्यवस्था कर रहे हैं? ..(व्यवधान) .. उन्होंने सवाल का आंसर अभी नहीं दिया है? ..(व्यवधान) ..

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक:** सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य का सवाल है कि आप बड़ा ट्रांसफॉर्मर लगाने के लिए क्या व्यवस्था कर रहे हैं, लेकिन ये सवाल को डायवर्ट कर रहे हैं।..(व्यवधान) ..

**श्री सभापति:** प्लीज़। ..(व्यवधान).. देखिए ..(व्यवधान) ..नहीं, नहीं।..(व्यवधान) ..प्लीज़ आप यह मत कीजिए, बैठ जाइए।..(व्यवधान) ..बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान) ..

**SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL:** Sir, it is being done for avoiding theft and pilferage. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक:** सर, ये सवाल को डायवर्ट कर रहे हैं।..(व्यवधान) ..

**श्री सभापति:** देखिए, आप बैठ जाइए।..(व्यवधान) ..

**प्रो. अनिल कुमार साहनी:** आपको छोटे ट्रांसफॉर्मर्स को हटाना होगा। ..(व्यवधान) ..

**Q. NO. 261 (CONTD.)**

**SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL:** Sir, for avoiding theft and pilferage, we are using small transformers.

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN:** Sir, in the reply of the Minister, we have seen that there are many villages which have been covered by this scheme. But it is also a fact that there are many villages which are not yet covered. My specific question is, whether there is any specific data available with the Ministry relating to people of the Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Backward Classes who are particularly living in these areas and are not getting the benefit of this scheme. What is the number of villages which are left out from this scheme? I think these are the areas which should be the first priority of this scheme. This is my specific question. I would like the Minister to kindly answer it.

(Followed by 1D/SSS)

SSS-HMS/1D/11.15/

**SHRI K. C. VENUGOPAL:** Mr. Chairman Sir, in the RGGVY, some of the projects are left out in the first phase. The hon. Member is actually correct. Sir, 34 new projects from the States of Chattisgarh, Haryana,

**Q. NO. 261 (CONTD.)**

MP, Tamil Nadu, Karnataka and Kerala which were left out earlier have been received by the Ministry. All these projects are under the consideration of the Ministry. We are considering these projects and it should be included in the very near future.

(Ends)











**Q. NO. 262****(Q. NO. 262 — Hon. Member absent)**

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद :** सभापति महोदय, खाने की चीजों के दाम बढ़ने में पैदावार और बहुत सारी चीजों का घपला तो है ही, लेकिन इस बारे में हम ने specific question पूछा है कि टमाटर के दाम क्यों बढ़ते हैं? महोदय, माननीय मंत्री ने उत्तर दिया है कि यह seasonal मामला है, लेकिन जिस तरह से stockists इन चीजों को इकट्ठा कर के रखते हैं और फिर ये बिचौलिए अपने दाम तय करते हैं। मेरा मंत्री महोदय से क्वेश्चन है कि इन बिचौलियों को ठीक करने के लिए सरकार के क्या नियम हैं? महोदय टमाटर तो आम गरीब लोग खाते हैं जबकि stockists इन चीजों को इकट्ठा कर के रख लेते हैं। तो क्या सरकार के पास ऐसा कोई यंत्र है कि ऐसे stockists की raid की जाए और उन के स्टॉक को बाजार में लाया जाए?

**PROF. K. V. THOMAS:** Sir, the question was on the cartel of traders stocking and increasing tomato prices. Sir, our information regarding tomatoes is that there is no cartelling by traders. But, Sir, there is a high fluctuation of prices of perishable commodities like tomatoes, potatoes and brinjals. Sir, the Department of Agriculture and Cooperation have taken a market intervention scheme through the horticulture Department. So this market intervention scheme is to

**Q. NO. 262 (CONTD.)**

protect the growers of this commodity from making distress sales in the event of a bumper crop, when there is a glut in the market causing prices to fall below the cost of production. If there are losses regarding procuring agencies, the Government of India and State Government make a 50-50 share. So, this is what has been done by the Horticulture Department of the Agriculture Ministry.

**SHRI M. V. MYSURA REDDY:** Sir, I want to know from the Minister that between last week of October and first week of November, the farm price of tomato is Rs. five to six. In the market it is Rs. 20 per kg. A gap of Rs. 15 is there. There is a price monitoring cell in the Government of India. May we know what is the report of price monitoring cell during this period of Rs. 15 gap and what are the actions taken by the Government?

(Followed by NBR/1E)

-SSS/NBR-NB/1E/11.20.

**PROF. K.V. THOMAS:** Sir, usually we take Delhi as an example. Sir, on 9-12-2011 i.e., three days back, in Delhi *mandi*, the price of tomato was Rs. 11 per kg. Sir, one week back, it was Rs. 13 per kg. But,

**Q. NO. 262 (CONTD.)**

one month back, it was Rs. 33 per kg. So, there is high fluctuation. There are various reasons. The reason behind high volatility was Diwali season which affected the arrivals of vegetables to *mandi*. Then, tomato is mainly produced in Andhra Pradesh. And, in view of the agitations taking place in Andhra Pradesh, there was some problem in the movement of trucks and rail transportation to many cities.

**SHRI M.V. MYSURA REDDY:** No, no, Sir. It is not correct.

**प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव :** सभापति जी, टमाटर एक ऐसी सब्जी है, जो ज्यादा दिनों तक नहीं चल सकती और सड़ जाती है। इस तरह के जितने भी perishable fruits and vegetables हैं, हिंदुस्तान में लगभग 50 हजार से लेकर 60 हजार करोड़ कीमत के फल और सब्जियां हर साल सड़ जाती हैं। इनकी प्रोसेसिंग की कोई व्यवस्था नहीं है। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि टमाटर को सुरक्षित रखने की व्यवस्था के अभाव में जो मूल्य वृद्धि होती है, उसको रोकने का एक ही तरीका हो सकता है कि उसको प्रोसेस किया जाए और उसको प्रिजर्व किया जाए। क्या आपने इस संबंध में फूड प्रोसेसिंग मिनिस्ट्री से कभी कोई चर्चा की है कि इसके लिए क्या किया जाए, जिससे हम इसको बचा सकें और इसकी कीमत को बढ़ने से रोक सकें?

**Q. NO. 262 (CONTD.)**

**PROF. K.V. THOMAS:** Sir, the Ministry of Agriculture, through the National Horticulture Board, is implementing a scheme called Capital Investment Subsidy for Construction/Expansion/Modernization of Cold Storages and Storages for Horticulture Produce. The second one is: The Ministry of Food Processing has a number of schemes, including the RKVY, which is left to the State Governments for having value additions.

**PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV:** Sir, it is only on paper.

(Ends)











**प्रश्न संख्या 263**

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** सभापति जी, यदि कैबिनेट मिनिस्टर साहब मेरे प्रश्न का उत्तर देंगे, तो मैं कृतज्ञ होऊंगा। मेरा प्रश्न बहुत स्पष्ट था कि 2011-12 में आपके बिजली प्रोडक्शन का क्या टारगेट था और कितना लॉस हुआ? आपने अपने उत्तर में कहा है कि अक्टूबर तक 5.3 बिलियन यूनिट्स का लॉस हुआ है। अच्छा होता यदि इसे आप मैगावाट में बताते। मैं जानना चाहूंगा कि मार्च तक कितना लॉस होगा? आपने अपने उत्तर में यह भी कहा है कि कोल इंडिया से आपने उत्पादन को बढ़ाने के लिए आग्रह किया है। संयोग से यहां माननीय कोयला मंत्री भी मौजूद हैं। हम अखबारों में पूरे पेज का विज्ञापन देखते हैं कि कोल इंडिया का रिकॉर्ड प्रोडक्शन हुआ है, उसके कारण उनकी तारीफ होती है और यहां इतना बड़ा mismatch आप review करते हैं। अतः मैं यह जानना चाहूंगा कि अभी आपने जो टारगेट बताया है, उसमें कितना लॉस होने वाला है और वह लॉस कम हो, इसके लिए आप क्या कर रहे हैं?

**श्री सुशील कुमार शिन्दे :** सभापति जी, यह जो बिजली का लॉस बताया जाता है, यह हमेशा बिलियन यूनिट्स में बताया जाता है और इसलिए हमने बिलियन यूनिट्स में बताया है। यह करीब कितने मैगावाट होगा, यह फिगर मैं आपको सप्लाइ कर दूंगा। Usually it is the practice to give loss of power in units and that is the reason why I have given the figure in units. यह बात सही है कि आजकल कोयले का उत्पादन -1 चल रहा है और यह बात भी सही है कि

**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

कई दिक्कतें उनको भी आ रही हैं, कहीं स्ट्राइक हो रही है, कहीं खदानों में पानी घुस गया है, कहीं ट्रांसपोर्टेशन नहीं मिल रहा है, इसकी वजह से यह सब हो रहा है। पूरा देश यह जानता है कि कोयले का प्रोडक्शन कम हो रहा है। इसके लिए हमने 10 to 15 percent and upto 20 percent imported coal को मिक्स करने का प्रयास किया है, ताकि बिजली का उत्पादन इस देश में होता रहे और जिस रफ्तार से हम काम करना चाहते हैं, वह हो सके।

(1F/MP पर क्रमशः)

MP-USY/1F/11.25

**श्री सुशील कुमार शिन्दे (क्रमागत) :** मैंने अभी-अभी बताया था कि जिस तरह से बिजली कपैसिटी अडिशन हो गई है, हमने यह नहीं सोचा था कि इतना कोयला लगेगा, तो अभी प्रोडक्शन बढ़ाने का काम चल रहा है। प्राइम मिनिस्टर भी तुरंत एक बैठक ले रहे हैं। कैबिनेट सेक्रेटरी को भी इस कोल शॉर्टेज के बारे में बैठक लेने के लिए कहा है और वे भी बैठक ले रहे हैं। मैं समझता हूं कि जैसे 11वें प्लान में हमने 12 हजार मेगावॉट करने का प्रयास किया है, वह हम कर सकेंगे। आज तक 10 हजार मेगावॉट हो गया है और अभी मेरे हाथ में दो महीने बाकी हैं, तो मैं कर पाऊंगा। सभापति जी, मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि हमने जब इस हाउस में बताया था कि 12 हजार मेगावॉट एक साल में पैदा किया और 15 हजार मेगावॉट synchronize किया था, तो हम उस रिकॉर्ड पर चल रहे हैं और हम आपको यह

**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

आश्वासित करते हैं कि इस देश को बिजली देने का काम इस साल भी हम जरूर करेंगे।

**WELCOME TO PARLIAMENTARY DELEGATION FROM MYANMAR**

---

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Can I seek your indulgence for a minute? I have an announcement to make. We have with us, seated in the Special Box, Members of a Parliamentary Delegation from Myanmar, currently on a visit to our country under the distinguished leadership of His Excellency, Mr. Thura U Shew Mann, Speaker of Pyithu Hluttaw, the Lower House of the Parliament of Myanmar. On behalf of the Members of the House and on my own behalf I take pleasure in extending a hearty welcome to the Leader and other Members of the Delegation and wish our distinguished guests an enjoyable and fruitful stay in our country. We hope that during their stay here, they would be able to see and learn more about our parliamentary system, our country and our people and that their visit to this country will further strengthen the friendly bonds that exist between India and Myanmar.

Through them, we convey our greetings and best wishes to the Parliament and the friendly people of Myanmar.

(Ends)

**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** माननीय मंत्री जी, मुझे इस बात का संतोष है कि आपने सदन में स्वीकार किया कि कोल का उत्पादन माइनस में है। जो विज्ञापन हम देखते हैं, वह सच्चाई नहीं है। आपने अभी पूर्व प्रश्न के उत्तर में यह कहा कि कोयला पावर जो है, वह Constitution में Concurrent List में है, हम जानते हैं। तो क्या यह सच्चाई नहीं है कि कोल ब्लॉक के लोकेशन में चाहे वह मध्य प्रदेश हो, छत्तीसगढ़ हो, झारखंड हो, बिहार हो, इनको परेशानी आती है। मध्य प्रदेश के सांसदों को राष्ट्रपति को memorandum देना था, ठीक है, पावर उनका अधिकार है, लेकिन कोयला ब्लॉक देना आपका अधिकार है और मध्य प्रदेश, झारखंड, छत्तीसगढ़, उत्तर प्रदेश, उड़ीसा — सारे कोल ब्लॉक वहीं पर हैं। वहां की जनता विपक्ष को वोट देती है, आपको नहीं, तो इसके कारण क्या आप अच्छे कोल ब्लॉक देंगे नहीं और कहेंगे कि वे पावर पूरा नहीं करते हैं? ऐसा कैसे चलेगा? इसके बारे में संघीय ढांचे के अनुसार हम आपसे एक स्पष्ट कमिटमेंट चाहेंगे कि क्या सारी प्रदेश सरकारों को, उनका राजनीतिक रंग कुछ भी हो, आप कोल ब्लॉक समय से, उनकी मांग के अनुसार देंगे? इसका यह उत्तर मैं आपसे जानना चाहता हूँ।

**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

**श्री सुशील कुमार शिन्दे :** सभापति जी, कई ऐसे प्रांत हैं जहां ऐसी खदानें बहुत बड़ी तादाद में हैं, लेकिन कई ऐसी स्टेट्स हैं, जहां खदानें नहीं हैं। जहां खदानें हैं, उनको देने की और बाहर के राज्यों को भी देने की पॉलिसी रही है और उन माइन्स का बहुत स्टेट्स में बंटवारा भी हो गया है। 10<sup>th</sup> plan में और 11<sup>th</sup> plan की beginning में बंटवारा हो गया है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** क्षमा करेंगे मंत्री जी, आप सही नहीं बोल रहे हैं। मैं interrupt नहीं करता हूं। यहां मध्य प्रदेश का delegation लेकर राष्ट्रपति जी के यहां मैं भी गया था। बिहार की समस्या मैं जानता हूं, झारखंड की समस्या मैं जानता हूं, उड़ीसा की चर्चा कर रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान)... हर जगह discrimination हो रहा है कोल ब्लॉक्स को लेकर। ...(व्यवधान)...

**SHRI N.K. SINGH:** Sir, there is a heavy discrimination.

**श्री सभापति :** प्लीज़.... प्लीज़ ..... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** क्षमा कीजिए, यह सही नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्रीमती माया सिंह :** सर ....(व्यवधान)...

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** यह आप सही नहीं बोल रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति :** बैठ जाइए... बैठ जाइए प्लीज़ ...(व्यवधान)...

(1G/SC-GSP पर क्रमशः)

**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

GSP-SC-11.30-1G

**MR. CHAIRMAN (CONTD.):** Please sit down. बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान)..  
आप लोग बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान).. One minute please.

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA:** Sir, the States are being discriminated in this matter. (Interruptions)

**श्री प्रभात झा :** हमें कोयले के खदान नहीं दिए जाते हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** मंत्री जी, आप ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** उत्तर प्रदेश के साथ भी सौतेला व्यवहार होता है।  
..(व्यवधान).. वहां भी ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री प्रभात झा :** हर जगह कोल ब्लॉक का घोटाला होता है। ..(व्यवधान)..

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** It is a serious thing. (Interruptions)

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA:** Except a few States...  
(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** One minute. I think, this is a subject...  
(Interruptions)...

**SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD:** Sir, it is a serious issue.  
(Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please. One minute. (Interruptions)



**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** कोयला मंत्री कुछ कहना चाहते हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

**SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD:** We want your protection, Sir.  
(Interruptions)

**श्री सभापति :** आप बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान).. एक मिनट बैठ जाइए।  
..(व्यवधान).. Just one minute please. If the Members so desire, they can give notice for a discussion on this subject. This is a question, to which an answer is being given. If the answer is not...  
(Interruptions)...

**SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD:** What is the answer being given?  
That's the query. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You have not heard the complete answer.  
(Interruptions)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Coal is being imported from Australia when good quality coal is available here. (Interruptions)

**श्री सभापति :** आपका सवाल नहीं था। आप बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान)..

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** Sir, I have been very particular in telling... (Interruptions)...

**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** There are other questions to be answered also.

(Interruptions)

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** सर, सदस्यों को संरक्षण चाहिए ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि :** वहां भेदभाव होता है। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति :** पाणि जी, प्लीज़ बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्रीमती माया सिंह :** सर..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please, Maya Singh ji. (Interruptions) It was not your question. (Interruptions) It is not your question. Please sit down. आपका प्रश्न नहीं था। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि :** सभापति महोदय, ..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please sit down. आपका सवाल नहीं था, आप बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान).. माया सिंह जी, आप भी बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान)..

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** Sir, first of all...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please sit down. (Interruptions)

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** Sir, first of all, it is a question of the Coal Ministry, and, the Power Ministry recommends the cases as and when it sees the requirement. In the past, we have recommended linkage and the coal blocks. Our job is to just recommend and the job

**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

of the allotment is of the Coal Ministry. (Interruptions) It is not...  
(Interruptions)...

**SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD:** What is this, Sir? (Interruptions)

**PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV:** He is also sitting here. (Interruptions)

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** I must bring it to the notice of the House that considering this difficulty, in the Twelfth Plan, we have recommended a linkage of 1, 25,000 MW...(Interruptions)..

**श्री सभापति :** यह मत करिए। This is completely unacceptable.  
(Interruptions) Don't disrupt. (Interruptions) No, no.  
(Interruptions) This is unacceptable behaviour. (Interruptions)

**श्री एस.एस.अहलुवालिया :** अभी भी होता है। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** कम से कम वे सही जवाब तो दें। It is a serious issue, Sir. (Interruptions)

**श्री सभापति :** आप यहां मत आइए। (व्यवधान) Mr. Pany, I will name you. Go back, otherwise, I will name you. I am warning you.  
(Interruptions)

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA:** Discrimination against States is there. (Interruptions)

**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** It is a big scam. (Interruptions)

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** Sir, I have told very categorically that my job is to recommend the linkage. (Interruptions) Many States have blocks but they are not working on it. (Interruptions)

(contd. by YSR-1H)

-GSP/YSR-MCM/11.35/1H

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE (CONTD.):** Sir, I have not understood what exactly they wanted. (Interruptions) I am replying to their question. (Interruptions)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, please allow a discussion on coal block allotment to non-users. (Interruptions) People are forced to import coal whereas good quality coal, high calorific value coal, is available in the country. But people are unable to use it because that is sanctioned to the people who are not using it but black-marketing it for ईट का भट्टा (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Ahluwalia sahib, you know the procedure very well. (Interruptions) If you want a discussion, please give notice for it.

**Q.No. 263 (Contd.)**

(Interruptions) Don't seek a discussion under the guise of a question.

(Interruptions)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, we will give a notice.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** That is not the way to give notice from the floor. I am distressed at the behaviour of the Members of the senior House of Parliament. (Interruptions)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, we are here to get the answer from the Government. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** But this is not the way to seek answers. (Interruptions) I would like to put a question to the House. (Interruptions) I would like to put a question to the House. Does this House wish to have a Question Hour as such?

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Yes, Sir.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Or does it wish to do away with it? (Interruptions)

**DR. FAROOQ ABDULLAH:** This is what I only want to request all. Sir, we are ready to answer the question. If there is some problem in our answer, as you quite rightly said, you can ask for a discussion on it. I think that this is the best way. (Interruptions)

**Q.No. 263 (Contd.)**

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Don't mislead the House. (Interruptions)

**DR. FAROOQ ABDULLAH:** You are quite right to ask the question.

You are quite right to get the answer. And if you are not satisfied with the answer..(Interruptions).. Please use democratic method. Don't get into the centre of the well. (Interruptions) कोई एक बात करे तो हम सुन सकते हैं, आप तो इतने लोग बात कर रहे हैं कि हम सुन ही नहीं सकते कि आप क्या बोल रहे हैं। (व्यवधान)

**SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD:** Sir, we will give a notice. (Interruptions)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Can we now get on with supplementaries to this question? Let the supplementary be answered.

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** Sir, first of all, this department belongs to the Coal Ministry. However, I was replying to the question of the hon. Member that our job is to recommend coal blocks according to the demand.

(Contd. by KR/1J)

**Q.No. 263 (Contd.)**

KR-GS/1J/11.40

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE (CONTD.):** We recommend linkages blocks used by the Coal Ministry. But I must bring it to your notice and I have been seeing for the last six years, coal blocks which were distributed in 2001, 2002 and 2003, mining has not yet been started. So, the Department of Coal has issued notices to such people either return or start the work. As far as coal blocks which were given to the States of Madhya Pradesh and Bihar are concerned, we have sent our recommendations to the Department. It is not that we have not sent the recommendations. For mining it takes 5-6 years. Once mining is allotted, environmental clearance and forest clearances have to be obtained. In 2011, the mining has just started. It takes 5-6 years.

**MR CHAIRMAN:** Dr Mungekar please. ...(Interruptions)...

**DR. CHANDAN MITRA:** Issue some rule that the Minister must come prepared. ...(Interruptions)... आपको क्या आपत्ति है? ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति :** आप जरा बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान)..

**Q.No. 263 (Contd.)**

**SHRI SHYAMAL CHAKRABORTY:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, may I know from the hon. Minister whether Coal India Ltd is not able to supply committed amount of coal to several power generating stations? May I also know whether shortage of railway wagons to transport coal to the power stations is affecting power generation? In fact, during rainy season, coal remains unprotected and gets wet. As a result, power generation is not possible.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** One question please.

**SHRI SHYAMAL CHAKRABORTY:** It is part of the one question.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No. One question.

**SHRI SHYAMAL CHAKRABORTY:** Is it a fact that private players are getting priority in the supply of coal over the public sector power stations?

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** In fact, the question does not pertain to my Ministry. However, as the Power Minister, I am aware of the problem and I am facing difficulties to get coal. ...(Interruptions)....

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Let the Minister answer.



**Q.No. 263 (Contd.)**

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** As the hon. Member said, due to rain coal gets wet and due to non availability of wagons coal does not reach power stations in time, it is a fact and that is why there is a minus one negative growth. If I get coal, we can generate more and more power. The Coal Mnister is also trying his best to improve the situation. Suddenly, the demand for power has grown up. That is why we are facing the difficulty.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri Ratanpuri.

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** Shri Prakash Jaiswal wants to reply.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri Ratanpuri, just one minute. Let Shri Prakash Jaiswal reply.

**श्री श्रीप्रकाश जायसवाल :** सर, हालांकि हमारा यह क्वेश्चन नहीं था, लेकिन माननीय सदस्यों की तरफ से आशंका प्रकट की जा रही है। दो-तीन मूल बातें हैं जिन्हें माननीय सदस्य जानना चाहते हैं। पहली बात तो यह है, माननीय सदस्यों का कहना यह है कि साहब जिन स्टेट्स में कोल पैदा होता है, उन स्टेट्स के साथ भेदभाव किया जा रहा है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

**श्री बलबीर पुंज:** हमने कहा है कि गैर-कांग्रेसी सरकारों के साथ भेदभाव होता है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

**श्री श्रीप्रकाश जायसवाल:** आप बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान)... माननीय सभापति जी, देश के केवल 30 परसेंट हिस्से में कोल पैदा होता है और हमें सप्लाई पूरे देश में करनी होती है। इस तरह की बात कही जाए कि कोल उड़ीसा में पैदा होता है, इसे आप दूसरे स्टेट्स को क्यों देते हो और मध्य प्रदेश को फायदा होता है और दूसरी स्टेट्स को... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री बलबीर पुंज:** यह कौन कह रहा है? ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि:** सर, ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री श्रीप्रकाश जायसवाल :** सर, ... (व्यवधान)... सर, मैं यह ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया :** सर, ये कैसी बात करते हैं? ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद:** सर, मंत्री जी पूरी तरह से ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** प्लीज़, प्लीज़, बैठ जाइए, बैठ जाइए। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया:** सर, गेहूं पंजाब में पैदा होता है और पूरा देश खाता है। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि:** सर, उड़ीसा में कोयले का उत्पादन होता है। ... (व्यवधान)...

(1K/ASC पर आगे)

**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

ASC-TMV/11.45/1K

**श्री श्रीप्रकाश जायसवाल :** सर, मैं दावे के साथ कह सकता हूँ कि जिस स्टेट में कोयला पैदा होता है ....(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति :** पाणि जी, आप बैठ जाइए। ...(व्यवधान)..

**श्री श्रीप्रकाश जायसवाल :** उस स्टेट को दूसरी स्टेट से ज्यादा कोयला दिया जाता है। ...(व्यवधान).. ज्यादा कोल ब्लॉक किए गए हैं, ...(व्यवधान).. ज्यादा कोल के लिंकेज दिए गए हैं।...(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति :** आप नोटिस दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान).. मैं कितनी बार कहूँ कि आप पहले नोटिस दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)..

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी :** सर, मंत्री जी कहां की बात कर रहे हैं? ...(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति :** आप नोटिस दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)..

**श्री श्रीप्रकाश जायसवाल :** यह कहना कि भेदभाव किया जाता है, यह बिल्कुल गलत है। ...(व्यवधान).. हमारे माननीय सदस्यों के दिमाग में दूसरा संशय यह है....(व्यवधान).. Sir, thank you.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Yes, please go ahead, Mr. Ratanpuri.

**SHRI G.N. RATANPURI:** Sir, the NHPC has commissioned its first unit with a capacity of 15 megawatts at Chutuk, Kargil. But it has failed to put in place the transmission and distribution system which

**Q.No. 263 (Contd.)**

was entrusted to it under the Rajiv Gandhi Grameen Vidyutikaran Yojana. Under this Yojana our State has not completed more than 50 per cent target, but the allocation has been reduced as compared to the previous years. Again our State is among the States which have the highest transmission losses. We have submitted certain projects to revamp the transmission and distribution system in the State. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether he knows that the power which can be used in Kargil is not being used. We are not in a position to use it because NHPC has failed to put in place the transmission and distribution system and whether he will expedite the projects to reduce the transmission and distribution loss in Jammu and Kashmir.

**SHRI SUSHILKUMAR SHINDE:** Sir, it is a little difficult there and the work has been going on. But I accept the anxiety of the hon. Member and I will ask the officers of the NHPC to speed up the work. We will take cognizance of it because we need to concentrate more on this border area and we will take care of it.

**प्रश्न संख्या 263 (क्रमागत)**

**डा. विजयलक्ष्मी साधौ :** सर, कोयले की पर्याप्त आपूर्ति न होने के कारण विद्युत उत्पादन व अन्य उत्पादन प्रभावित होने की बात कही गई है। मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहती हूँ कि मध्य प्रदेश सरकार के ऊपर कोयला आबंटन में पिछला कितना बकाया है अर्थात् वह कितना बचा हुआ है? ।

**श्री सुशील कुमार शिन्दे :** कोयले का प्रश्न है इसलिए मैं इसके बारे में नहीं बता सकूंगा। चाहे मध्य प्रदेश हो, झारखंड हो या जहां पर भी खदानें हैं वे कोयले से संबंधित हैं।

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Q. No. 264. I think we have spent more than half-an-hour on one single question.

**श्री रामदास अग्रवाल :** महोदय, मैं बहुत बेसिक बात बताना चाहता हूँ।  
...(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति :** रामदास जी, आप बैठ जाइए। ...(व्यवधान)... बैठ जाइए, बैठ जाइए।

(समाप्त)











**Q. NO. 264.**

-KR-TMV-ASC/1K/11.45

**SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA:** Sir, the hon. Minister has mentioned here in his reply that to improve the functioning of the Targeted Public Distribution System the Central Government has been regularly requesting the State and Union Territory Governments for continuous review of the list of below poverty line people. My question is: Whose responsibility is it to finalise or to review the list of below poverty line people? In our country always the Central Government decides the criteria for determining the number of below poverty line families. How will the State Government improve the system or improve the list? So, I want to know from the hon. Minister whether the Central Government is thinking to improve the list or to make a proper list of below poverty line people and make the system effective to enable the foodgrains to reach the really needy people of our country.

(Contd. by 1L/VK)

**Q. No. 264 (Contd.)**

VK/1L/11.50

**PROF. K.V. THOMAS:** Sir, the BPL and APL number for each of the State is decided by the Planning Commission and the Ministry of Rural Development on certain norms. Now it was decided on the basis of 1992-93 estimation of poverty and population in the year 2000. This is the duty of the Planning Commission and the Ministry of Rural Development. What the Ministry of Food and Civil Supplies does is, we supply to each State, to our registered godowns, the required quantity of foodgrains as decided by the Planning Commission and the Ministry of Rural Development on the basis of the number of BPL and APL families.

**SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA:** In the Economic Survey of 2010-11, prepared by the Ministry of Finance, it has been mentioned that over 40 per cent of all grain targeted at the poor missed the poor in 2001-02. Can the Minister tell us, why, at that time, 40 per cent of all grain targeted at the poor missed to reach the poor? At present, in 2011, what is the percentage of foodgrain missing the poor families of our country?

**PROF. K.V. THOMAS:** Sir, the statement in the Economic Survey, 2010-11, came on the basis of a study done by Reetika Khera. Sir, the same Committee, after some years, have made further studies, and in their letter dated 21.7.2011 to the hon. Prime Minister, they have further clarified -- this is the crux of their letter -- "Our Survey covered more than 100 randomly selected villages spread over nine States, Andhra Pradesh, Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Himachal Pradesh, Jharkhand, Orissa, Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu and Uttar Pradesh. We inspected the local Fair Price Shops and interviewed more than a

**Q. No. 264 (Contd.)**

thousand BPL households. Oblivious of the heat or rain, we reached the country's remotest nooks and crannies and spared no effort to understand people's situation and views". This is the point. This Survey points to an impressive revival of the PDS across the country. In all the sample States, with the notable exception of Bihar, there have been major initiatives in the recent past to improve the PDS and these efforts are showing results. Most of the sample households were getting the bulk, if not the whole of their foodgrain entitlements under the PDS up to 35 kilograms per month at a nominal price. This is the report of the same Committee after some years. This is because we have taken a number of actions. A Committee has been constituted by the Planning Commission under the Programme Evaluation. Then another Committee was constituted under ORG-MARG and another Committee was constituted by NCAR, under NCR. So all these Committees are evaluating and we are giving suggestions to the State Governments. Nine-point programmes have been given and things have improved.

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, while noting that the answer shows that the two successive UPA Governments had, in fact, succeeded in greatly improving the targeting of Public Distribution Systems, may I draw the hon. Minister's attention to the provision in the Eleventh Schedule of the Constitution for the PDS to be brought under the Panchayati Raj System?

(Contd. By 1M)

**Q.No.264 (contd.)**

RG/11.55/AKG/1M

**SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (contd.):** And, I would request him to kindly consider consulting, with his colleague, the hon. Minister of Panchayati Raj, to see how we can bring these PDS outlets under the Panchayats in order to ensure that, in the last mile, there is more effective distribution than is the case at present.

**PROF. K.V. THOMAS:** Sir, I whole-heartedly welcome the suggestion given by the hon. Member. Under the new Food Security Bill, the distribution, evaluation and deciding the particular sectors, etc. are almost entrusted to the Panchayati Raj Institutions. Actually, distribution is the responsibility of the State Government, and we have suggested that the State Governments should strengthen the Panchayati Raj Institutions. So, running of the PDS, its evaluation and social auditing have to be done by the Panchayats.

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Sir, I would repeat the supplementary which my colleague has already raised because we have not got the answer. Sir, the Economic Survey had identified that 40 per cent of foodgrains get lost. And, now, the Minister has made a statement in

**Q.No.264 (contd.)**

this House, in his reply, that there are impressive improvements in the PDS in those areas. This, I think, should have reflected in the prices of foodgrains, but it is, unfortunately, not so. My supplementary is this. After all those impressive achievements, what is the present level of loss in the foodgrains meant for the poor through the TPDS? I want the present level, nothing more. Please do not repeat what you have already stated in your reply.

**PROF. K.V. THOMAS:** Sir, I have got the State-wise information as to what the damage is and how much siphoning off takes place, etc. It is a long list. I can pass it on to the hon. Member. But I would like to tell him that, presently, on an average, it is between 10 and 15 per cent.

**प्रो. एस.पी. सिंह बघेल :** धन्यवाद सभापति महोदय। माननीय मंत्री जी ने अपने जवाब में कहा है कि खाद्य वितरण प्रणाली में बहुत सुधार हो गया है और समाज के आखिरी व्यक्ति, गरीब व्यक्ति तक इनका भोजन पहुँच रहा है। मनरेगा यह कह रही है कि हम 100 दिन काम दे रहे हैं और लगभग 110 रुपए दे रहे हैं। आप 35 किलो खाद्यान्न दे रहे हैं, जिनमें दाल, चावल, चीनी, वगैरह दे रहे हैं। इसके

**Q.No.264 (contd.)**

बाद भी समाचार पत्रों और टेलीविजन के माध्यम से कई बार पता चलता है कि भोजन के अभाव में मृत्यु हो रही है।

**श्री सभापति :** आप सवाल पूछिए।

**प्रो. एस.पी. सिंह बघेल :** सर, मैं सवाल पूछ रहा हूँ। मनरेगा यह कह रही है कि हम काम दे रहे हैं और 100 दिन गारंटी के साथ काम दे रहे हैं। आप कह रहे हैं कि हम भोजन दे रहे हैं, 110 रुपए दे रहे हैं, इसमें 35 किलो खाद्यान्न आएगा। अगर कोई आदमी 200 ग्राम खाएगा, तो 140 बार का भोजन हो जाएगा। इसके बाद भी समाचार पत्रों से पता चलता है कि भूख के कारण मृत्यु हो रही है।

**श्री सभापति :** आप सवाल पूछिए।

**प्रो. एस.पी. सिंह बघेल :** मेरा सीधा सा सवाल है कि यदि यह सिद्ध हो जाए कि भोजन के अभाव में देश में किसी की मृत्यु हुई है, तो क्या मनरेगा देने वाले के खिलाफ, खाद्य वितरण प्रणाली के राशन विक्रेता के खिलाफ, एसडीएम के खिलाफ, गाँव के प्रधान के खिलाफ और डीएसओ के खिलाफ आप गैर-इरादतन हत्या का मुकदमा पंजीकृत करेंगे?

**PROF. K.V. THOMAS:** Sir, the TPDS is run by both the Central Government and the respective State Government. The duty of the Central Government is to procure, stock and transport the foodgrains to the allocated FCI shops in the States. From the FCI shops, it is the

**Q.No.264 (contd.)**

State Governments which take the foodgrains and distribute it to the PDS shops. So, now and then, we get in touch with the State Governments. Enough instructions have been given, and many of the State Governments have improved their PDS shops. States like Chhattisgarh, Andhra Pradesh and Kerala have become model States, and they are taking action whenever they find out that some quantity of foodgrains, which have been allotted to PDS shops, are being siphoned off.

(Ends)















**प्रश्न संख्या 265**

**श्री गंगा चरण :** सभापति महोदय, मैं भी आपके दुख के साथ दुखी हूँ।

**श्री सभापति :** आप सवाल पूछ लीजिए।

**श्री गंगा चरण :** मैं आपके दुख के साथ दुखी हूँ कि जो उच्च सदन का आचरण है, मुझे लगता है कि माननीय सदस्यगण न तो अखबार पढ़ते हैं और न इलेक्ट्रॉनिक मीडिया में न्यूज देखते हैं ... (व्यवधान) ... वहाँ हमारे आचरण के बारे में दिखाया जा रहा है, वह बहुत ही shameful है। मैं आपके दुख के साथ सहमत हूँ।

**श्री सभापति :** आप बैठ जाइए। Question Hour is over.

(Ends)

RG/SCH/12.00/1N

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.**

**PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE**

1. **SHRI VIRBHADRA SINGH:** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

(i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Technology Development Centre (Central Footwear Training Institute), Chennai, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Technology Development Centre (Central Footwear Training Institute), Agra, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
  - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Technology Development Centre (Process cum Product Development Centre), Meerut, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
  - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (iv) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Technology Development Centre (Process cum Product Development Centre), Agra, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
  - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (v) (a) Forty-first Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Technology Development Centre (Institute for Design of Electrical Measuring Instruments), Mumbai, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
  - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (vi) (a) Forty-first Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Tool Room (Central Institute of Tool Design), Hyderabad, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
  - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.



- (vii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Tool Room (Indo-German Tool Room), Aurangabad, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
  - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (viii) (a) Twenty-fourth Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Technology Development Centre (Electronics Service and Training Centre), Ramnagar, Uttarakhand, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
  - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (ix) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Tool Room (Central Tool Room and Training Centre), Kolkata, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
  - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (x) (a) Nineteenth Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Tool Room (Central Tool Room and Training Centre), Bhubaneswar, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
  - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (xi) (a) Nineteenth Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Tool Room (Indo-German Tool Room), Ahmedabad, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
  - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

- (xii (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Tool Room (Indo-Danish Tool Room), Jamshedpur, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (xiii (a) Twenty-eighth Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Tool Room (Central Institute of Hand Tools), Jalandhar, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (xiv (a) Tenth Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Tool Room (Tool Room and Training Centre), Guwahati, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (xv (a) Nineteenth Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Tool Room (Indo-German Tool Room), Indore, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (xvi (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the MSME-Tool Room (Central Tool Room), Ludhiana, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.

2. **SHRI SRIPRAKASH JAISWAL:** Sir, I lay on the Table—

- 1. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Coal

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Notification No. S.O. 2155 (E), dated the 21<sup>st</sup> September, 2011, regarding exercise of powers by a standing committee headed by the Secretary (Coal) under Section 5(2) (b) of the Mines and Minerals (Regulation and Development) Act, 1957, under sub-section (1) of Section 2 of the Mines and Minerals (Regulation and Development) Act, 1957.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) of Section 619A of the Companies Act, 1956:—

(i) (a) Fifty-fifth Annual Report and Accounts of the Neyveli Lignite Corporation Limited, Chennai, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

(ii) (a) Ninetieth Annual Report and Accounts of the Singareni Collieries Company Limited (SCCL), Khammam, Andhra Pradesh, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.

3. **SHRI SALMAN KHURSHEED:** Sir, I lay on the Table —

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Law and Justice (Department of Legal Affairs) Notification F.No. L/08/11/NALSA, dated the 18<sup>th</sup> August, 2011, publishing the National

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Legal Services Authority (Legal Aid Clinics) Regulations, 2011, under sub-section (1) of Section 30 of the Legal Services Authorities Act, 1987.

II. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Law and Justice (Legislative Department) Notification No. S.O. 2295 (E), dated the 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2011, publishing the Delimitation of Council Constituencies (Karnataka) Amendment Order, 2011, under sub-section (3) of Section 13 of the Representation of the People Act, 1950.

III. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the International Centre for Alternative Dispute Resolution (ICADR), New Delhi, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.

4. **SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY:** Sir, on behalf of Shri Dinsha J. Patel, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Mines Notification No. G.S.R. 778 (E), dated the 21<sup>st</sup> October, 2011, regarding reservation of an area of 140.00 hectares in North Eastern Block Range, Joga Village, Sundur Taluk, Bellary District, Karnataka for iron ore in favour of Visvesvaraya Iron and Steel Plant under Steel Authority of India Limited (SAIL), under sub-section (1) of Section 28 of the Mines and Minerals (Regulation and Development) Act, 1957.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) of Section 619A of the Companies Act, 1956:—

- (i) (a) Thirty-ninth Annual Report and Accounts of the Bharat Gold Mines Limited (BGML), Kolar, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.
- (ii) (a) Thirty-ninth Annual Report and Accounts of the Mineral Exploration Corporation Limited (MECL), Nagpur, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.
- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Hindustan Copper Limited (HCL), Kolkata, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.
- (iv) (a) Thirtieth Annual Report and Accounts of the National Aluminium Company Limited (NALCO), Bhubaneswar, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.

III. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

(a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Jawaharlal Nehru Aluminium Research Development and Design Centre (JNARDDC), Nagpur, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Centre.

5. **PROF. K.V. THOMAS:** Sir, I lay on the Table —

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Consumer Affairs), under sub-section (4) of Section 52 of the Legal Metrology Act, 2009:—

(1) G.S.R. 734 (E), dated the 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2011, publishing the Legal Metrology (Packaged Commodities) Second Amendment Rules, 2011.

(2) G.S.R. 784 (E), dated the 25<sup>th</sup> October, 2011, publishing the Legal Metrology (Packaged Commodities) Third Amendment Rules, 2011.

II. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Consumer Affairs) Notification No. G.S.R. 832 (E), dated the 24<sup>th</sup> November, 2011, publishing Corrigendum to Notification No. G.S.R. 784 (E), dated the 24<sup>th</sup> October, 2011.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

III. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Consumer Affairs) Notification No. G.S.R. 708 (E), dated the 22<sup>nd</sup> September, 2011, publishing the Consumer Protection (Third Amendment) Rules, 2011, under sub-section (1) of Section 31 of the Consumer Protection Act, 1986.

IV. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Food and Public Distribution), under sub-section (6) of Section 3 of the Essential Commodities Act, 1955:-

- (1) G.S.R. 726 (E), dated the 28<sup>th</sup> September, 2011, imposing stockholding and turnover limits on dealers of sugar and khandsari.
- (2) G.S.R. 772 (E), dated the 19<sup>th</sup> October, 2011, notifying the factory-wise fair and remunerative price of sugarcane for the sugar season 2010-11.
- (3) S.O. 2447 (E), dated the 28<sup>th</sup> October, 2011, publishing the Removal of (Licensing Requirements, Stock Limits and Movement Restrictions) on Specified Foodstuffs (Third Amendment) Order, 2011.
- (4) S.O. 2227 (E), dated the 27<sup>th</sup> September, 2011, publishing the Removal of (Licensing Requirements, Stock Limits and Movement Restrictions) on Specified Foodstuffs (Amendment) Order, 2011.

6. **SHRI CHOUDHARY MOHAN JATUA:** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers: —

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Children's Film Society, India (CFSI), Mumbai, for the year 2010-11.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.

7. **SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY:** Sir, on behalf of Shri R.P.N. Singh, I lay on the Table, under Section 40 of the Company Secretaries Act, 1980, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Corporate Affairs:—

- (1) F.No. 531/Legal/2010, dated the 23<sup>rd</sup> December, 2010, regarding election to the 11<sup>th</sup> Council of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India, along with delay statement.
- (2) ICSI (Election) No.1 of September, 2010, dated the 6<sup>th</sup> September, 2010, regarding election to the 11<sup>th</sup> Council and four Regional Councils of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India, along with delay statement.
- (3) ICSI (Election) No.2 of December, 2010, dated the 27<sup>th</sup> December, 2010, regarding election to the Southern India Regional Council of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India, along with delay statement.
- (4) ICSI No. 1 of September, 2011, dated the 1<sup>st</sup> September, 2011, regarding Establishment of the Disciplinary Directorate in the Institute of the Company Secretaries of India and posting of the Director (Discipline).
- (5) F. No. 104/31/Accts, dated the 27<sup>th</sup> September, 2011, regarding Publication of the 31<sup>st</sup> Annual Report and Audited Statement of consolidated account of the Council of the Institute of Company Secretaries of India for the year ended 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2011.



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

- (6) ICSI No. 1 of October, 2011, dated the 18<sup>th</sup> October, 2011, regarding Guidelines for Peer Review of Attestation Services by the Practising Company Secretaries.

8. **SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL:** Sir, on behalf of Shri Vincent Pala, I lay on the Table, under Section 21 of the Brahmaputra Board Act, 1980, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Brahmaputra Board, Guwahati, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Board.
- (c) Statement by Government accepting the above report.

9. **SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR:** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Sree Chitra Tirunal Institute for Medical Sciences and Technology, Thiruvananthapuram, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the International Advanced Research Centre for Powder Metallurgy and New Materials (ARCI), Hyderabad, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Birbal Sahni Institute of Palaeobotany, Lucknow, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.

10. **SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL:** Sir, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Power Notification F. No. JERC-15/2010, dated the 11<sup>th</sup> August, 2011, publishing the Joint Electricity Regulatory Commission (Distribution Code) Regulations, 2010, under sub-section (3) of Section 48 of the Electricity Act, 1949, along with delay statement.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) of Section 619A of the Companies Act, 1956:—

- (i) (a) Twenty-third Annual Report and Accounts of the THDC India Limited (formerly known as Tehri Hydro Development Corporation Limited), Tehri, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Narmada Hydroelectric Development Corporation Limited (NHDC), Bhopal, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

General of India thereon.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.
- (iii) (a) Thirty-fifth Annual Report and Accounts of the National Hydroelectric Power Corporation Limited (NHPC), Faridabad, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
  - (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.
- (iv) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Satluj Jal Vidyut Nigam Limited (SJVNL), Shimla, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
  - (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.
- (v) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Power Grid Corporation of India Limited (PGCIL), New Delhi, for the year 2010-11, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
  - (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

III. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Annual Report and Accounts of the Joint Electricity Regulatory Commission, for the State of Goa and Union Territories, for the year 2009-10.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

IV. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Power) and Rural Electrification Corporation Limited (REC), for the year 2011-12.

(Ends)

**STATEMENT RE. STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF TWO  
HUNDRED AND TWENTY-SECOND REPORT OF DEPARTMENT-  
RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON  
INDUSTRY PERTAINING TO MINISTRY OF MICRO, SMALL AND  
MEDIUM ENTERPRISES**

**THE MINISTER OF MICRO, SMALL AND MEDIUM ENTERPRISES**

**(SHRI VIRBHADRA SINGH):** Sir, I make a statement regarding Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Two Hundred and twenty-second Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Industry pertaining to the Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises.

(Ends)

**STATEMENT RE. STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF NINTH  
REPORT OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY  
STANDING COMMITTEE ON COAL AND STEEL PERTAINING TO  
MINISTRY OF MINES**

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE**

**(SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY):** Sir, on behalf of Shri Dinsha J. Patel, I

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

make a statement regarding Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Ninth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Coal and Steel pertaining to the Ministry of Mines. (Ends)

**STATEMENT RE. STATUS OF IMPLEMENTATION OF ELEVENTH  
REPORT OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY  
STANDING COMMITTEE ON FOOD, CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND  
PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION**

**THE MINISTER OF STATE (INDEPENDENT CHARGE) OF THE  
MINISTRY OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS, FOOD AND PUBLIC  
DISTRIBUTION (PROF. K.V. THOMAS):** Sir, I make a statement regarding Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Eleventh Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Food, Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution.

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, Zero Hour Mentions. Shrimati Maya Singh...(Interruptions)

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA:** I am on a point of order...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** What is the point of order in Zero Hour?

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA:** Sir, we have been talking about discrimination by this Government against the non-UPA States. Currently, an amount of Rs.8,750 crores has been announced for West Bengal...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You give a notice...(Interruptions) You give a notice for it...(Interruptions)

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA:** We have no problem in West Bengal getting all the money. But why is it that only Rs.340 crores is being given for a more backward State of Odisha? In protest against it, we walk out.

(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber.)

**MATTERS RAISED WITH THE PERMISSION OF CHAIR**

**RE: SPONSORING OF LONDON OLYMPIC GAMES 2012 BY DOW  
CHEMICALS COMPANY**

**श्रीमती माया सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश):** सर, सुनने में आया है कि 2012 में लंदन में आयोजित ओलिम्पिक के प्रायोजकों में से एक Dow Chemical Company है। अगर यह सच है तो यह एक बहुत गम्भीर बात है। जो कम्पनी देश की सबसे बड़ी क्रूरतम भोपाल गैस त्रासदी की दोषी है, वह ओलिम्पिक की प्रायोजक बने

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

और उसके बैनर तले भारत के खिलाड़ी अपने खेल का प्रदर्शन करें, यह बात ठीक नहीं है। हम इसका विरोध करते हैं। भोपाल गैस त्रासदी विश्व की क्रूरतम त्रासदियों में से एक है। इस त्रासदी से मरने वालों की संख्या की आज तक भी सही और पुख्ता जानकारी प्राप्त नहीं हो पाई है।

10/psv पर जारी

-SCH/PSV-KS/10/12.05

**श्रीमती माया सिंह (क्रमागत):** इसमें मारे गए लोगों की संख्या अलग-अलग प्रतिष्ठानों द्वारा अलग-अलग बताई जाती रही है। सर, अगर आज भी इनके परिजनों को जाकर देखें तो दिल पीड़ा की वजह से फट जाता है, उसे देखा नहीं जाता। आज भी इस त्रासदी से प्रभावितों के बच्चे अपंग पैदा हो रहे हैं, हजारों लोग अपनी आँखें गँवा चुके हैं और इस गैस-जनित बीमारी से पीड़ित होने के कारण इलाज के लिए दर-दर भटक रहे हैं।

सर, मैं आपके माध्यम से यह कहना चाहूँगी कि सबसे विचित्र बात यह है कि डाऊ केमिकल्स कम्पनी द्वारा गैस-पीड़ितों को मुआवजा 3.3 अरब मिलियन डॉलर के स्थान पर मात्र 470 मिलियन अमेरिकी डॉलर ही दिया गया है, जो नाम-मात्र का भुगतान है और मुआवजे के नाम पर गैस पीड़ितों को छला गया है। इस मुआवजे से लोग न तो अपना इलाज करा सकते हैं, न अपने घर बनवा

सकते हैं और न ही अपंग पैदा हो रही संतानों की ठीक से परवरिश ही कर सकते हैं। केन्द्र सरकार भी गैस पीड़ितों के साथ न्याय नहीं कर रही है।

उपसभापति महोदय, मध्य प्रदेश के मुख्य मंत्री जी ने अनेकों बार प्रधान मंत्री जी से और सम्बन्धित विभागों में भी गैस पीड़ित व्यक्तियों के परिवारों को न्याय दिलाने के लिए और उनके साथ समय-सीमा में उचित कार्रवाई हो, उनके परिवारों को सहायता मिले, इसके लिए अनेकों बार केन्द्र सरकार पर दबाव डाला है, आग्रह किया है तथा लिखित में पत्र भी लिखे हैं, लेकिन नतीजा सिर्फ सिफर ही रहा है। मेरी माँग है कि सरकार सदन में यह स्पष्ट करे कि लंदन में होने वाले ओलम्पिक गेम्स, 2012 के आयोजकों में यदि डाऊ केमिकल्स कम्पनी हिस्सा लेती है तो भारत के खिलाड़ी इस खेल में हिस्सा नहीं लेंगे। इसके साथ ही मैं सम्पूर्ण सदन से भी यह अपील करती हूँ, यह आग्रह करती हूँ ...(व्यवधान)... कि हम सब मिल कर केन्द्र सरकार पर यह दबाव बनाएँ ...(समय की घंटी)... ताकि इस त्रासदी से पीड़ित परिवारों को जल्द-से-जल्द न्याय मिल सके।  
धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**श्री रघुनन्दन शर्मा (मध्य प्रदेश):** महोदय, मैं इस विषय के साथ खुद को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि (उड़ीसा):** महोदय, मैं इस विषय के साथ खुद को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना (पंजाब):** महोदय, मैं इस विषय के साथ खुद को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

**डा. भारतकुमार राऊत (महाराष्ट्र):** महोदय, मैं इस विषय के साथ खुद को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Sir, we associate ourselves with what the hon. Member has mentioned.

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** All right. All are associating.

**RE. KILLING OF TWO WOMEN IN POLICE FIRING  
IN 24 PARGANAS IN WEST BENGAL**

**SHRIMATI JHARNA DAS BAIDYA (TRIPURA):** Sir, I would like to bring to the notice of the august House a terrible incident of police firing at Magrahath in South 24 Parganas District of West Bengal on 1<sup>st</sup> December, 2011, which has resulted in the death of two women and bullet injuries to eight other residents of the village.

A conflict between the villagers and the Electricity Board arose because of lack of access to electricity. The villagers had been demanding electricity for several areas. They had applied for an electricity connection and had even made the initial payments six to

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

eight months ago. The delay was causing discontent. Meanwhile, some 'hooking', that is, taking electricity connection from the existing wires illegally, was going on. The West Bengal State Electricity Board employees had gone to the village accompanied by the police to disconnect the 'hooked' electricity. Contrary to the usual practice of negotiation, persuasion and prior announcements regarding penalties for 'hooking', the police and the RAF, which appeared later, suddenly turned trigger-happy, allegedly in response to an attack from the villagers, who were, however, unarmed. 150 rounds of bullets were fired, killing two women, Saira Bibi, aged 30, and Rejina Khatun, a school-going girl of 12, and injuring at least eight others, many of whom had to be hospitalized in a critical condition. (contd. at 1p/kgg)

KGG-VNK/1p/12:10

**SHRIMATI JHARNA DAS BAIDYA (CONTD.):** Though the State Government has ordered a judicial inquiry and some compensation two days later under pressure, the response is completely inadequate. The Chief Minister has said that she was unaware of the decision to open fire, but the Home Secretary's statement to the press suggested the contrary. Hence, a full-fledged, unbiased inquiry must be

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

launched into the incident and the culprits must be identified and punished.

I appeal to the Central Government through you, Sir, to take action in the matter.

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN (WEST BENGAL):** I associate myself with the issue, Sir.

(Ends)

**RE: DATA OF DEBT OF FARMERS RELEASED BY NATIONAL  
SAMPLE SURVEY ORGANISATION**

--

**श्री प्रभात झा (मध्य प्रदेश):** उपसभापति महोदय, आज़ादी के बाद से अब तक लगातार यह कहा जाता रहा है कि भारत एक कृषि प्रधान देश है और यह भी कहा जाता रहा है कि भारत की आर्थिक रीढ़ की हड्डी यदि मजबूत करनी है, तो कृषि को मजबूत करना होगा। इसी सदन में स्वयं कृषि मंत्रालय, खाद्य प्रसंस्करण उद्योग मंत्रालय और संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय के राज्य मंत्री, श्री हरीश रावत ने कहा कि किसान परिवारों की ऋण ग्रस्तता संबंधी राष्ट्रीय नमूना सर्वेक्षण संगठन (एनएसएस) के 59वें रिपोर्ट के अनुसार देश के 8.93 किसान परिवारों में से 4.34 किसान परिवार कर्ज में डूबे हुए हैं। इसका मतलब यह है कि हर दूसरा किसान कर्ज में डूबा हुआ है और कर्ज के जो स्रोत हैं, उनमें बैंक का स्रोत 36 परसेंट है और 26 परसेंट महाजनों का है। किसानों की बदहाली की

स्थिति इतनी भयावह हो गई है कि 1995 से लेकर 2010 तक इस देश में 2 लाख 56 हजार 913 किसानों ने आत्महत्या की है। सबसे आश्चर्यजनक बात है कि जो कांग्रेस यूपीए नीत सरकार बार-बार यह कहती है कि हमने किसानों के कर्ज माफ किए हैं, लेकिन 2008 में भी लगभग 16 हजार से अधिक किसानों ने आत्महत्या की है। इतना ही नहीं, पिछले 15 वर्षों में हजारों-लाखों किसानों के घर बर्बाद हुए हैं।

2010 पर नजर डालते हैं, तो 15 हजार 974 किसानों ने आत्महत्या की है। अभी हाल ही की बात देखें, तो 30 दिनों के भीतर 107 किसानों ने आत्महत्या की है। विदर्भ के अंदर देखें, तो गत साल एक सप्ताह के अंदर 19 किसानों ने आत्महत्या की है। किसान कर्ज चुकाने के लिए अपने शरीर की किडनी और आंखें बेचने पर मजबूर हो रहे हैं। हम किस भारत में रह रहे हैं? किसको यह कहने का हक है कि हम किसानों के देश में रहते हैं और भारत एक कृषि प्रधान देश है? क्या सरकार की आंखें बंद हो गई हैं? क्या इस देश का किसान कर्ज चुकता करने के लिए किडनी बेचेगा? क्या इस देश का किसान कर्ज चुकाने के लिए अपनी आंखें बेचेगा? क्या इस देश का किसान कर्ज चुकाने के लिए अपने-अपने छोटे बच्चों के शरीर को बेचेगा? आज इस देश में किसानों की यह बदहाली हो रही है और इसके बावजूद यह दावा किया जाता है कि यह देश किसानों का है, कृषि प्रधान देश है! किसानों के 72 हजार करोड़ रुपए के कर्ज माफ कर दिए गए, ये बेबुनियाद बातें करके किसानों को धोखा दिया जाता है।

भारत की आत्मा गांवों में बसती है और उस आत्मा के साथ खिलवाड़ किया जाता है।

उपसभापति महोदय, आज हर दूसरा किसान ऋण से परेशान है और वह कर्ज में डूबा हुआ है, इसलिए मैं चाहता हूँ कि उसके इस मर्ज का इलाज होना चाहिए। अगर ये आत्महत्याओं का सिलसिला जारी रहा, तो इस सरकार के काल में यह कहने का हक नहीं होगा कि भारत एक कृषि प्रधान देश है और हमारी कृषि आधारित अर्थव्यवस्था है। यह पूरी मांग आपके सामने रखी गई है। मेरी मांग यह है कि भारत का किसान किडनी बेचने पर विवश न हो, यह देखना होगा। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**श्रीमती माया सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश):** महोदय, मैं स्वयं को इस विषय से संबद्ध करती हूँ।

**श्री वीर पाल सिंह यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश):** महोदय, मैं स्वयं को इस विषय से संबद्ध करता हूँ।

**श्री श्रीगोपाल व्यास (छत्तीसगढ़):** महोदय, मैं स्वयं को इस विषय से संबद्ध करता हूँ।

**श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना (पंजाब):** महोदय, मैं स्वयं को इस विषय से संबद्ध करता हूँ।

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि (उड़ीसा):** महोदय, मैं स्वयं को इस विषय से संबद्ध करता हूँ।

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN (WEST BENGAL):** I associate myself with the issue, Sir.

...(Interruption)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Yes, all of you are associated with this subject.

(Ends)

**RE: SITUATION ARISING DUE TO ATTACK ON SOCIAL ACTIVISTS  
IN DIFFERENT PARTS OF COUNTRY WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE  
TO PAKUR DISTRICT OF JHARKHAND**

--

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I rise to say that social activists of our country are not safe. Frequently, the incidents of attack on social activists are going on, they are even murdered. In the last Session also I had raised about an incident that had happened in Bhopal, in the case of Shehla Masood.

With a heavy heart, I am again raising one more issue which has happened on 15<sup>th</sup> November, in Jharkhand. Sister Valsa John, a nun-cum-activist was murdered in Pakur district of Jharkhand, which is

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

very much adjacent to my district, Murshidabad, in West Bengal. She came out in support of the people who live in that area opposing the displacement of local residents due to the Panem Coal Mining Company in 2001.

(Contd. by tdb/1q)

TDB-DS/1Q/12.15

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN (CONTD.):** She was very much respected among the tribal people also. Sir, she was also posing a threat to the Maoists, who saw her as a stumbling block in spreading their activities in the area. Sir, with your permission, I would like to make one quotation here. “Corporate intervention with ‘mafia’ has become an inherent part of the neo-liberal market thrust in the name of development”. Actually, Sir, it is happening there. Not only there, it is happening in different States like Chhattisgarh, Madhya Pradesh, etc. In those areas where mining is taking place, these types of occurrences are going on. I have already referred to Shehla Masood case of Bhopal. I want to know from the Government as to what is the protection for social activists, whether working or non-working. Are we in a position to ban them? I urge upon the Government that if you

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

are not in a position to protect these social activists, then, the whole country will raise its voice against the activities of the Government machinery, I mean, those who are not working properly. I have come to know that seven people have been arrested. But, after one day or two days, they will be released. What is happening is, people are not getting justice. In that particular area, people are not getting justice from the General Administration and Police Administration. If it is not curbed, then, these things will happen several times, and mafia raj will establish in the country. (Time bell) So, Sir, I would like to request the Government to protect the common people of this country.

(Ends)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (JHARKHAND):** Sir, I associate myself with this issue.

**DR. M.S. GILL (PUNJAB):** Sir, I also associate myself with it.

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I also associate myself with this subject.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Yes, all of you associate yourselves with it.

**SHRI RAJEEV CHANDRASEKHAR (KARNATAKA):** Sir, I also associate myself with it.



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**MS. MABEL REBELLO (JHARKHAND):** Sir, I also associate myself with it. (Ends)

**RE: GOVERNMENT'S PROPOSED MOVE TO REDUCE  
THE INTEREST RATE ON EPF**

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I want to draw your attention and also the attention of the House to the most retrograde move of the Government at the Centre to drastically slash down the interest rate on employees Provident Fund from 9.5 per cent as prevalent in 2010-2011 to 8.25 per cent for the year 2011-12.

Sir, the Government in a most cunning manner has scheduled the meeting of the Finance Investment Committee of Central Board of Trustees of Employees Provident Fund Organisation just after the close of Winter Session, obviously, to avoid the matter to surface in Parliament. Sir, my question is, why the lifetime savings of the workers in the Provident Fund are targeted to be made the sacrificial goat for effecting interest cut.

**(THE VICE-CHAIRMAN, DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN in  
the Chair.)**

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

When during the span of last one year, the interest rates of banks and financial institutions are continuously rising to higher and higher plateau through the direct intervention of the RBI and the Government of India, may be, for addressing the inflationary situation, why the same Government is forcing a reduction on the interest rate on workers' Provident Fund, which is at the disposal of the Government?

Sir, unlike other deposits including term-deposits, fixed deposits in banks and financial institutions, the Provident Fund of the workers is a social security fund, which is a longest term recurring fixed deposit and this Fund remains with the Government continuously for long twenty-five to thirty years. This Fund deserves a much higher rate of interest than the usual fixed deposits with the banks and financial institutions. Moreover, this Fund deserves an assured higher rate of return because it is a social security fund for five crore workers in the organised services who produce value for the economy, revenue for the exchequer and also profit for the employers. But just the opposite thing is being done. The workers who are already suffering from serious exploitation due to price-rise, labour law violations, etc., another cut on their lifetime savings, their own money, is being

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

imposed. I reiterate that in view of the continuing price rise being promoted by the Government, and continuing increase in the interest rate, which is again being promoted by the Government, the reduction in the interest rate of the workers' Provident Fund is unjust and is being opposed by the working class. I request the whole House to please join me in urging upon the Government to ensure that the interest rate on the Provident Fund is not slashed down from its present level. I demand a clear assurance from the Government in this regard against this unjust, unwarranted cut on interest rate of workers' own money, which is at the disposal of the Government for free use by it. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (JHARKHAND):** Sir, I also associate myself with this subject.

**SHRI RUDRA NARAYAN PANY (ODISHA):** Sir, I also associate myself with it.

**SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I also associate myself with it.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**DR. BARUN MUKHERJI (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I also associate myself with this subject.

**SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL (KERALA):** Sir, I also associate myself with it.

**DR. T.N. SEEMA (KERALA):** Sir, I also associate myself with it.

**SHRIMATI JHARNA DAS BAIDYA (TRIPURA):** Sir, I also associate myself with it.

**SHRI RAJEEV CHANDRASEKHAR (KARNATAKA):** Sir, I also associate myself with this subject. (Ends)

(Followed by 1r-klS)

1R/KLS-HMS/12.20

**RE: KILLING OF FOUR HINDU DOCTORS AND THREE  
SHOPKEEPERS IN PAKISTAN**

**श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना (पंजाब) :** सर, मैं इस zero hour में पिछले दिनों पाकिस्तान में चार हिंदू डॉक्टरों को गोलियों से मार दिए जाने की घटना की ओर आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ। उस के बाद तीन दुकानदारों जिन्होंने वहाँ जजिया देने से इंकार कर दिया था, उन को गोलियों से उड़ा दिया गया। सर, दुख इस बात का है कि ये लोग जोकि पाकिस्तान में minorities हैं, वे भारत की तरफ देखते हैं कि शायद भारत सरकार या भारत के लोग उन के प्रति सहानुभूतिपूर्ण प्रतिक्रिया दें, लेकिन आज तक सरकार की तरफ से एक शब्द भी

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

उन के बारे में पाकिस्तान सरकार को नहीं कहा गया है। मैंने इन घटनाओं के बारे में माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी व उस के बाद माननीय विदेश मंत्री जी को पत्र लिखे और न्यूज आयटम साथ भेजी थी। वहां से सिर्फ एक बात बतायी गयी कि हम ने वहां की सरकार से बात कर ली है और minorities का ध्यान रखना वहां की सरकार की जिम्मेदारी है। इस के सिवाय हमें कोई आश्वासन नहीं मिला।

सर, अभी हाल में Pakistan Human Rights Commission की एक रिपोर्ट छपी है। उस रिपोर्ट में किस तरह से वहां minorities के ऊपर अत्याचार हो रहे हैं, उन सारी बातों का पूरा विवरण दिया गया है। सर, वहां पर उन minorities का, जिन में हिंदू हैं, सिख हैं, क्रिश्चियंस हैं - उन सब का पाकिस्तान में यह हाल है कि न वे अच्छी तरह जी सकते हैं और न मर सकते हैं। वहां पर उनकी प्रॉपर्टी और लाइफ सुरक्षित नहीं है। आज भारत में पंजाब के चार जगहों - अमृतसर, जालंधर, राजपुरा और खन्ना में बहुत से हिंदू परिवार बैठे हैं और अपनी सरकार से request कर रहे हैं कि हम वहां नहीं जाएंगे। आप हमें या तो जेल दे दो या यहां की नागरिकता दे दो। सर, अभी हाल में दिल्ली में 27-28 परिवार मजनुं का टीला में बैठे हुए हैं। उन का वीजा पीरियड खत्म हो गया है, लेकिन उन को संरक्षण देने के बजाय, उन की बात सुनने की बजाय, उन की सहायता करने की बजाय बार-बार पुलिस व Intelligence के लोग उन के पास जाकर उन्हें धमकाते हैं कि आप का वीजा खत्म हो गया है और आप वापिस पाकिस्तान जाओ। उन लोगों ने कहा है कि हम पाकिस्तान नहीं जा सकते। हम

जेल जा सकते हैं, लेकिन पाकिस्तान नहीं जा सकते। सर, जब पाकिस्तान बना, उस समय का data compare किया जाए तो दिन प्रति दिन वहां पर minorities की संख्या कम हो रही है। वह 33 परसेंट से अब 2 परसेंट रह गयी है। उस का कारण वहां पर उन minorities पर हो रहे अत्याचार हैं। अगर उन का बच्चा वहां किसी मेडिकल कॉलेज में एडमिशन ले लेता है, तो उस से फिरौती ली जाती है। उस बच्चे को kidnap किया जाता है। बाद में वह बच्चा भी मार दिया जाता है और पैसे भी ले लिए जाते हैं।

सर, ऐसी घटनाएं वहां पर बार-बार हो रही हैं। मैं केन्द्र सरकार से और अपने साथियों से आग्रह करता हूं कि भविष्य में कोई भी ऐसी घटना हो तो सारा देश उन के साथ खड़ा हो। सर, विश्व में Human rights के ऊपर जो लोग काम करते हैं, उन्होंने एक भी आवाज वहां के minorities के बारे में नहीं उठायी है। इस का कारण यह है कि हमारे देश से आवाज नहीं उठायी जाती। इसलिए मैं सदन से दरखास्त करता हूं कि हम एक आवाज में उन पीड़ित लोगों का साथ दें।

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि (उड़ीसा) :** महोदय, मैं श्री खन्ना के उल्लेख का समर्थन करता हूं।

**श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर (महाराष्ट्र) :** महोदय, मैं भी श्री खन्ना के उल्लेख का समर्थन करता हूं।

**श्री राजीव प्रताप रूडी (बिहार) :** मैं श्री खन्ना के उल्लेख का समर्थन करता हूं।

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**श्रीमती माया सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश) :** महोदय, मैं श्री खन्ना के उल्लेख का समर्थन करती हूँ।

**श्री नारायण सिंह केसरी (मध्य प्रदेश) :** मैं भी श्री खन्ना के उल्लेख का समर्थन करता हूँ।

**डा० भारतकुमार राऊत (महाराष्ट्र) :** सर, मैं भी श्री खन्ना के उल्लेख का समर्थन करता हूँ।

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (JHARKHAND):** Sir, the Government should take note of this and talk to the Pakistani authorities. They are time and again taking benefit of claiming in the General Assembly of the United Nations that they are giving full protection to the minorities whereas the situation is different. Minorities are not safe in Pakistan. When they are forced to come to India to take shelter for their security and the security of their family members, our Government, the Government of India, is not extending their visas and is also not considering the issue of giving them Indian citizenship. This is very unfortunate. Sir, through you, I would like to demand from the Government that either it should consider their cases for extending

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

their visas till normalcy is restored there or they should be adopted as Indian citizens. ... (Interruptions)..

**SHRIMATI VIPLOVE THAKUR (HIMACHAL PRADESH):** Sir, I associate myself with this submission.

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** We also associate ourselves with this Zero Hour submission.

(1 एस/एनबी पर जारी)

SSS-NB/1S/12.25

**THE MINISTER OF STATISTICS AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION (DR. M. S. GILL):** Sir, this is a very serious matter and I have also been following it closely. This is not the first incident that Mr. Khanna has alluded to. There were regular incidents continuously over the past and they happened in Sind, particularly where there is a reasonably large Hindu population. They have happened recently to Sikhs in the Frontier province and *Jazia*, punishments, every kind of threats are there. Sir, I do wish to request that our Government and Foreign Minister must press this a little more strongly.

(Ends)



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**RE : ALLEGATION OF CORRUPTION IN THE CONDUCT OF CIVIL SERVICES EXAMINATION**

**SHRI SANJAY RAUT (MAHARASHTRA):** Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I want to raise a very important issue, with your permission, concerning the candidates appearing for the Civil Services Examination. As the august House knows, the Union Public Service Commission conducts Civil Services Examination every year. Our fellowmen in the country have great trust and confidence in the way the UPSC conducts the exam. But the candidates who have appeared for the exam have recently approached the judiciary and the RTI Commissioner for making the exam more transparent and accountable. Sir, I have come across this news in the print media recently that there had been some allegations of corruption in the conduct of the civil services exam. Some serious fears have been raised by the candidates over the manner in which bogus roll numbers were allotted. But the UPSC never bothered to inquire into the matter. This allegation has created unrest among the candidates. Complaints have been pouring in from different States over the matter. Sir, the Supreme Court also gave a direction to the UPSC to furnish corrected answer sheets to the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

candidates on demand. But they have refused to comply with it. In order to create confidence in the minds of students on the functioning of the UPSC, there is a need to allay the fears of students by the Government and at the same time, I urge upon the Government to intervene and direct the UPSC to be more transparent and accountable. Thank you.

(Ends)

**RE: REPORTED FIRING IN A RALLY IN MANIPUR**

**श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर (महाराष्ट्र) :** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, हमारे सदन की बहुत वरिष्ठ सदस्या, जो 30 सालों तक इस हाउस की सदस्या रहीं और जो 17 सालों तक डिप्टी चेयरमैन रहीं, नजमा हेपतुल्ला की सभा पर कल मणिपुर में जानलेवा हमला हुआ। मैं सदन के सामने यह बहुत ही गंभीर मामला उठाना चाहता हूं। यह दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण बात है कि नॉर्थ ईस्ट के सारे पेपर्स में और टी.वी. पर इसकी बहुत चर्चा हुई और खबरें दिखाई, लेकिन नेशनल न्यूज़ में TRP का मुद्दा न होने के कारण यह खबर यहां नहीं चलती है। थोउबल कांस्टीट्यूएंसी में मोइजिंग गांव है, जो मुस्लिम आबादी का गांव है। वहां हमारी बहुत सक्षम कार्यकर्ता इंदिरा ओइनाम हैं, जो वहां सबसे बड़ी NGO चलाती हैं, सबसे ज्यादा employment provide करती हैं, उनके लिए एक रैली थी, जिसमें नजमा जी गई थीं। सत्तारूढ़ दल के कुछ गुंडों और मिलिटेंट्स ने उनकी रैली पर जबर्दस्त हमला किया। वे

हथियारों से लैस थे। उन्होंने 17 वाहन तोड़े, लाउडस्पीकर्स से सभा को डिस्टर्ब करने की कोशिश की और सभा पर हमला बोला। दुर्भाग्य से पुलिस चुप रही, क्योंकि उस कांस्टीबल से जो चुनकर आए हैं, वे सी.एम. भी हैं और एच.एम. भी हैं। वहां की पुलिस चुप रही। अगर एस्कॉर्ट पार्टी न होती, अगर वह हरकत में न आती, अगर उन्होंने कार्यवाही न की होती, तो क्या होता? उन्होंने 100 राउंड्स फायर किए, तब जाकर परिस्थिति हाथ में आई, अन्यथा हमें वहां से बुरा समाचार ही मिलता। यह बहुत गंभीर घटना हुई है। इस गोलीबारी में एस्कॉर्ट पार्टी का एक इंस्पैक्टर जख्मी हुआ है, जो वाहन तोड़े गए हैं, उनके ड्राइवर्स भी जख्मी हुए हैं, लेकिन उन लोगों ने सभा पर हमला होने से रोकने की कोशिश की। यह केवल इतना सा मुद्दा नहीं है कि हमारी पार्टी की चुनाव सभा को डिस्टर्ब करने की कोशिश की गई है। वहां चुनाव होने वाले हैं। वहां मिलिटेंसी है और 36 underground militant outfits हैं। ये सब मिलकर सत्तारूढ़ दल के आशीर्वाद से पूरा चुनाव ही दहशत में कराना चाहते हैं, ताकि कोई खड़ा न रहे और अपोज न करे।

(1T/MP पर क्रमशः)

**श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर (क्रमागत) :** इस तरह का माहौल तैयार करने की कल एक तरह से शुरुआत हुई है, इसलिए केंद्र सरकार का यह दायित्व बनता है कि वह देखे कि चुनाव ठीक से होंगे या नहीं। लोकतंत्र के लिए यह एक बहुत गंभीर घटना है। अभी मैंने वहां बात की तो पता चला कि आज सुबह भी वहां बम की धमकी दी गई है कि बम फेंके जाएंगे। तो माहौल इतना खराब हो गया है। हम तो पहले से मांग कर रहे हैं कि वहां अगर निष्पक्ष चुनाव चाहिए, तो वह राष्ट्रपति शासन में ही हो सकता है। जो लोग militants से मिले हुए हैं, अगर ऐसे लोगों के हाथ में सत्ता रहती है तो वहां चुनाव ठीक नहीं होंगे। कल नजमा जी की सभा पर जो हमला हुआ है और एक जानलेवा हमले की कोशिश हुई है, तो इसकी हम भर्त्सना भी करते हैं और इसकी तुरंत सी.बी.आई. से जांच की मांग करते हैं।

(समाप्त)

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि (उड़ीसा) :** सर, मैं इस मुद्दे के साथ एसोसिएट करता हूं।

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद (बिहार) :** महोदय, मैं भी इस विषय के साथ स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूं।

**श्री अविनाश राय खन्ना (पंजाब) :** सर, मैं भी इस विषय के साथ एसोसिएट करता हूं।

**श्री अनिल माधव दवे (मध्य प्रदेश) :** महोदय, मैं भी इस विषय के साथ स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूं।

(समाप्त)

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (JHARKHAND):** Sir, while associating with my colleague, Shri Javadekar, on Manipur issue, I would like to say that Congress is the only national party there. The other political parties are regional parties. But, we found that they do not allow any other national party to enter into the North-Eastern region, especially to Manipur.

**THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SMT. AMBIKA SONI):** Sir, has the Chairman given permission to Mr. Ahluwalia to make a commentary on every Zero Hour? ... (Interruptions)... He is speaking after every Zero Hour!

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि :** वे लीडर हैं, इसलिए उठाएंगे। ... (व्यवधान)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):** He is given respect only as a Deputy Leader of the House ... (Interruptions)... Please sit down... (Interruptions)... Your leader is speaking, why are you disturbing him? ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, the point is, they are waiting for the reply from the Government. If the Government has to say anything on this, it can say so.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):**

Please, Mr. Ahluwaliaji...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, while associating myself with this, I would like to submit that this is an area where the meeting was taking place. It is a minority-dominated area; Muslim-dominated area. But, unfortunately, no protection was given. Sir, hundred rounds of bullets fired. The police, personal security and drivers were injured ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI AMBIKA SONI:** Sir, I am sorry. Why is he speaking on every Zero Hour?... (Interruptions)... He does not have the right ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** So, I demand that that if the Congress Party wants free and fair election and fair competition, it should allow other national parties to enter into Manipur... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Those points have already been covered by your colleague ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** ...so that we can bring normalcy in Manipur. Thank you.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN(DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):** We will go to the next item of business ...(Interruptions)...Now, we will take up the Legislative Business.

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि :** सर, मेरा भी एसोसिएशन था ... मुझे एसोसिएट करना था।

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please sit down...(Interruptions)...Please sit down ...(Interruptions)...Nothing will go on record ...(Interruptions)...Now, we will take up the Chartered Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010, the Cost and Works Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010, and the Company Secretaries (Amendment) Bill, 2010, together...(Interruptions)...I request the Minister to move the Bills...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI RUDRA NARAYAN PANY: \***

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** No, no. It is not there in the list ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI RUDRA NARAYAN PANY: \***

---

\*Not recorded.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):** You have already associated with that ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI RUDRA NARAYAN PANY: \***

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, shall I move the Bills? ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि : \***

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Yes, yes...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI RUDRA NARAYAN PANY:** Sir, in protest, I am walking out of the House...(Interruptions)...

*(At this stage, the hon. Member left the Chamber)*

**THE CHARTERED ACCOUNTANTS (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2010.**

**AND**

**THE COST AND WORKS ACCOUNTANTS (AMENDMENT)  
BILL, 2010**

**AND**

**THE COMPANY SECRETARIES (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2010.**

**THE MINISTER OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY):** Sir, I beg to move:

That the Bill further to amend the Chartered Accountants Act, 1949, be taken into consideration.

---

\*Not recorded.



Sir, I also move:

That the Bill further to amend the Cost and Works Accountants Act, 1959, be taken into consideration.

Sir, I also move:

That the Bill further to amend the Company Secretaries Act, 1980, be taken into consideration.

Sir, all the three Bills, I hope, will be taken up together for consideration. Ultimately, it is only to amend Sub-Section (2) of Section (2) of all the three Acts.

These are all professional institutes. In fact, in the year 2008, the Limited Liability Partnership Act, was enacted. So, this is an enabling clause for the entities to get the legal status which will combine the flexibility of a partnership with the benefits of limited liability enjoyed by company.

With the services sector in the country growing in a vibrant way and we are creating niche out of it for ourselves, particularly in the services sector, there is a need to provide space with an increasingly

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

significant role in the Indian economy and the high quality of professionals to respond to the global aspirations.

(CONTD. BY USY "1U")

-NBR-USY/SC/1U/12.35

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY (CONTD.):** This is how all these ideas had been mooted as far back as 2002 when Naresh Chandra Committee gave its report. The Bill is very simple. It is only for the incorporation of this amendment. But, at the same time, this is going to create a magnificent role to be played by all the services under these three professional institutes. I would like the House to appreciate the significant move by providing a greater and rapid space for these three professional institutes.

(Ends)

*The questions were proposed.*

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):** Motions for consideration of the Chartered Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010; The Cost and Works Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010; and the Company Secretaries (Amendment) Bill, 2010, are now open for discussion.

Now, I request Shri S.S. Ahluwalia to make his observations.

**श्री एस.एस.अहलुवालिया (झारखंड) :** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं The Chartered Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010; The Cost and Works Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010; and The Company Secretaries (Amendment) Bill, 2010 का समर्थन करने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ। महोदय, समर्थन करने के साथ-साथ बहुत सारे कन्सर्न हैं, जिनके संबंध में मैं सरकार को अवगत कराना चाहता हूँ। जब 2001 में एनरॉन घोटाला हुआ और उसके साथ-साथ अमेरिका में वर्ल्डकॉम क्वेस्ट और ग्लोबल क्रॉसिंग, इन बड़ी-बड़ी कम्पनियों में घोटाले हुए, जिसमें चार्टर्ड अकाउंटेंट की कम्पनियां या उनके फाइनेंशियल कन्सल्टेंट्स इन्वॉल्व थे, उनमें ये घटनाएं घटीं, उस वक्त सारी दुनिया में रिफॉर्म का दौर शुरू हुआ और उसको मद्देनज़र रखते हुए भारत सरकार ने भी 21 अगस्त 2002 को, डिपार्टमेंट ऑफ कम्पनी अफेयर्स ने श्री नरेश चन्द्रा के नेतृत्व में एक हाई लैवल कमेटी बैठाई। नरेश चन्द्रा कमेटी ने बहुत सारे रिकमेंडेशंस दिए। उन रिकमेंडेशंस के आधार पर आगे जे.जे.ईरानी कमेटी, श्राॅफ कमेटी - ये सब कमेटियां बैठीं और हमारा जो 1956 का कम्पनीज़ एक्ट है, उसको परिवर्तित करने के लिए सोचा गया। वह विधेयक यहां पर इंट्रोड्यूज़ किया गया, स्टैंडिंग कमेटी में गया, स्टैंडिंग कमेटी ने अपनी रिपोर्ट सब्मिट की। इसी बीच हमने महसूस किया कि कम्पनीज़ एक्ट में कई प्रावधान हैं, एक लिमिटेड कम्पनी है, एक लिस्टेड कम्पनी है, एक पब्लिक लिमिटेड कम्पनी है,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

एक प्राइवेट लिमिटेड कम्पनी है और उसके बाद पार्टनरशिप कम्पनी और प्रोपराइटरशिप कम्पनी है। लेकिन पार्टनरशिप कम्पनी का ऐक्ट बहुत पुराना है और अगर विदेशी पार्टनर रखना होता है तो उसके बारे में बहुत सारी बाधाएं आती हैं। प्रोपराइटरशिप कम्पनी आहिस्ता-आहिस्ता हमारे मुल्क में कम होती गयी क्योंकि जैसे जैसे टैक्स के, डिसक्लोज़र्स के और रिटर्न्स के रिफॉर्म्स आए, वैसे-वैसे प्रोपराइटरशिप वाली कम्पनी की जिम्मेदारी एक आदमी के ऊपर पड़ने लगी, हमारे यहां जो ज्वाइंट फैमिली कॉन्सेप्ट था, वह खत्म होने लगा। तब यह जो नया कॉन्सेप्ट है, Limited Liability Partnership Company, इसको 2008 में हमने एक नया आयाम दिया और वह विधेयक 2008 में पास हुआ जो 2009 में नोटिफाई हुआ। किन्तु हमने पाया कि जो रोल कम्पनी सेक्रेटरी का है, Section 383(A) of Companies Act, 1956...

(1डब्ल्यू-एमसीएम पर क्रमशः)

MCM-PK/1W/12-40

**श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया (क्रमागत) :** जिस कम्पनी का पेडअप शेयर केपिटल दो करोड़ या उससे ज्यादा है, वहां पर कम्पलसरी है कि एक कम्पनी सेक्रेटरी होना चाहिए। वैसे भी सेक्शन -233(बी) और 209(1डी) के तहत कॉस्ट एकाउंटेंट होने चाहिए, क्योंकि जब हम डिविडेंड देते हैं, जब हम प्रॉफिट लॉस की बात करते हैं तो उसका सर्टिफिकेशन, किसको कितना प्रॉफिट हुआ, कॉस्ट ऑफ प्रोडक्शन क्या था और अल्टीमेटली उसको कितनी प्राइस पर सेल

किया, इन सारी चीजों पर विचार करने के लिए भी कॉस्ट एंड वर्क्स एकाउंटेंट की जरूरत पड़ती है। इसका भी प्रावधान कम्पनी ऐक्ट में है। उसी कम्पनी ऐक्ट में सैक्शन -224(1) के तहत एक चार्टर्ड एकाउंटेंट का सर्टिफिकेट चाहिए, किसी भी रिटर्न को फाइल करने के लिए। अभी पिछले दिनों एम0सी0ए0 ने इन्हीं रिफॉर्म्स को मद्देनजर रखते हुए एक सक्क्यूलर जारी किया, जहां पर उन्होंने कहा कि ICSI, ICWAI or ICAI अर्थात चार्टर्ड एकाउंटेंट, कम्पनी सैक्रेटरी और कॉस्ट एंड वर्क्स एकाउंटेंट, ये अगर किसी चीज को सर्टिफाई करते हैं ऑनलाइन के लिए डिजिटल रिटर्न फाइल करने के लिए, तो मान्य होगा। महोदय, जब हमने महसूस किया कि आज लिमिटेड लॉइब्लिटी पार्टनरशिप कम्पनी, इसमें भी एलाउ की जाए कि इसमें एक चार्टर्ड एकाउंटेंट अपने साथ कम्पनी सैक्रेटरी को भी इंवोल्व कर ले और एक कॉस्ट एंड वर्क्स को भी इंवोल्व कर ले, लेकिन आज तक वह सम्भव नहीं है। किन्तु आज यह लिमिटेड लॉइब्लिटी पार्टनरशिप फर्म बनने से, एल0एल0पी0 कम्पनी बनने से यह सम्भव हो सकेगा। सिर्फ भारत के लिए नहीं, विदेश का कोई चार्टर्ड एकाउंटेंट या फाइनेंशियल कंसलटेंट अगर हमारे ICSI, ICWAI or ICAI के तहत रजिस्टर्ड हो सकता है तो वैसे लोग भी हमारे साथ कंसलटेंट बन सकेंगे। यह एक अच्छी पहल है और हमारे लोग भी बाहर जा सकेंगे, क्योंकि हमने देखा कि खास करके कॉस्ट एंड वर्क्स वालों को बहुत असुविधा हुई, जब वे चार्टर्ड इंस्टीट्यूट ऑफ मेनेजमेंट एकाउंटेंट्स, CIMA लंदन के साथ अपना एग्रीमेंट करने जा रहे थे, तो

उन्होंने कहा कि हम वर्क्स एकाउंटेंट का मतलब नहीं समझ रहे हैं। What is the meaning of Works Accountant?

महोदय, कॉस्ट एकाउंटेंट एंड वर्क्स एकाउंटेंट का कंसेप्ट हमारे देश में तब आया, जब हमारे यहां पब्लिक सैक्टर इंडस्ट्री का दौर हुआ, जहां टाइम एंड मोशन डिपार्टमेंट एक वर्क की लेबर, कितने ऑवर्स, किस चीज को प्रोड्यूस करने के लिए कितना समय लगता है, ताकि हम अल्टीमेट फिनिश प्रोडक्ट को या कॉस्ट को एनालाइज कर सकें और तब हम उसकी प्राइस फिक्स कर सकें, इन सारी चीजों को मद्देनजर रखकर किया गया था। किन्तु आहिस्ता-आहिस्ता डिस-इंवेस्टमेंट होने के बाद इनका ICWAI वालों का काम भी बंद हो गया। इनको अब नए रास्ते ढूंढने की जरूरत थी। जो CIMA लंदन है, उसके साथ और दूसरे देशों, अर्थात् बंगला के हमारे पड़ोसी मुल्क बंगला देश, पाकिस्तान और श्रीलंका ने अपने विधेयकों में संशोधन करके, अपने कानूनों में संशोधन करके उनकी मेंबरशिप ली है। किन्तु हमारे यहां से पास किए हुए बच्चे वहां जाकर काम नहीं कर सकते या उनकी कम्पनी के लिए काम नहीं कर सकते। तो इसलिए यह जरूरी था कि हम एक ऐसा संशोधन लाएं और लाकर उनको भी पार्टनर बना सकें या उनकी मान्यता ले सकें, उनकी मेंबरशिप ले सकें, उनसे एफिलिएट हो सकें और हम अपना कार्य आगे कर सकें। महोदय, इन्ही चीजों को मद्देनजर रखा गया, किन्तु जो सबसे बड़ा कंसर्न है, वह खतरा है और महोदय आप अच्छी तरह से जानते होंगे कि पिछले दिनों सत्यम घोटाला हुआ,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

और सत्यम घोटाला में प्राइस वाटर हाउस और यही प्राइस वाटर हाउस ग्लोबल ट्रस्ट बैंक में भी जब केतन पारिख का स्केम हुआ, उसमें भी जो उनके फाइनेंशियल एडवाइजर थे, जिनके सर्टिफिकेट पर उनके आई0टी0ओ0 में दस्तखत होते हैं, प्राइस वाटर हाउस के बारे में, वे इंवॉल्वड थे।

(1X/gs पर क्रमशः)

PK-GS/12.45/1X/

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया (क्रमागत):** फिर सत्यम कम्प्यूटर और Price Ernst & Young Maytas का केस हुआ। Satyam और Maytas के बारे में, मुझे बड़ा आश्चर्य होता है कि Satyam को आप उलटा करके लिख दें, तो वह Maytas बन जाता है, परन्तु हमारे किसी आर.ओ.सी. वाले को नहीं समझ आया कि यह इसी की एक शेल कम्पनी है, जो यह दूसरे नाम से चला रही है, एक Satyam है और एक Maytas है, दोनों कम्पनी एक ही हैं और एक ही परिवार की हैं। दोनों में दो चार्टर्ड अकाउंटेंट फर्म्स, एक Price Waterhouse और दूसरी Ernst and Young इन्वाल्ड थी। यहां तक कि Price Waterhouse को सत्यम कम्प्यूटर में ICAI Disciplinary Committee ने काफी प्रोसिडिंग करने की कोशिश की, परन्तु जो इनके इंडियन पार्टनर थे, इंडियन चार्टर्ड एकाउंटेंट थे, उन्हीं के खिलाफ कार्यवाही हो सकी, कम्पनी के खिलाफ कार्यवाही नहीं हो सकी। परन्तु यह जो LLP आ रहा है, इस LLP के माध्यम से प्राइस वाटर, Ernst and

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Young, McKenzie, KPMG ये सारे पार्टनर बन जायेंगे। LLP के माध्यम से ये मालिक बन जायेंगे, हिस्सेदार बन जायेंगे, इसके लिए precautionary measures सरकार क्या लेगी ? आज हमारे कानून में ऐसा कोई प्रावधान नहीं है कि जिसके कारण, अभी जैसे, “The Institute has asked the Ministry of Corporate Affairs, Government of India to grant additional power so that they may proceed against firms whose partners or employees are frequent offenders.”

कम्पनियां ये ही हैं, किन्तु उनका जो एम्पलाई यहां पर चार्टर्ड अकाउंटेंट रजिस्टर्ड है या जो कम्पनी सेक्रेटरी यहां पर रजिस्टर्ड है, उसके खिलाफ तो कार्यवाही हो जाती है, लेकिन जो विदेश में रजिस्टर्ड है, उसके खिलाफ कार्यवाही नहीं होती या कम्पनी के खिलाफ कार्यवाही नहीं होती है। ये कम्पनियां इस रूट से पार्टनर बन जायेंगी, मालिकाना हक प्राप्त कर लेंगी। हमें सोचना पड़ेगा कि एक तरफ तो हम ये बेनिफिट यहां के चार्टर्ड अकाउंटेंट को, यहां के लोगों को दे रहे हैं कि बाहर जाकर, दूसरे मुल्कों में जाकर एल.एल.पी. में हिस्सेदारी कर सकें और लिमिटेड लायबिलिटी पार्टनरशिप कर सकें और वहां के लोग यहां आ सकें। जब भी कोई फॉरेन डायरेक्ट इन्वेस्टमेंट आता है या एफआईआई आती है, तो वह अपने साथ अपने फाइनेंशियल कंसल्टेंट को लाना चाहती है, परन्तु हमारे यहां इसके लिए प्रावधान नहीं है। यह बड़े आश्चर्य की बात है कि कभी हम नोटिफिकेशन पढ़ते हैं कि हमने Chartered Accountant



Firms of Mauritius को अलाऊ किया हुआ है। अब मॉरीशस के बारे में, Mauritius overseas corporate bodies के बारे में, इस सदन में कई बार चर्चा हुई, स्कैम में चर्चा हुई कि वहां शेल कम्पनियां हैं और मुझे नहीं लगता है कि मॉरीशस में कोई चार्टर्ड अकाउंटेंट इंस्टीट्यूशन है, जहां से लोग पास करके अच्छे और भले चार्टर्ड अकाउंटेंट बन रहे हैं। इस रूट से भी लोग आयेंगे। इसके बारे में सरकार कितनी संवेदनशील है, कितनी जागरूक है और उस पर क्या अंकुश लगाने जा रही है, उसके बारे में अगर सरकार सदन को बतायेगी, तो कृपा होगी।

महोदय, यह बहुत लिमिटेड बिल है। इसमें मांग जरूर की गई थी कि Cost and Works Accountant का नाम Cost and Management Accountant कर दिया जाए। इस पर बहुत चर्चा हुई और हम लोगों ने इसके बारे में बार-बार जानने की कोशिश की। हमें पूरी दुनिया में अकाउंटेंट या चार्टर्ड अकाउंटेंट की डेफिनेशन तो मिल जाती है, हमें फाइनेंशियल अकाउंटेंट की डेफिनेशन और नाम तो मिल जाता है, लेकिन मैनेजमेंट अकाउंटेंट की डेफिनेशन कहीं नहीं मिलती है। पूरी दुनिया में कहीं मैनेजमेंट अकाउंटेंट की डेफिनेशन नहीं है इसलिए विधेयक का नाम यह नहीं हो सका। दूसरा, कम्पनी सेक्रेटरी वाले चाहते थे कि उनका नाम चार्टर्ड सेक्रेटरी पड़ जाए। वह भी संभव नहीं हो सका, उसका कारण है कि चार्टर्ड सेक्रेटरी जब पहले ब्रिटिश इंडिया यहां पर थी, जब यहां पर ब्रिटिश का राज था, तो चार्टर कहा जाता था, परन्तु

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

उसके बाद जब हमारा कम्पनीज़ एक्ट पास हुआ था तो उसमें परिवर्तन किया गया था, इसलिए इसके औचित्य को नहीं समझा गया। मैं यही कहते हुए, इस बिल का समर्थन करता हूँ। साथ ही साथ यह भी कहता हूँ कि हमारी कंट्री में करीब 8 लाख रजिस्टर्ड कम्पनियां हैं, किन्तु हमारे यहां कम्पनी सेक्रेटरी सिर्फ 21836 हैं।

(1Y/ASC पर जारी)

1y/12.50/asc-sk

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया (क्रमागत):** जब Registered Company Secretary 21,836 हैं तो आप समझ सकते हैं कि हम कितने लोगों से कितनी कम्पनियों का काम करवा रहे हैं। हमारी country में Chartered Accountants सिर्फ 1,61,516 हैं, जबकि 8 लाख कम्पनियां हैं। As per law हमें Section 224(1) of The Companies Act के तहत Chartered Accountants Certificate की जरूरत पड़ती है; उन कम्पनियों में हम एक Chartered Accountant से कितना काम करवाते हैं। यही कारण है जब date of return का समय होता है, उस समय उनके ऊपर बहुत ज्यादा दबाव होता है और वे काम करने में असमर्थ रहते हैं तथा काफी असुविधाओं का सामना करते हैं। यही कारण है SEBI में भी जो Karbi company में घोटाला हुआ है, उनके internal auditor, Haribhakti & Company, को उन्होंने punish किया। इन सभी चीजों का यही कारण है कि उनके ऊपर प्रेशर बहुत ज्यादा है। हमें Indian Chartered Accountants

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Institute में दाखिला लेने वालों की संख्या बढ़ानी चाहिए, Company Secretaries की संख्या बढ़ानी चाहिए। सेक्टर्स डिस-इन्वेस्ट होने जा रहे हैं, प्राइवेट सेक्टर्स आ रहे हैं, इसलिए उनमें Cost and Works Accountants का उपयोग नहीं हो रहा है। इस सरकार ने अभी एक National Manufacturing Policy डिक्लेयर की है। National Manufacturing Policy डिक्लेयर होने के साथ-साथ cost benefit या cost calculation के लिए Cost and Works Accountants की जरूरत पड़ेगी। इसलिए उनकी संख्या भी बढ़नी चाहिए, ताकि हम सही तरीके से अपनी इंडस्ट्री को चला सकें, disclosure सही हो सके, transparency सही हो सके और ये लोग भी अपने काम को न्याय दे सकें। इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ मैं इस बिल का समर्थन करते हुए, अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ। (समाप्त)

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (NOMINATED):** Sir, I support all the three Bills, which are integrated, inter-related and consistent with each other, as far as their content is concerned. This is a most timely measure that the Government is undertaking. Since 1991 the Indian economy has been globalizing and getting more and more integrated into the world economy. The structure of the economy, the dimensions of the economy and the relationships among different financial and industrial entities are also undergoing a change. That is

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

why, legislations in a country prevailing upon at a particular point of time also need to undergo change in order to accommodate the requirements of changing circumstances. That is why I fully support all the three Bills — The Chartered Accountant (Amendment) Bill, 2010, The Cost and Works Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010, and The Company Secretaries (Amendment) Bill, 2010.

Now, there is nothing substantial here which needs me to deal with extensively. In the beginning, I must congratulate Shri Ahluwalia for most of the points that he has mentioned. I fully support them and I am inclined to agree with what he has said. Since its beginning, the Chartered Accountants service has been a highly professional service and that is why the results of the Chartered Accountants examinations never exceeded six per cent. He has just now mentioned the statistics. Taking into account the number of legal, industrial concerns and companies, the number of Chartered accountants and the number of Secretaries is not only inadequate but grossly inadequate. Now, under these circumstances, there is always a tendency on the part of the players in the market to enjoy the scarcity rate. Now, this whole body fully understands what is meant by

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

‘scarcity rate’. In a particular locality, if 15 years ago there were ten MBBS Doctors and one Dental Surgeon, now there are ten Dental Surgeons and one MBBS Doctor. After liberalization and privatization of education, practically every medical college, whether required or not, has been giving admissions to Dental Surgeons, and that is why 50 per cent of the Dental Surgeons are on the footpath, just like Notaries go to the High Court and get affidavits.

(contd. at 1z/hk)

HK/1z/12.55

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (CONTD.):** That is why from this point of view, when the economy is growing at the rate of 8 to 8.5 per cent, the structure of the economy is undergoing a change. The share of the services sector is increasing alarmingly even much higher than the contribution of the manufacturing sector or industry to the GDP. We must sufficiently increase the number of both Company Secretaries and the Chartered Accountants. But this is the quantity dimension of Chartered Accountants. The most important thing is the professional ethics of these professionals. We have been discussing, time and again, black money in the economy. We are talking about

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

bringing back black money to the country. Estimates are very much different. But we scarcely discuss -- and sometimes it is painful to me -- how the black money is generated and that generation of black money is substantially related to the professional management of the companies and the company entities. For example, the owners of the company do not know how to manipulate the transactions. It is depending upon the acumen and the intelligence of the professional bodies to guide the firms and the concerns as to how to transfer money from one account to another account undertaking all the anomalies. And it is in this context, when I see the Economic Survey of India, I find that the maximum Foreign Institutional Investment in India is coming from Mauritius. What is the size of Mauritius? That is why it is quite possible that money is illegally taken by some entities to foreign countries with the advice and superb consultancy with the Chartered Accountants and Company Secretaries and that money is legally brought in the form of Financial Institutional Investment on which today more than 50 per cent of the Stock Exchange functioning in this country is depending. That is why along with the quantity of Chartered Accountants and Company Secretaries, the professional

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

ethics in this country, unfortunately, are declining very fast and sometimes I feel that it is going to the point beyond no repairs. The second point is regarding precautionary measures, changing the name of the Act and applying the Limited Liability Partnership Act provisions to this Act. In a country where professional ethics decline or is lacking, in that country it is possible to get higher rate of growth but it is impossible to make growth inclusive. It is from this point of view when we are discussing the issues of inclusive growth, all these things are related to inclusive growth. And I just mentioned about scarcity rate. There is a tendency on the part of people -- we call it 'oligopoly' in Economics; we call it sometimes 'monopoly' -- to form cartel. Just now Shri Ahluwaliaji mentioned that number of Chartered Accountants and Chartered Accountant firms are overburdened with the jobs which they are undertaking from different firms. But in the process what is happening is that these are not independent jobs that they are doing. When ten firms are taking 100 companies jobs, in the process they are forming the cartel, and, in that cartel, it is possible to exploit the profit beyond range; that is called the scarcity rate. I appreciate all these amendments. It is also necessary to change the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

nomenclature. As it was earlier mentioned, these three Bills will try to remove the anomalies and the ambiguities of terms 'firm', 'partner', 'partnership, and 'sole proprietorship'. Most of the time when I was teaching -- let me share with you very, very briefly and in a lighter vein -- Labour Economics in the University of Mumbai, I found that there were several Acts but there was no one standard definition of 'workman'. We are discussing bonus; we are discussing minimum wages; we are discussing standard wages, but we don't have standard definition even today of 'workman'.

(Contd. by 2a/KSK)

AKG-KSK/2A/1.00

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (CONTD):** Now, these kinds of anomalies are creating confusion and this confusion is utilised by the vested interests in order to seek the scarcity rate. That is why, I support this Bill and, at the same time, I suggest that we should try to bring the legislation which will be consistent with the modernisation of the economy and also will be dealing with the professional ethics and transparency. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)



**(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair)**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, Shri Narendra Kumar Kashyap.

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** सर, उनकी जगह में बोलना चाहता हूँ।

**श्री उपसभापति :** ठीक है।

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** धन्यवाद सर। आपने मुझे बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण बिल पर बोलने का मौका दिया।

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Members, it is now one o'clock. We will complete this Bill before 1.30 p.m. At 1.30 p.m., we will adjourn for lunch, and after lunch, we will take up the Appropriation (No.4) Bill, 2011.

**श्री ब्रजेश पाठक :** सर, The Chartered Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010; The Cost and Works Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010 and The Company Secretaries (Amendment) Bill, 2010, ये तीनों बिल सूक्ष्म हो सकते हैं, लेकिन अपनी भारतीय अर्थव्यवस्था के लिए बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण बिल हैं। अभी हमारे साथियों ने अपने विचार व्यक्त किए। उन्होंने अपने विचार व्यक्त करने के दौरान यह बात रखी कि भारतीय अर्थव्यवस्था में चार्टर्ड एकाउंटेंट्स, कंपनी सेक्रेटरीज़ और कॉस्ट एंड वर्क्स एकाउंटेंट्स किस तरह से भूमिका निभा रहे हैं। अभी वर्तमान परिदृश्य में हम लोगों के समक्ष अक्सर काले धन यानी ब्लैक मनी की चर्चा आती है। काले धन को सफ़ेद धन कैसे बनाया

जाए और कंपनियों को धन मुहैया कराने में हम इन चार्टर्ड एकाउंटेंट्स की भूमिका देखते हैं। अभी हाल ही में आपने देखा, मारीशस की भी चर्चा हुई और उन देशों की भी चर्चा हुई, जिनको tax haven के नाम से जाना जाता है, कि भारतीय अर्थव्यवस्था को चौपट करने में किस ढंग से इन संस्थाओं का योगदान रहा है। इन अमेंडमेंट्स के साथ हमारा यह भी सुझाव है कि हम इनको किस ढंग से विनियमित कर सकते हैं, जिससे वास्तव में जो नंबर एक का धन है, नंबर एक की मनी है, उसी का उपयोग हो पाए और काले धन का उपयोग विदेशों के जरिए हवाला के जरिए न होने पाए। सर, इन संशोधनों के जरिए हम अपने देश की फर्मों को विदेश में काम करने की अनुमति देने वाले हैं तथा विदेश की फर्मों को अपने देश में काम करने की अनुमति देने वाले हैं। जब विदेशी उद्योगपति हमारे देश में किसी उद्योग में अपना धन लगाने का काम करते हैं, तो उनकी मंशा होती है कि वे इस देश के अन्दर अपने काम के साथ अपने वित्तीय सलाहकार जोड़ने का काम करें। इसी को अनुमति देने के लिए इन बिल्स को लाने की जरूरत पड़ी है। माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, हम लोग इन बिल्स का समर्थन करने के लिए खड़े जरूर हुए हैं, लेकिन हमारे जो महत्वपूर्ण सुझाव हैं, उन पर भी ध्यान देने की आवश्यकता है कि इन कम्पनियों के माध्यम से ये कम्पनी सेक्रेटरीज़, कॉस्ट एकाउंटेंट्स और चार्टर्ड एकाउंटेंट्स, जो ब्लैक मनी को regularize करने का काम कर रहे हैं, हमें उसे भी रोकने की आवश्यकता है।

धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, the Government is bringing in these three Bills, namely, the Chartered Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010, the Cost and Works Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010, and the Company Secretaries (Amendment) Bill, 2010. The idea behind these amendment Bills is to enable them to form Limited Liability Partnership firms.

In the case of ICWAI, the name has been changed to the Institute of Cost and Management Accountants, which may enable the Institute to go for Mutual Recognition Agreement. My only apprehension is that bringing them under the Limited Liability Partnership will help the black sheep in the profession. The amendments will be fodder for the honest professionals of these Institutes.

(continued by 2b — gsp)

GSP-SCH-1.05-2B

**SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (CONTD.):** A few words have been spoken by the hon. Member from the Congress Party about ethics of this job.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

These institutes, all along these years, have been functioning under the regime of unlimited partnership only, and, in my opinion, the unlimited liability partnership is not a stumbling block for the development of these institutes. They are also functioning very effectively.

Sir, when it comes to amending the Bill pertaining to the Institute of Chartered Accountants of India, I would like to bring to the knowledge of the august House, the serious implications, the limited liability Bill will bring. The serious implications arise because of the policy of the present Government to open the doors for foreign firms performing accounting services. These companies sneaked into India under the garb of Management Consulting Firms and took over surrogate C.A. firms for their nefarious games. The Enron collapsed. The Global Trust Bank failed. The Satyam Computers fudged the accounts, and, recently, a mining company belonging to \* was found doing illegal mining.

---

**\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.**

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Don't take the name. (Interruptions)

**SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN:** All these are audited by the surrogate C.A. firms and are witness to the nefarious games of the foreign management consulting firms. If you lift the veil, you find the names of Price Waterhouse, Arthur Andersen, DH & Sells, and, others. The dominant management consulting firms in the United States are (a) Price Waterhouse, (2) Ernst and Young, (3) KPMG, and, (4) Deloitte Haskins and Sells. We have *Tri-murti*. We are bringing *Char-murti*.

They are controlling almost the entire management consulting in the United States, and, nobody knows as to who are the real owners of these companies even in the United States. Further, these companies have their controlling offices in tax havens. This shows the standard of their audit. Because these companies cannot do the audit in India directly, they lure a local C.A. firm to be their surrogate and carry on their nefarious activities. And, when the ICAI pointed out to these firms that they could not do the auditing by these surrogate firms, these foreign companies never cared for the objection raised by

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

the ICAI. These are the professional ethics, which these companies or firms are having.

Sir, in India, the ICAI is a body created by an Act of Parliament. So, it is under the direct supervision of the Union Government but in the United States, it is a State subject. Each State has its own laws. They do not allow our C.A. firms to enter into their country but they are entering into our country wearing a different garb and we simply wink over it.

Sir, in the context of these foreign consulting firms luring Indian audit firms to be the surrogate, don't you think that the limited liability Bill will be handy for these foreign firms to lure the Indian audit firms further easily as their liability is limited now. Sir, in the entire world, India stands second in the number of Chartered Accountants, next only to the United States. Even UK does not have this much of Chartered Accountants. When this is our strength, why should we kneel before the foreign firms? Where is the necessity for allowing the foreign management consulting firms? These firms do not respect the laws of our land. Numerous letters were written by the ICAI to these foreign firms seeking the information of audit companies in

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

India, but they never cared to reply. This is the respect that they give to our Institute, which is constituted under a statute passed by our Parliament. The remedy you are trying to give by the Limited Liability Bill is like giving 'crocin' for cancer.

(Contd. by YSR-2C)

-GSP/YSR/1.10/2C

**SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (CONTD.):** Before introducing Limited Liability Partnership Firms for the ICAI, I demand that the Government must call the ICAI to immediately take action on all surrogate firms operating in India.

Two, pending final action, these firms must be instantly blacklisted and the Government must ask SEBI to direct listed companies from changing such tainted auditors.

Three, the Ministry of Corporate Affairs needs to take action on all multinational accounting firms operating in India as consulting firms.

Four, the ICAI must be asked to explain why despite the JPC's directions it failed to act against Pricewaterhouse Coopers in the Global Trust Bank case which ultimately led to the Satyam scandal.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Five, the Reserve Bank must explain why Pricewaterhouse Coopers is allowed to continue as auditors for the Global Trust Bank despite the reservation expressed by the JPC.

Above all, the Government should review the alternative route of entry of foreign accounting firms in India in the name of management consulting firms and the circumvention of the law of the land taking place directly and indirectly by performing accounting services by them.

With these words, I conclude and request the Minister to consider all these issues.

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Lunch-break will be there after the Bill is passed.

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA (ODISHA):** Sir, I will take only two minutes. A number of issues have already been raised. I agree with my colleagues on the issue of activities of foreign accounting firms in India. There is a need to consolidate our accounting firms.

I rise to support these three amending legislations. It would help in their consolidation. Consolidation is already taking place because



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

of non-application of Limited Liability Partnership Act, 2008 to these professions. Consolidation was taking place but slowly. Now this will move faster and, in the process, hopefully, Indian firms will not be the tail-ender of foreign firms or their agents. They would be competing with those firms on their own.

Having said this, I have some reservations like one of my previous speakers who mentioned the kind of things our chartered accountants have been doing. He mentioned Mauritius which is a very familiar example. Plenty of examples are there in stock exchange manipulations. Plenty of examples are available to see what these professions, particularly of chartered accountants, have done to our national exchequer. Every time you go to file your income tax, your chartered accountant will tell you how to avoid paying tax by making a very thin line between tax avoidance and tax evasion. You pay your taxes. But once you afford a chartered accountant, he saves your tax in a legal manner. How much the country loses on this account, unfortunately, has not been calculated by the Finance Ministry. They ought to have done so. They ought to do so now and see the dangers which these combinations possess or these professions possess and

how these professions can be reined in so that the national interest is not affected.

(Contd. by KR/2D)

KR/2D/1.15

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA (CONTD.)** : One small issue that I have with the Cost and Works Accountants is about the amendment to the 'cost accountancy' calling them Cost and Management Accountancy. Management accountancy as a subject as such is not the preserve syllabi of the cost accountancy. When somebody passes cost accountancy, it is nobody's case that that person alone learns management accountancy. Management accountancy is a much more generic issue which is taught in MBA (Finance) which also other Chartered Accountants learn, which also to some extent Company Secretaries learn if you look at the syllabi of that also. So, I wish that the recommendations of the Standing Committee to cut out that management from Indian Cost and Management should have been accepted. I wish that should have been accepted and also in case of a Company Secretaries the amendment suggested regarding

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

calling them Chartered Secretaries should have been accepted. I hope the Government will think about it in future.

(Ends)

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Mr Deputy Chairman, I must commend the excellent suggestions given by all the distinguished Members from this side and also from the other side of the House. I think, this is a great step which has been taken, particularly, to respond to the vibrant service sector. Many, many concerns have also been expressed. But you also appreciate that all those concerns cannot be addressed only through these Bills. We have a comprehensive Companies' Bill, 2011 which has already been moved in the Lok Sabha. I feel that that Bill will address many of these problems which have been raised here. Hon. Members have also referred to certain issues which have to be tackled by the Reserve Bank of India; and some of the issues have to be tackled by the SEBI also. There are so many agencies which have to address those problems. I would like to answer a few queries which are germane to the question before us. In fact, the limited liability partnership is always viewed as an alternate

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

corporate business vehicle that provides the benefits of limited liability. But also allows its members the flexibility of organizing their internal structure as a partnership of a mutually arrived agreement. It will enable the entrepreneurs, professionals, enterprises, corporate bodies, what kind of services they require. In fact, these are the days where there is no place for mediocrity. Now, we require excellent services, world class services. That does not mean that world class services will come only from abroad. We need to nurture indigenously. We must enable our professional institutes to develop these. We need to provide them that kind of legal environment so that they can build themselves up. We have an excellent ladder by which we can climb. The hon. Deputy Chairman himself is a Chartered Accountant of the highest repute. (Continued by 2E)

-KR-TMV-DS/2E/1.20

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY (CONTD.):** You will appreciate that we need to have a lot of capacity building within those professional institutes or professional bodies. This is only one such vehicle by which we will allow them to grow and build themselves into legal entities and to organise themselves. Wherever a deficit is there that

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

will be definitely and adequately provided for by this kind of a legal environment. That doesn't mean that it is the end of the journey. There are a lot of things which need to be done to build capacity. Why don't we have the biggest institutions of the world? On one occasion, where the hon. Deputy Chairman was also present, I said that we wanted 100 such legal entities to come up within five years or ten years. Let us prepare the roadmap which I have already discussed with all the three Institutes. I said, "Whatever you require that you must get and I want not less than 100 such magnificent institutes or giants in the world to be produced by India". We are taking many other steps to create such entities in the country. We need to have them. We can't be only pigmies and we can't subserve only the foreign companies. I think that kind of a personality needs to be built and it is only a step in that direction. In fact, the proposed amendments will enable professionals of all the three Institutes to provide the other members of the Institute and also to form partnership with all the members of either of these recognised Institutes. That flexibility is now provided. The LLPs are given encouragement in the country, particularly, after the LLP Act was

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

enacted in 2008. As on 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2011, 6,439 LLPs have registered in the country mainly in the business service, trading, real estate, rentals, construction and so on. That is the trend of the world and we can't disable these Institutes from building that kind of a legal world entity. Now these amendments will make the services of these three Institutes to grow like that and join the big market, particularly, in the LLP sector.

In fact, a number of things have been stated here by the distinguished Members. You all know that our senior Member, Shri Ahluwalia, has given a number of suggestions. He has expressed a number of concerns. Some of them, as I have already told you, will be definitely addressed by the Company Bill. We have seen to it and the present amendments, in fact, have provided for that. One overarching approach which I would like to say is with regard to the change of name in the case of Institute of Cost and Works Accountants. They want that management should be added. We have dealt with that and deliberated on that. We can't agree with that. As rightly pointed out by a distinguished senior Member that the term "management" is generic in nature. Suppose we add

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

management to the Cost and Works Accountants, then it should not be assumed that the management component is excluded from the other Institutes. These are the legal problems. We tried to examine it and even the Standing Committee tried to examine it thoroughly, and, ultimately, they came to the conclusion that the term “management” can’t be added. But, in fact, we have deleted some words and the rest of it remained there.

(Contd. by 2F/mks)

MKS-HMS/1.25/2F

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY (CONTD.):** Coming to some of the matters which have been referred to by the distinguished Members, I would like to say that about the Satyam case, the Institute of Chartered Accountants has already instituted action through the disciplinary mechanism. You all know that disciplinary mechanism has to be exercised by the respective Institutes, and on both, the Satyam and the Global Trust Bank, and also, the Chartered Accountants and others involved in these banks and in the companies, the actions were delayed. That is because of many of the court proceedings. We have been pursuing that. Recently, the process has, again, started after

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

having the necessary clearance from the court proceedings. In fact, in Satyam case, maximum punishment has been awarded to the Chartered Accountants who are involved in that. So, we are pursuing that matter. In fact, it is right that multinational companies come as management consultants and have started functioning through surrogate firms. They have been doing it. ICAI has examined the violations of these multinational funds. They were examined by the Ministry, and the matter has been taken up with the regulatory authorities like RBI, SEBI etcetera. They are under serious consideration, and we will try to expedite those proceedings.

Hon. Member T.K. Rangarajan, as you know, has mentioned about the foreign firms entering into India through surrogate firms. That I have already answered. He said that real owners are not known; they do not care about the objections raised by the ICAI. Why not allow foreign firms when, you know, they fail to reply properly, to account for it? In fact, ICAI has advised to take action against violations of these. And they have seriously taken it up. I think, we will definitely address them seriously and take a proper action.

Our distinguished Member Mohapatra has already asked...



**SHRI RUDRA NARAYAN PANY:** Mr. Mohapatra!

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Mohapatra.

**SHRI RUDRA NARAYAN PANY:** Mr. Mohapatra.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Mr. Mohapatra. Distinguished Member  
Mr. Mohapatra! Am I correct?

**MS. MABEL REBELLO:** Happy?

**SHRI RUDRA NARAYAN PANY:** Yes.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** ...in fact, after independence, why a colonial name like *Chartered* should be there. You know, this is a matter which is left to the Chartered Accountants of India to consider; I do not want to make further comment on that. Particularly after the Enron and other global financial scams, the Government of India has made substantial changes in the Chartered Accountants Act. The amendments, after getting passed, have permitted even award of a monetary penalty up to Rs.5 lakhs. Besides the maximum punishment to the personnel involved in the scam, the action has been taken. Fortunately, very prompt action taken, particularly on Satyam, has saved a number of stakeholders.

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** What about the Price Waterhouse?

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** About the Price Waterhouse also, the action has been taken. And we can take action. It is not that we cannot take action. As I have already told you, since there are a number of court cases, we could not do it. But, anyway, we will seriously look into it and try to see that wherever it is possible to take action, we will not hesitate. Moreover, you all know that the amendment to the comprehensive Company Secretaries (Amendment) Bill, which is coming up, has provided many things on this, particularly to provide for the appropriate ethics and standards to be maintained by the various corporate bodies, and this will definitely provide, you know, enough punishment.

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, please yield for a minute.

(Contd. by VK/2G)

VK/2G/1.30

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (CONTD):** Let me tell you why we are concerned. We have seen the Harshad Mehta scam. There we found that auditors were involved. We saw another stock market scam where also auditors were involved. Now in the recent 2G scam, you will be surprised to know that in all the cases of all these companies,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

whatever certificates were given by the auditors that their authorized capital is this much and paid up capital is this much, were false. They got the license on the basis of false certificates issued by the auditors. It is a very serious issue, Sir.

**DR. ASHOK S. GANGULY:** Sir, it is a very serious issue. I want to make a point. Hon. Minister, I think the issue is very serious and it will come up in the Companies Bill. But the point is, the global chartered and accountancy firms have a monopoly and this has to be broken. The Indian Institute of Chartered Accountants must be empowered and it must be insisted upon that auditors of professional integrity, who come under the law, must be promoted and those who give such certificates that Ahluwaliaji is talking about, the hon. Minister is talking about, must be banned from this profession. It is a much larger issue. We will take it up at the future date when the Companies Bill comes up. But this is a global menace. It is not a national menace alone. This is not to condemn the profession of chartered accountancy, but those who slip into the profession under the garb of becoming Chartered Accountants, that has to be taken into account. I compliment the hon. Member and the hon. Minister because I have

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

been interacting with the Department of Corporate Affairs. But this is an issue of a much larger dimension. Thank you.

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, I started my speech by saying about the wrong doings of America. It has started from America.

**SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN:** I would again like to draw the attention of the Minister and request the Government to review the alternative route of entry of foreign accounting firm in India in the name of management consulting firms. Let him reply to that.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** He has said that.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, in fact, our hon. Member is having a very vast experience in the company affairs and also corporate governance. The distinguished Member has already given suggestions. In fact, we have held discussions with him. Many a time, I have also discussed with him. In fact, you all know that the Serious Fraud Investigation Office, SFIO has emerged from an Executive Order. There was no legislative backup for that. Now in the new Companies Bill, we have given it a legislative status. A number of things have been included so that if any serious fraud happens, they cannot just escape. We have also provided many

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

things to prevent such frauds happening from time to time; for providing the most transparent administration in the corporate bodies. We have also taken initiatives to come out with a national corporate governance policy. We never had that kind of a policy. We are also coming out with a National Competition Policy. We never had that kind of a policy. We need to fit in many of the mechanisms which we are lacking. That is what we are trying to do. In fact, many of the questions and concerns which have been raised by the distinguished Members today, we have directly addressed them in the Companies Bill. The Companies Bill has provided remedies for many of these things. When it comes to that, we will discuss it in more details. I do not want to deal with that now. As far as the inclusive part of the corporate bodies is concerned, as raised by the distinguished Member, Dr. Mungekar, we have provided that. For the first time in the world, we have provided a legal status for the corporate social responsibility in our Companies Bill. We have provided for that. That is why I do not want to prolong the reply. It would be suffice to say that a number of inputs which have been given by all of you, will be

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

considered not only in the Companies Bill, but also in many of the regulations which we are going to pass in future.

I commend the Bill for the consideration of the House.

(Ends)

(Followed by 2h)

RG/1.35/2H

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I shall first put the Chartered Accountants (Amendment) Bill to vote. The question is:

That the Bill further to amend the Chartered Accountants Act, 1949, be taken into consideration.

*The motion was adopted.*

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** We shall now take up clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill.

**Clauses 2 and 3 were added to the Bill.**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, clause 1. There is one amendment (No.2) by the Minister.

**Clause 1: Short title and commencement**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** I move:

(No.2) That at page 1, line 2, *for* the figure “2010” the figure

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

“2011” be *substituted*.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

Clause 1, as amended, was added to the Bill.

#### ENACTING FORMULA

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

That at page 1, line 1, *for* the word “Sixty-first”

word “Sixty-second” be *substituted*.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

The Enacting Formula, as amended, was added to the Bill.

The Title was added to the Bill.

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

That the Bill, as amended, be passed.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I shall now put the Cost and Works Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010, to vote. The question is:

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

That the Cost and Works Accountants (Amendment) Bill, 2010,  
be taken into consideration.

*The motion was adopted.*

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** We shall now take up clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill. In clause 2, there is one amendment (No.3) by the Minister.

**Clause 2: Substitution of references to certain expressions by certain other expressions.**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No.3) That at page 1, lines 7 to 12, be *deleted*.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

**Clause 2, as amended, was added to the Bill.**

**Clause 3 -- Amendment of section 2.**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No.4) That at page 2, line 1, *for* the words “principal Act”, the words, figure and brackets “Cost and Works Accountants Act, 1959 hereinafter referred to as the principal Act)” be *substituted*.



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

(No. 5). That at page 2, line 12, ***for*** the words “Institute of Cost and Management Accountants of India”, the words “Institute of Cost Accountants of India” be ***substituted***.

(No.6). That at page 2, line 25, ***for*** the words “cost and management accountancy”, the words “cost accountancy” be ***substituted***.

(No.7). That at page 2, line 33, ***for*** the words “cost and management accountancy”, the words “cost accountancy” be ***substituted***.

(No.8). That at page 2, line 36, ***for*** the words “cost and management accounting”, the words “cost accounting” be ***substituted***.

(No.9). That at page 2, lines 37 and 38, ***for*** the words “cost and management accountant”, the words “cost accountant” be ***substituted***.

(No.10). That at page 2, lines 39 and 40, be ***deleted***.

***The questions were put and the motions were adopted.***

**Clause 3, as amended, was added to the Bill.**

**Clause 4 -- Amendment of section 3.**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No.11). That at page 2, lines 42 and 43, *for* the words “Institute of Cost and Management Accountants of India”, the words “Institute of Cost Accountants of India” be *substituted*.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

**Clause 4, as amended, was added to the Bill.**

**Clause 5 -- Amendment of section 5.**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No.12). That at page 3, line 5, *for* the words “Institute of Cost and Management Accountants of India”, the words “Institute of

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Cost Accountants of India” be ***substituted***.

(No.13). That at page 3, line 9, ***for*** the words “Institute of Cost and Management Accountants of India”, the words “Institute of

Cost Accountants of India” be ***substituted***.

***The questions were put and the motions were adopted.***

**Clause 5, as amended, was added to the Bill.**

**Clause 6 -- Amendment of section 22A**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No.14) That at page 3, line 11, ***for*** the words “Institute of Cost and Management Accountants of India”, the words “Institute of Cost Accountants of India” be ***substituted***.

***The question was put and the motion was adopted.***

**Clause 6, as amended, was added to the Bill.**

**Clause 7 -- Amendment of Section 25.**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No.15). That at page 3, line 14, *for* the words “cost and management accountants”, the words “cost accountant” be *substituted*.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

**Clause 7, as amended, was added to the Bill.**

**Clause 8 was added to the Bill.**

(Followed by 2J)

2j/1.40/ks

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, we shall take up clause 9. There is one amendment (No. 16) by the Minister.

**CLAUSE 9 — AMENDMENT OF FIRST SCHEDULE**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No. 16) That at page 3, lines 22 and 23, *for* the words “Institute of Cost and Management Accountants of India”, the words “Institute of Cost Accountants of India” be *substituted*.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

**Clause 9, as amended, was added to the Bill.**

**CLAUSE 10 — AMENDMENT OF SECOND SCHEDULE**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No. 17) That at page 3, lines 24 and 25, be *deleted*.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

*Clause 10, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, we shall take up clause 1. There is one amendment (No. 2) by the Minister.

**CLAUSE 1 - SHORT TITLE AND COMMENCEMENT**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No. 2) That at page 1, line 4, *for* the figure "2010", the figure "2011" be *substituted*.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

*Clause 1, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, we shall take up the Enacting Formula. There is one amendment (No. 1) by the Minister.

**ENACTING FORMULA**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No. 1) That at page 1, line 1, for the word "Sixty-first", the word "Sixty-second" be substituted.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

*The Enacting Formula, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

*The Title was added to the Bill.*

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

That the Bill, as amended, be passed.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, I shall put the Company Secretaries (Amendment) Bill, 2010 moved by Shri Veerappa Moily to vote. The question is:-

That the Bill further to amend the Company Secretaries Act, 1980, be taken into consideration.

*The motion was adopted.*

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** We shall now take up Clause-by-Clause consideration of the Bill.

*Clauses 2 and 3 were added to the Bill.*

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, we shall take up Clause 1. There is one amendment (No. 2) by the Minister.

**Clause 1— Short title, extent and commencement**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No. 2) That at page 1, line 4, *for* the figure "2010", the figure "2011" be *substituted*.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

*Clause 1, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, we shall take up the Enacting Formula. There is one amendment (No. 1) by the Minister.

**ENACTING FORMULA**

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

(No. 1) That at page 1, line 1, *for* the word "Sixty-first", the

word "Sixty-second" be ***substituted***.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

*The Enacting Formula, as amended, was added to the Bill.*

*The Title was added to the Bill.*

**SHRI M. VEERAPPA MOILY:** Sir, I move:

That the Bill, as amended, be passed.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, the House is adjourned for lunch for one hour.

-----

The House then adjourned for lunch  
at forty-five minutes past one of the Clock



2k/2.40/Kgg

**The House re-assembled, after lunch, at forty-four minutes past two of the clock, MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.**

--

**THE APPROPRIATION (NO.4) BILL, 2011**

**THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE):** Sir, I  
move:

That the Bill to authorize payment and Appropriation of certain further sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of the financial year 2011-12, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration.

Sir, I would not like to make any long observation at the introductory stage. As all the hon. Members of the House are aware, this is a Money Bill as per description under article 110 of the Constitution.

(Contd. by tdb/2l)

TDB/2L/2.45

**SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (CONTD.):** And, therefore, Rajya Sabha does not discuss the Demands for Grants, but Rajya Sabha discusses in the form of Appropriation Bill. They can discuss these issues, and

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Supplementary Demand also provides us an opportunity to take a look back at the state of economy. I would just like to mention a couple of issues which are important for the consideration of the hon. Members. This is the second batch of the Supplementary Demand. The proposals for the cash additionality is Rs.56,848.46 crores, and if we take into account the technical Supplementary, then, the total amount would be Rs.63,100 crores. Rupees six thousand three hundred thirty crores would be the technical Supplementary because we are providing this money for the services created -- but the amount would be saved by the same Department from other areas -- for which the Parliamentary approval was needed at the time of the Budget, or, at the time of the first Supplementary, which was not anticipated then. So, the additional expenditure is being met from this.

Sir, during the current financial year, in the first batch of Supplementary Demand, which was presented in August, the net cash outgo was Rs.9,016 crores. After the passage of almost eight months in the current fiscal year, there has been some pressing unavoidable demands. Supplementary provisions in the Constitution have been made under article 115, keeping in view that at the time of

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

the presentation of the Budget all the expenditures which may be incurred during the year may not be anticipated, therefore, the Executive should have the flexibility to come to the Parliament for the approval of the House to get the additional amount in the form of Supplementary Demand. Naturally, always, the first question which comes to the mind of the Members -- and they put this question to the Finance Minister very squarely and bluntly and very rightly so -- what is going to be its impact on the overall fiscal deficit because this is the additional expenditure which the Government is incurring. Surely, if you calculate it, the expenditure figures which have been available till date, and the revenue figures, then, you will find that the fiscal deficit is very substantially high. It is almost 68 per cent of the BE projections. On the other hand, the total projection has been 68 per cent of the total Budgetary expenditure. In terms of GDP, 4.6 per cent has been projected as the fiscal deficit. But one need not necessarily be worried over it because if you look at the five years' moving average, it varies from 54 - 55 per cent, and these figures get reconciled at the end of the year, before the presentation of the Revised Estimates to the Parliament. Here, I would just give you one

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

example. For instance, though the growth, in gross terms, of Direct Taxes has been around 22 per cent, but in net terms, it has been around eight per cent. It is because we have decided to upfront the refund. As a result, against Rs.27,000 crores of refund in the previous year; this year, we have provided almost Rs.68,000 crores as refund on the Direct Taxes side. Naturally, the net in the Direct Tax side has been more, and to recoup that, we had to resort to some borrowing.

(Contd. by 2m-cls)

KLS/2M-2.50

**SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (CONTD):** Around 56,000 crores of rupees borrowings we had to resort to manage the cash flow but nonetheless it will have a stress and it will have its effect in the course of the year if the corrective steps are not taken. That is why while participating in the debate on inflation, I mentioned that to maintain the fiscal deficit, as per the target, it is a serious challenge. In the course of my reply after listening to the views of the hon. Members, I

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

will elaborate on it. With these words, Mr. Deputy Chairman, I commend that the Appropriation Bill be taken into consideration.

*The question was proposed.*

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY):** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, the hon. Finance Minister has proposed some Demands for Supplementary Grants. The Finance Minister is the best judge of the kind of revenues and monies that the Government requires. And, therefore, as he rightly pointed out, this House really does not approve the Finance Bills but it provides us with an opportunity to really discuss the state of the economy and where we stand today. Coincidentally, we are debating this on a day when somewhat depressing figures and numbers for the month of October, 2011, have been released today morning. I recollect, Sir, while replying to the debate on price rise last week, the Finance Minister had raised some very important issues and these issues related to the impact of the global slowdown on Indian economy, the kind of steps he has taken and the kind of steps he has not been able to take to really counter the impact of that slowdown. And then he enlarged this debate a little further that management of the economy is the principal

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

responsibility of the Government, but to manage it, the Government needs the cooperation of all the States, what he has conventionally described cooperative federalism in India in the management of the economy. He also spoke in terms of the larger political consensus which is required in the matter of the management of the economy. Sir, some of the issues which he had raised last week and which are extremely relevant to the situations both with regard to the economy and its political management, are all issues which are relevant for us today. I would say at the very outset that I partly do agree with him. It is true, Sir, that the world has faced a slowdown subsequent to the subprime crisis which took place in America. Its impact was felt in Europe; its impact has been felt in various countries. In recent months, eurozone crisis has also left its footprints on the global economy and as global economies are getting greatly integrated, we cannot immunize ourselves from the impact of these crisis. The hardening of the oil prices has also presented us with very grim challenge. But then let us also recollect that over a decade ago, when a very severe East Asian crisis took place, we countered it and we survived it reasonably effectively. Even the first two years after the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

subprime crisis, Indian economy did maintain a respectable rate of growth. As against this, if I look back from 1991 till today where a more optimistic outlook for the Indian economy started after the reform process, I think in the last 20-odd years, this is perhaps the grimmest situation we are passing through. The entire showcasing of India that we make to the entire world, the entire image is today taking a setback.

(Contd by 2N/SSS)

SSS/2N/2.55

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (CONTD.):** For two years and even more, up to three years, we have both headline inflation and food inflation at an unacceptable level. Food inflation has almost gone up at times to 20 per cent. Inflation has hovered around almost 10 per cent, a double digit figure and in the post-liberalisation era this was an unacceptable position or at least we thought that these kinds of figures we never get to see again. We cannot take comfort from the fact that the last week's figures or the last two week's figures have shown a decline in the rate of inflation. When the rate declines, Sir, marginally, it does not mean that prices are actually coming down. It only means that

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

instead of ten per cent, at this point of time they are rising by eight per cent. So, the increase gets slowed down, the prices effectively don't come down. This was debated last week that crude oil prices have hovered around 110 dollars and our duty structure, both in the Centre and the States, particularly the ad valorem duty structures despite some marginal reliefs which have been given, are such that when the rate of oil goes up, the cost of crude oil goes up, the taxes also go up because they are ad valorem and therefore, the eventual consumer is hit doubly because of these increases as far as the oil prices are concerned. Sir, in case of infrastructure creation, even if we see the areas of success stories which India had in the infrastructure in the recent past, it has somewhat slowed down and is not presenting that kind of an enthusiastic picture which we thought a decade ago when the emphasis of infrastructure had greatly started. The Finance Minister was kind enough to say that when Rs. 56,000 crores has to be borrowed additionally, all this is going to add to the fiscal deficit figures and therefore, what you projected in your Budget Speech is 4.6 per cent as a projected fiscal deficit for this year and as of today if we stand and debate, this looks a little unlikely. Therefore, how much



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

it will exceed, will it cross the figure of five and present a challenge again is an issue which seems almost inclined in debate to the side that the fiscal deficit is going to far exceed what was the projected figure. Coming to interest rates, you have used the credit squeeze by hiking interest rates four times this year and thirteen times in all, in the past several months in order to fight inflation. Now, the impact of this on the competitiveness of the Indian industry and on several sectors such as manufacturing, automobiles, real estate, housing are areas on which we thought that between six to eight per cent, consumers were actually getting credit. Now, if it goes back to 12, 14 and 16 per cent, this is likely to impact all these sectors extremely adversely. The cost of capital goes up, your industry therefore, becomes non-competitive compared to their competitors internationally, particularly, the low cost economies and the impact of that is going to be that our entire manufacturing sector is going to be hit and once you have sectors like real estate, housing where loans have become costlier, being hit, the spiral effect of that on cement, on steel, on job creation of construction labour, on all these sectors the impact is also going to be huge. Sir, I regret to say that the past three to four years had seen

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

a sudden decline in the decision making process as far as the economic policy decisions were concerned. Major decisions were being shelved on one ground or the other and this is a subject which I will deal with at some length during the course of the discussion today.

(Contd. by NBR/20)

-SSS/NBR-AKG/20/3.00.

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (CONTD.):** While we are on this subject, we cannot deceive ourselves by not accepting the hard reality that the buoyancy of the Indian economy, the enthusiasm in the Indian economy, the great showcasing of the Indian economy and the immediate suffer is also because of the excessive scams and corruption. This has a spiral effect in many ways. Corruption adds to the cost of a project. If you find that monies have to be paid other than legitimate monies, the projects are going to cost more. Investors who are used to investing in a far cleaner investment are reluctant to invest in those economies. The impact of all this corruption has been that it has created a huge amount of anger and a backlash. We can see that backlash in public opinion. We can see that backlash in the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

media, both print and electronic. We can also see that backlash in judicial pronouncements. Therefore, in the implementation of policy, or, in the implementation of projects, if allegations of serious corruption are involved, the investors are going to fear that they may eventually land up in prisons and does not get bail for months together. Now, all this is contributing to this hostile image which is being created as far as India as an investment destination is concerned. This is precisely the reason that, in the last two years, we have seen not only the flow of FDI declining in India on account of all these factors, but there is another cause for worry. And that cause for worry is not that the foreigners are not coming and investing in India, our own domestic business houses are now looking at global markets to invest. As the data would indicate, the outward flow of FDI has now been greater than the inward flow of FDI into India. Initially, we accepted this enthusiastic superficial reaction that our own corporate has become very big and it is now choosing to buy world companies. So, we used to cite them as examples of how well the Indian economy is today doing and flexing the muscles of our own industry. Unless we realize that a lot of them are going out for another reason -- they are

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

finding that India is not the best invest destination under the circumstances -- it is a serious cause to worry. They are no longer enthusiastic about investing within the country and, therefore, they are looking for destinations outside India as far as investment is concerned.

Sir, all this has been happening and we have been gradually leading to this situation in the last 3-4 years. Why has this happened? I would urge here, without meaning any personal disrespect to any individual, one thing. The hon. Finance Minister who is, perhaps, one of the most experienced Parliamentarians. He spend more time in both these Houses than any one else in the current generation. Is there something seriously wrong with the model of governance that they are following? I am not coming to policy. Sir, I always believed that for implementation of any programme of the Government, any policy of the Government, to run an effective Government, there are three essentials that are required. The first is the kind of leadership. The leadership must be able to provide the direction, take decisions and implement decisions. The second is the credibility of the Government. And, the third which is equally important is the aura of

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

the authority of the Government which in Hindi we call “क्या सरकार की साख भी है कि नहीं है, क्या सरकार का इकबाल भी है कि नहीं है?” Now, when we see this situation building up in the political structure that the UPA has followed, I think, there is something wrong with the structure which they need to seriously introspect. The Prime Minister has to be the natural leader of the country and Government. He must be the last word as far as policy is concerned. But, then, if he has to look for guidance on policy around and then he has to function like a CEO taking direction from a Board is a model on which the world's largest democracy cannot function. Fortunately, in UPA-I -- I will give credit to it -- we found that even when we were critical of the fact that there is a twin leadership, and the model of twin leadership does not function, but, in UPA-I, the twin leadership was broadly on the same page.

(CONTD. BY USY "2P")

-NBR-USY/3.05/2P

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (CONTD.):** In the last few years, I have found, particularly since UPA-II has taken over, that it does not appear to be

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

on the same page. Even ideologically, the twin leadership does not appear to be on the same page. Therefore, on issues after issues you will find that the leadership of the UPA is more concerned with programmes and some of them are very legitimate, understandably legitimate, which are generally beneficial and they help you in gathering votes, the economic thinking, as far as the leadership of the Government is concerned, seems to be in somewhat different direction. That is the reason when you speak in terms of political consensus, and that is the point I am leading to, it is very easy to tell the Opposition and tell the States that come and have a political consensus with me. I will dwell on the point of opposition of the States a little later. Let us honestly put ourselves a question: Is there a complete political consensus within the UPA on the kind of decisions that you want to take? You cited the example of the FDI in retail, where the decision has been suspended, till a political consensus between stakeholders is reached. There was a very large national opposition to it. The withholding of the decision was not because of the national opposition, it was also not because of the threat of mid-term election. The threat of the mid-term election came because you

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

have no consensus within the UPA. Why did I not come across a single statement from the Chairperson of the UPA in support of the Government's policy? Your own constituents were angrily protesting. Therefore, before we can be told that management of national economy is not the personal prerogative of the Government -- it needs the support of all, an argument of the hon. Finance Minister, I accept that argument — please develop a political consensus as far as the UPA is concerned. Therefore, the policies that you announce must be after you have taken a full consensus within the UPA. It is only then, if you find a difficulty, you will realize that whether the decision is implementable or not. I just want to dwell for a few moments even on the retail policy. I have absolutely no difficulty. After all, from 1991 to 2004, we had three different political formulations. You had the Congress, Mr. Narsimha Rao's Government; you had the United Front; and, then, you had the NDA. Slowly but surely the direction of the management of the economy was in the clear same direction. That is why there was a great enthusiasm. But, as I have said outside the House, every change itself is not a reform. You have to test reforms how they will fit into the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

present structure of the Indian economy. So, when you suggested the FDI in retail, let me tell you -- you rightly mentioned that there was a paragraph in the NDA agenda in 2004 that made a reference, though my party, the BJP, never accepted any document till today — despite a strong commitment to the reform process, during that period, every time a suggestion to this effect came up for FDI in retail but we were a little cautious. Not only we were cautious, at that time, you were also very cautious. You were cautious when you were in power; you were cautious even when you were in Opposition. And, there were several good reasons for it. I recollect that when we were in Government — this was one area that I was handling in the Government, in the Department of Commerce — every time a suggestion came in any bilateral or multilateral dialogues that India must open up the FDI in retail. And, it came mostly from Europe and the United States. We said, " We were not ready for it". (Contd. by 2q — PK)

PK/2Q/3.10

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (CONTD.):** Your Government also said it; the UPA-I also said it repeatedly. I will just give you three, four reasons. The first is not the most important reason, but it is a relevant reason.



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

When you make a big trade concession to them — trade is not a matter of philanthropy or charity — you then, get some concessions back from them. I could not understand why, unilaterally, such a concession had been made. It could have been made if it had gone and, outrightly, helped the Indian economy. My queer fear is, there are still a lot of manufacturing sector reforms that India has to carry on. Sir, with regard to trade, you have more experience as the Finance Minister or Trade Minister, than most of us. You will realise that there is a general tendency of consumers and buyers all over the world that they buy what is the best and the cheapest. Therefore, the global balance is tilting in favour of low-cost economies. Now, what do you find here? Today morning, Mr. Shinde, while answering to a question in Parliament, said that electricity generation has gone down. It will lead to higher cost of utilities and lesser trade facilitation. If my products, my general merchandise is going to be much costlier than its competitors, they will not find buyers. In this area, I am not competing with Europe or the United States of America; I will be competing with Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Thailand, Malaysia, China, the low-cost economies. The general tendency of international retail is

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

that they don't source domestically, they source internationally. That has happened. It has left its impact in the United States. When they source internationally, you will, suddenly, find that the first drip in jobs is in the Indian manufacturing sector. Therefore, before you take this step, take all these steps and reforms, we will stand with you. Let us also try and become a very low-cost manufacturing hub. We are somewhat a low-cost manufacturing hub, but not a very low-cost manufacturing hub. Therefore, we have to follow the experience of all these economies and then, the steps required to bring down the cost of our products is the course that we have to embark on. Otherwise, what will be the situation? You will have a French in an American store selling Chinese products and the only Indian contribution is going to be the sales boys and sales girls. That is not what this country was cut out to be. So, if merchandise is going to come from there, you have to first act and make reforms in that direction. There is no settled model that once you open up and create this sector, automatically, the economy will grow. The global experience, Sir, is that large structure international retail, even in the retail sector, is not going to create additional markets. It will displace existing markets. I

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

have always asked my friends who live in the city of New York, in Manhattan, “why don’t I see the Walmart Stores here?” They say, well, if one big store comes up, the Mayor of New York will lose his job. He will be voted out. Because they know that it will displace the existing jobs. What is the character of our jobs? The largest sector of our economy, 58 per cent, is services. What is the job character breakdown? Eighteen per cent of the Indians, who are a workforce, are structurally employed in structured jobs, 30 per cent is casual labour or unemployed and 51 per cent is self-employed. The largest contingent of self-employed comes from agriculture. The next is retail. In 1998, according to the last figures of the Planning Commission available, in retail, 4 crores people were employed. Today, it may have gone up towards 5 crores. You multiply it by four-and-a-half, which is the average size of a family, you will find that 1/6 th of India’s population is dependent on it. Therefore, we will have to carry on preceding reforms. We should not jump to the last one merely because we are under some peer pressure. This is a big-ticket reform and a big-ticket reform is required to send a message. We will reform in the areas we have to reform, where it benefits the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Indian economy. That is why I said, every change in these areas is not necessarily a reform. Some of them may eventually go and hurt as far as reforms are concerned.

(Contd. by 2R/PB)

-PK/PB/2r/3.15

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (CONTD.):** I, Sir, came across a very interesting article recently and this probably is the best example anywhere in the world of structured retail. The best example of structured retail anywhere in the world is the example of milk distribution in India. Now, there was an argument given and the Commerce Minister, Mr. Sharma, was repeatedly repeating that argument that ‘Middleman will be eliminated; the benefit will automatically go to the farmer.’ Now only time will tell that in the present situation whether the benefit will go to the farmer or it will go to the retailer. There is a study conducted by the International Farm Comparison Network and this study was put into public domain by none other than the Managing Director of Gujarat Cooperative Milk Marketing, i.e., Amul. It is undoubtedly a great product as far as India is concerned. So, during this debate, he put this study into the public

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

domain and the study indicates, of milk products sold, for every dollar that the consumer pays, how much does the milk producer get in the U.S.? It is 38 per cent. In United Kingdom, for every pound which is paid by the consumer, the milk producer gets 36 per cent. What is the position in India whether it is the large cooperatives in the milk sector or some private sector which is participating there. Down to the village level, in some of the States, we see they have got chillers; they have the cold chains; they have the back-end chains. It is necessary; that's one advantage which I can see. In India, the milk producer, on a national average, gets 70 per cent; in the cooperative sector, he gets 80 per cent of the total rupees that the consumer pays. Now, here is an experiment of structured organized retail where even cold chains have been set up, where back-end chains have been set up. We have seen those large oil tanker kind of vehicles carrying milk; we have got milk trains in India. That's all a part of the back-end chain. That is part of the infrastructure domestically set up from indigenous resources. You have it in Gujarat; you have it in Maharashtra; you have it in Karnataka; you have it in Punjab; you have it in Madhya Pradesh. In several States, you have this chain and

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

therefore this is the indigenous model. Structured retail, back-end chains, etc., are all valid arguments but let us not jump for it because we know the consequences of it on both manufacturing sector and the job displacement in the retail sector. There is a lot of preparation which has to go on before you reach that destination.

Sir, you mentioned about the 2004 NDA statement. I have a series of documents with me. I need not cite all of them. When we were in Government and even though the Government was very clear that it will not bring it, what was your Party stand? Your Party raised the issue of a possibility of a FDI in retail in both Houses of Parliament and while raising it in Parliament, one of your leaders, Mr. Dasmunsi, said, 'therefore I would like to draw the attention of the Government through you, as is alleged that the multinational retailers through bureaucratic circles are continuously putting pressure on the Government — I have not described it like this; but he did — to take this anti-national decision of allowing FDI in retail.' So, your Party called it anti-national. Your topmost leaders not objected to his statement. When it was raised in the House, our Ministers immediately got up -- Mr. Shourie in the Lok Sabha and Mr. Jaswant Singh in the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Rajya Sabha -- and said, 'No; this is not being allowed.' Sir, the then Leader of the Opposition in the Rajya Sabha was writing to — I have his letter -- trade organizations, 'No; no; don't worry; it has been raised in Parliament and the Government have assured us that this is not going to be done.' So, at that time, you were very clear about it. When your Ministers in UPA-I were confronted, they said that 'that was a correct logic that we have taken; there will be job losses and therefore we are not allowing it.' There are detailed interviews by them; I have got the copies. News reports have indicated that even the UPA Chairperson cautioned the Government in 2007 by saying, 'don't do it.' Therefore, please don't say that 'you people have changed.' We were clear. It did appear as a possibility in one of the documents; but it was never implemented. But it is an issue which requires a legitimate debate.

(Contd. 2s/SKC)

2s/3.20/skc

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (contd.):** Sir, that brings me to the hard facts of where we stand in terms of the economy.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Sir, you have mentioned in your Budget Speech that the projected GDP this year would be nine per cent, 7.7 per cent in the first quarter and 6.9 in the second quarter. And, if today's numbers are an indication, in the third quarter we would be less optimistic, because it has come down. If you see today's figures in the index of industrial production, in October 2011, the decline is -5.1 per cent. So, industrial production has actually gone down. Now, if you compare this with the 11.3 per cent-plus in the corresponding month last year, your fall is really staggering. Now, these slowdowns are visible during this entire period of April to October, 2011. If you look at mining, it is -7.2 per cent; in manufacturing, in October, 2011, it was -6 per cent. So, during the entire April-October-period there was a further decline. Now, I have learnt, as a student of Political Economy, that there are some quick guesses that we make as to how the economy is going to do in the months or years to come. So, looking at sectors like capital goods, if the inflow or import of raw material into this country declines today, that means the news six months later is going to be very bad. People are not importing raw material and, therefore, industrial production is going to go down. If the inflow of



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

capital goods and manufacturing goods into the country declines today, six months from today industrial production is going to go down. I think, the most disturbing figure which has come is that in October, 2011, the capital goods component has gone down by 25.5 per cent. That is a staggering figure. For electrical, machinery and apparatus, it is -58.8 per cent; for machinery and equipment, it is 12.1 per cent, and amongst raw materials, rubber and plastics, it is -11.4 per cent; for cable and insulated rubber it is -82.9 per cent. These are figures which have come down in a staggering manner. Now, where do we stand? Talking of credit squeeze, you have increased interest rates thirteen times and capital has become so costly. Unless we reduce it, we are going to become a sluggish economy. Assuming a nine per cent growth, you had estimated an 18 per cent growth in revenue. Now, if the growth goes down and it is somewhere around seven per cent or less, then what is the spiral effect of that going to be as far as revenue is concerned? Coupled with 56,000 borrowings and the revenue coming down, what is its impact on fiscal deficit? The fiscal deficit is 4.6 per cent and may go up beyond five. Inflation would be reasonably high at all given points of time. Now, these are

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

the figures. Talking of the decline in FDI, let me say, at the cost of repetition, that in 2008 the FDI inflow was 42.5 billion; it became 35.7 in 2009. In 2010 it was 24.6 billion. Now, this is the level of business confidence in this country and this is going to come down. The second leg of this is, when people are not going to invest dollars in this country, why should Indians be investing rupees in this country? They are also going to look for more attractive markets. That is the reason why a lot of them are saying, 'let us look for more attractive investment destinations outside'. Therefore, this is really a wake up call as far as the Indian economy is concerned. As I said, the initial figures of exports which came in looked very attractive. Now, I read that one of it was a calculation error, and the other appears to be that in the IT sector, some of the exports are being inflated and there is a legitimate fear -- is Indian black money coming back into the system?

(contd. at 2t/hk)

HK/2t/3.25

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (CONTD.):** You are right, Sir, when you say how do you deal with the situation, or, as a Finance Minister you say

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

how do I deal with the situation. And you suggested that this is not a responsibility which one man alone can discharge; I need to take a lot of policy decisions; the Government needs to take it; it needs the cooperation of the Opposition and it needs the cooperation of all the States because every State manages the economy. You are absolutely right, Sir, you do need a consensus. But you just ask yourself a question: Whose responsibility is it to take initial steps to actually build a consensus? And if you ask that correct question, you come to the right answer. I don't think consensus building will be a difficult proposition. You can't have a Government -- and please pardon me for using these words -- where a section of the leadership, including the Ministerial leadership, is introvertish. We see a section of the leadership making arrogant statements in dealing with States, in dealing with opposition and in dealing with civil society. And you can see one section sulking. Let me straightaway concede that you look a very positive exception to all this. I have had the privilege of attending all-party meetings with you, and I rate you as one of the greatest honourable exceptions to what I am saying. And your communication with all of us and other political parties show this. And, therefore, if

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

the Government instead of being introvertish or sulking or arrogant adopts an attitude of consultation with the States, consultation with opposition parties, consultation with UPA partners, not informing the UPA partners, then probably you will find that the onerous task of consensus building becomes easier. Sir, may I just present an unpleasant picture? When the Left withdrew support, you decided to go ahead even though you didn't have the numbers for a vote of confidence. Nineteen Members of the Lok Sabha either cross-voted or abstained. You take an action of this kind, you crack and demolish the process of consensus building. When Members of Parliament complain that we are being paid money, your police go and arrest those MPs. Sir, these acts don't contribute to consensus building. Kindly call for the records of the highway projects which have been sanctioned. If it is an opposition-ruled State, how do we bypass the highway from there? You ask non-Congress parties -- you can ask them in Uttar Pradesh; you can ask them in Andhra Pradesh and you can ask them in Gujarat -- how CBI has been used. I have, Sir, complete record of legislations in State after State, which are ruled by a non-Congress party, where they have not been given clearance;

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

there are highways which are bypassed in opposition-ruled States; there are States which have not been given help; there are States which have not been allotted coal blocks. You know the paltry amount of power generation which takes place in Bihar and the Government is struggling to get coal blocks. It is not a private company. There are hundreds of private parties who have been given bigger coal blocks by this Government than given to the State of Bihar. These steps do not help in the process of consensus building. And, Sir, when these steps don't help in the process of consensus building, what does a big heart does? And this Government has to be big hearted, not merely a big brother. You follow this policy and you realize that the art of consensus building will be far easily possible and, therefore, once you are able to build it, some items on the agenda where there is no consensus can wait, but others you can proceed with. I know you are very honestly keen to implement the GST.

(Contd. 2u/KSK)

KSK/NB/3.30/2U

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (CONTD):** But, before you are able to implement it, or even decide it, some *bona fide* effort, not from you

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

personally, but from your Government, should be there to the States to tell them that once the GST comes in, they will be fairly treated. There is a lurking suspicion that we won't be fairly treated and we cut off our own hands, our Constitutional authority and hand over our fiscal powers to the Centre, and the fear in the States is, "How are we going to be treated after we do that?" Therefore, you have to realise that there is a method to build a consensus and a hostile relationship with the States, a hostile relationship with the Opposition is not the roadmap to a consensus building.

Sir, I now come to the final point of what I have to say. I mentioned in the opening part that you require a Government with leadership, with credibility. I have no personal doubts on the credibility of hon. Prime Minister. He is an honourable man. But, then, I said, "The Government needs *saakh*. It needs an *lqbal*." How does it get that? It needs leadership to achieve that. Sir, in this very House, when the Motion of Thanks was being debated early this year and the hon. Prime Minister was replying to it, on the 24<sup>th</sup> of February, 2011, while addressing me -- and, it is just ten months ago -- he said, "The whole world appreciates the management of India's economy

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

and that is the message that comes out of international meetings that I attend. I urge the Leader of the Opposition to, at least, study some of these documents and I hope he will be educated enough as a result of these documents and not to use harsh words that he used.” Sir, I have, since that day, been following very carefully the advice given to me. And, I have been following what the international media has been writing about us. Instead of finding encouraging stories, I am coming across horror stories. That is how the world is looking at us. Last week, *The Wall Street Journal* wrote an extensive review of the political and economic situation of India. I just read two sentences. It started with the sentence, “Mr. Manmohan Singh’s humiliation is complete.” And, it ended with the sentence, “Indians may hail Mr. Singh as the Finance Minister who ushered in the liberalisation in 1991, but they are coming to realise that his lack of leadership as Prime Minister has become a major obstacle to further reform”. Now, this is what the international media, a commentator in a respected journal, said. All that I am saying, Sir, is that we want our Prime Minister to be very strong. Let there be no divided authority. Let the vestige of political power be with him. The Prime Minister is the Chief Executive

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

of the world's largest democracy. Therefore, he must act with authority, and while he acts with authority and builds the roadmap to consensus, the present depressing situation and a very challenging situation that we are getting into as far as our economy is concerned, it is only then that we can meet this challenge. I thank you very much.

(Ends)

**डा. राम प्रकाश (हरियाणा) :** सम्माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, मेरे विचार में यह हमारे देश का सौभाग्य है कि हमें एक धीर-गंभीर प्रधान मंत्री का प्रशासनिक नेतृत्व प्राप्त है। आर्थिक क्षेत्र में एक बहुत अनुभवी वित्त मंत्री का नेतृत्व हमें प्राप्त है। जब वे वित्त के विषयों पर बोलते हैं, तो ऐसा लगता है जैसे स्वयं तुलसीदास, रामचरितमानस की व्याख्या कर रहे हों। इस देश को, जनमानस की आकांक्षाओं के अनुरूप एक बहुत सक्षम और सुलझी हुई महिला का राजनीतिक नेतृत्व प्राप्त है। युवा पीढ़ी की आकांक्षाओं की अभिव्यक्ति, कुछ कर गुजरने की भावना रखने वाले नौजवान नेता से हमें मिल रही है। UPA में सभी पहलुओं पर विचार करके ही राष्ट्रीय हित में नीतियां बनाई जाती हैं।

(2W/MP पर क्रमशः)

MP/2W/3.35

**डा. राम प्रकाश (क्रमागत) :** इसमें विपक्ष के जो विचार हैं, हम उनको भी पूरा महत्व देते हैं, लेकिन सलाह करना एक बात है, डिक्टेसन लेना दूसरी बात है।



यू.पी.ए. में प्रजातांत्रिक पद्धति है, तानाशाही नहीं है और हम कानून को संसद में बनाने के पक्षधर हैं। मैं उन लोगों के साथ सहमत होने में असमर्थ हूँ जो संसद में रामलीला और रामलीला में कानून बनाने की बात करते हैं।

महोदय, आर्थिक नीति पर विचार करना आवश्यक है। पैसे के appropriation के बारे में जो बिल प्रस्तुत हुआ है, मैं उसका समर्थन करता हूँ, जहां आर्थिक स्थिति पर विचार किया जाता है कि वह पैसा किस मद में कितना, किस काम के लिए व्यय हो रहा है और उसका क्या परिणाम निकल रहा है। आज प्राथमिक शिक्षा को महत्व देने की जरूरत है। ज्यादा से ज्यादा पैसा उस पर व्यय किया जाए, वह हमारे हित में है। महोदय, हमने अनिवार्य शिक्षा का कानून बनाया, बहुत अच्छा किया, लेकिन केवल कानून से काम नहीं चलता, उसके लिए आर्थिक ढांचा बनाना बहुत ज़रूरी है। आज हमारे ग्रामीण स्कूलों की जो स्थिति है, सरकारी स्कूलों की जो स्थिति है, उसकी तुलना अगर हम पब्लिक स्कूलों से करने लगे, तो ज़मीन-आसमान का फ़र्क है। इसलिए अगर उस क्षे़त्र में और पैसा दिया जाए, तो बहुत अच्छा रहेगा। आज अमीर का बेटा, किसी आई.ए.एस. का बेटा, किसी राजनेता का बेटा सरकारी स्कूल में नहीं पढ़ता। उनके बच्चे किसी और स्कूल में पढ़ते हैं और गरीब के बच्चे सरकारी स्कूल में जाते हैं। इन बातों से दो किस्म का भारत बन जाता है, इसलिए मैं यह समझता हूँ कि स्कूलों में जन-सुविधाएं, पुस्तकालय, ब्लैक बोर्ड, चारदीवारी, अच्छे अध्यापक, हर किस्म की सुविधा की जरूरत है, ताकि वहां वही वातावरण पैदा

हो जो पब्लिक स्कूलों में है और किसी गरीब के बेटे को आर्थिक तंगी की वजह से अच्छी शिक्षा से महरूम न रहना पड़े। कॉलेज की शिक्षा के बारे में यू.जी.सी. जो ग्रांट देती है, मैं समझता हूँ, कई बार उसमें ऐसा होता है कि खर्च एक अमाउंट करना होता है और उसको खर्च करने के चक्कर में कुछ ऐसे व्यय कर दिए जाते हैं, कॉलेजों को इस ढंग से ग्रांट दी जाती है, जिसका पूरा लाभ नहीं मिल पाता। आज केवल चॉक और टॉक के मेथड से colleges और universities में पढ़ाया नहीं जा सकता। आज क्लासरूम्स को मल्टीमीडिया बनाने की आवश्यकता है। विश्वविद्यालयों में जो research equipments पड़े हैं, उनकी पूलिंग की जानी चाहिए ताकि ज्यादा से ज्यादा पैसे बचाए जा सकें और उन सारे equipments की constant updating जरूरी है। हमारे जो research journals हैं, अगर उनका content अच्छा नहीं है, तो उन्हें बंद करना चाहिए, ताकि हमारे रिसर्चर अपनी रिसर्च छापने के लिए दुनिया के competition में आएँ और जो हमारा पैसा उससे बचता है, उसे बचाकर अच्छे journals के अंदर अपने अनुसंधान को प्रकाशित करें। Basic Science subjects में ज्यादा ध्यान देने की जरूरत है। केवल applied या technical education से काम नहीं चलेगा। उसका जो आधार basic Science subjects हैं, उनको इग्नोर नहीं किया जा सकता। हमें धन चाहिए, इस बात के लिए भी कि जो अति पिछड़ा वर्ग है, भूमिहीन लोग हैं, जिनमें कुम्हार, सुनार, लोहार, जांगड़ा, धीमान, पांचाल, मनिहार, धोबी, पिंजा, बहुत सी बिरादरियां शामिल हैं, उनके पास भूमि नहीं है। उनका बच्चा खेती नहीं

कर पाएगा, उनको कोई व्यवसाय चाहिए। उन्हें पैतृक व्यवसाय करने के लिए भी आज जो ट्रेनिंग चाहिए, उसकी जरूरत है। उसके लिए अगर इनके बच्चों को उसी तरह polytechnics में और engineering colleges में सरकार सहयोग देकर मुफ्त शिक्षा प्राप्त करने का मौका दे, तो मैं समझता हूँ कि यह बहुत उपयोगी होगा। मैं इस बात को इसलिए कहना चाहता हूँ कि गांव का एक कुम्हार मिट्टी के बरतन बनाता था। अपने गधे के ऊपर सामान लादकर वह बाजार में आकर बेचता था। गांव तक सड़क जानी चाहिए थी। महोदय, सड़क के माध्यम से किसी देश की संस्कृति का विकास होता है।

(2X/SC पर क्रमशः)

-mp/sc/3.40/2x

**डा० राम प्रकाश (क्रमागत) :** लेकिन उसके साथ उसका जो पैतृक व्यवसाय था, वह समाप्त हो गया। उसको वैकल्पिक व्यवसाय चाहिए। इसी तरह एक कहार पानी ढोकर अपने बच्चों का पेट पालता था। गांव में पानी की टंकी आयी, पानी आया, आना चाहिए था, तरक्की के लिए निहायत जरूरी था, लेकिन उसका व्यवसाय चला गया, उसके लिए कोई वैकल्पिक व्यवसाय हो, ऐसी बात नहीं हो पायी। इसलिए जो अति पिछड़ा वर्ग है, जो भूमिहीन लोग हैं, जो अपने पैतृक व्यवसाय को अच्छी तरह आज के स्तर के मुताबिक बनाना चाहते हैं, उनके लिए टेक्निकल एजुकेशन की सुविधा प्राप्त हो, यह बात भी मैं कहना चाहता हूँ। इसके

साथ-साथ हमें धन चाहिए, स्वास्थ्य सुविधाओं के लिए। आज सरकारी अस्पतालों की स्थिति वह नहीं है जो प्राइवेट अस्पतालों की है। आज इस सदन ने बहुत दुख भरी भावना के साथ कोलकाता में सरकारी अस्पताल में जो कुछ हुआ है, उस पर अपनी संवेदना प्रकट की है, उन लोगों के साथ अपनी भावनाएं जोड़ी हैं। आपको अनेक सरकारी अस्पतालों की ऐसी हालत देखने को मिलेगी। उनके अंदर अगर हम सुविधाएं दें, उनका आधुनिकीकरण करें तो मैं यह समझता हूं कि आम आदमी को अच्छी सुविधा प्राप्त करने का जो हक बनता है, उसे वह सुविधा प्राप्त हो सकती है। महोदय, बड़े लोग, धनवान लोग अच्छे-अच्छे प्राइवेट अस्पतालों में जाकर अपना इलाज करा लेते हैं, इसलिए उन्हें इस बात की दिक्कत महसूस नहीं होती, लेकिन जो आम आदमी है, वह जब किसी सरकारी अस्पताल में जाता है, तो उसे बहुत सी बातों की दिक्कत होती है। सरकारी अस्पताल का डॉक्टर उस पर लिख देता है कि यह टेस्ट फलां जगह से कराइए, यह टेस्ट दूसरी जगह से कराइए। अगर वे सारी सुविधाएं सरकारी अस्पताल में हों तो आम आदमी को उस सुविधा का लाभ हो सकता है। महोदय, हमें धन चाहिए, गांव के लिए। आज गांवों को निर्मल गांव बनाने की जरूरत है। जिन गांवों को निर्मल ग्राम का पुरस्कार दिया भी जाता है, उनके अंदर भी हमें इस बात का निरीक्षण करने की जरूरत है कि क्या वे उसी स्थिति में रहते हैं या उनके निर्मल होने में थोड़ी गिरावट आ जाती है। आप गांव में जाकर देखेंगे कि पानी की निकासी की समस्या है। गांव के अंदर पानी के गड्ढे बने रह जाते हैं, वे बाहर नहीं

निकल पाते। पहले गांव के बाहर जोहड़ होता था, उसके अंदर सारा पानी चला जाता था, लेकिन आज बढ़ती हुई आबादी की वजह से वह काम रुक गया है। आज गांवों को भी वही सुविधाएं चाहिए जो बड़े-बड़े शहरों को मिली हुई हैं। आखिरकार वे भी भारतीय नागरिक हैं, उनको भी हर किस्म की सुविधा चाहिए। इसलिए इस क्षेत्र में भी अधिक धन की जरूरत है। धन जरूरी है, स्लम फ्री भारत बनाने के लिए। मुझे इस बात को स्वीकार करना पड़ेगा कि जहां अमीर बस्तियां हैं, उनमें डोमेस्टिक हेल्प के तौर पर उनकी बगल में गरीब बस्तियां उभर आती हैं, लेकिन उन गरीब बस्तियों की सुविधाओं का कोई कम से कम स्तर तो रहना ही चाहिए। आज जो इस तरह की अनआथोराइज्ड कालोनीज़ हैं, उनमें टेढ़ी-मेढ़ी गलियां हैं, जहां देखो वहां झोपड़ियां हैं, गंदगियों के ढेर हैं। उसके अंदर लीपा-पोती करके काम नहीं चल सकता, थोड़ी-थोड़ी ग्रांट देकर काम नहीं चल सकता। योजनाबद्ध तरीके से इन स्लम्स को उठाकर, इनकी जगह नयी बस्तियां बनाने का प्रयास करना चाहिए, ताकि उन लोगों को भी वही आधुनिक सुविधाएं प्राप्त हो सकें, जो शहर के लोगों को मिलती हैं। महोदय, जहां मैं इन डिमांड्स का समर्थन करता हूं, जो माननीय वित्त मंत्री महोदय ने रखी हैं, वहीं एक-दो सुझाव देकर अपनी वाणी को विश्राम देना चाहूंगा। मैं यह समझता हूं कि आर्थिक खर्चों के ऊपर कंट्रोल की बड़ी आवश्यकता है। आज जितनी स्कीमें बनती हैं, उनका परिणाम यह निकलता है कि ऐडमिनिस्ट्रेशन टॉप हेवी होता चला जा रहा है। उन सरकारी अफसरों के वेतन, सफर भत्ते आदि पर दिन-रात अनावश्यक

खर्च बढ़ता है। हमें इस बात की तरफ ध्यान देना चाहिए। कोई योजना बनाने से पहले हम इस बात का विचार करें कि जो आम आदमी काम करने वाला है, इसका लाभ उसे पहुंचेगा या बड़े सरकारी अफसर को पहुंचेगा। मैं यह बात भी कहना चाहता हूं कि संसद के सदस्यों के पास जो एमपीलैड फंड है, अगर उससे वे अपने नगरों की हालत सुधारने के लिए स्पेशल स्वीकृति लेना चाहिए, तो उन्हें वह स्वीकृति मिलनी चाहिए।

(2वाई-एमसीएम पर क्रमशः)

MCM-KR/2Y/3-45

**डा० राम प्रकाश (क्रमागत) :** जैसे हमारा कुरुक्षेत्र एक एतिहासिक शहर है, दुनिया के तमाम लोग वहां आते हैं। लेकिन जी०टी० रोड, जहां पीपली है, वहां से लेकर कहीं भी आगे तक चले जाओ, कोई ऐसी चीज नहीं दिखाई देती जो उसे महाभारत के साथ जोड़ती हो। मैंने एक विचार यहां प्रस्तुत किया था कि कम से कम 10-15 महाभारत कालीन दृश्यों के या महाभारतीय महापुरुषों के आदमकद मैटल के बुत सड़क के किनारे लगे हुए हों, जिससे उभर करके उसका स्वरूप आए और दुनिया के लोग देख पाएं कि यह है वह नगर, जो महाभारत और गीता की याद दिलाता है। मैंने उसके लिए यह सुझाव दिया था कि अगर मुझे अपना एम०पी० लैड फंड उस काम के लिए इस्तेमाल करने की अनुमति दी जाए तो मैं उसे सहर्ष करने के लिए तैयार हूं। जो काम जो पैसा

आपसे अलग लिए बिना, सरकार के खर्चे के ऊपर बोझ डाले बिना चल सकता हो, वह करने की हमें इजाजत मिलनी चाहिए।

इसी तरह हमारे कुरुक्षेत्र के रेलवे स्टेशन को एक मॉडल रेलवे स्टेशन बनाने की बात की गई थी। लेकिन आप वहां जाकर देखें, जो हालत प्लेट फार्म की है, जो हालत वहां जनसुविधाओं की है, जो हालत वहां और दूसरी सुविधाओं की है, उसे देखकर रोना आता है। दो साल से हम इस उम्मीद में बैठे हैं कि वह मॉडल रेलवे स्टेशन बनेगा। हम लोग जो उस क्षेत्र के हैं, अगर हम अपने एम0पी0 लैड फंड में से वहां कुछ सुविधाएं प्रदान करना चाहें तो मैं यह समझता हूं कि सरकार को अपनी नीति में कुछ फ्लेक्सिबिलिटी लाकर ऐसा कार्य करने की अनुमति देनी चाहिए। दूसरे लोग भी इसी तरह अपने-अपने क्षेत्रों में काम करा सकते हैं।

**(उपसभाध्यक्ष (डा0 ई0एम0 सुदर्शन नाट्टीयप्पन) पीठासीन हुए)**

महोदय, माननीय वित्त मंत्री द्वारा प्रस्तुत एप्रोप्रिएशन बिल का मैं भरपूर समर्थन करता हूं। मैं यह समझता हूं कि आज के आर्थिक हालात में जिस तरह वित्ता मंत्री महोदय, इस गाड़ी को चला रहे हैं, देश को तरक्की के रास्ते पर ले जा रहे हैं, वह हम सब के लिए बहुत बड़े गर्व का विषय है।

महोदय, आपने मुझे बोलने का समय दिया, मैं आपके प्रति हार्दिक धन्यवाद करता हूं।

(समाप्त)

**श्री गंगा चरण (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** धन्यवाद महोदय। सरकार ने एप्रोप्रिएशन बिल पेश किया है। वैसे तो हम सरकार का समर्थन भी कर रहे हैं, लेकिन हम इस बिल का इसलिए विरोध कर रहे हैं कि उत्तर प्रदेश के विकास में सरकार ने जो अस्सी हजार करोड़ रुपए की डिमांड की थी, इन्होंने उसमें हमको कोई मदद नहीं की। महोदय, खास तौर से मैं किसानों के बारे में जिक्र करना चाहता हूँ। इन्होंने फर्टिलाइजर पर सब्सिडी खत्म करके और नियंत्रण-बेस्ड सब्सिडी बनाई थी, उससे किसानों को कोई लाभ नहीं मिला। इस सब्सिडी के बारे में इन्होंने कहा था कि किसान एग्रीकल्चर अधिकारी के यहां एक एप्लीकेशन देगा कि वह इन-इन चीजों, नाइट्रोजन, पोटाश का यूज कर रहा है और किस बेस पर कर रहा है। जब वह अधिकारी उसको सर्टिफाई करेगा तब उसे यह सब्सिडी मिलेगी। इससे भ्रष्टाचार को बढ़ावा मिलेगा। जब वह अधिकारी पैसा ले लेगा, तब वह सर्टिफिकेट देगा और तब वह किसान के एकाउंट में जाएगा। किसान को जो डी0ए0पी0 पांच सौ रुपए में मिलती थी, आज वह बाजार में प्राइवेट कम्पनियों द्वारा ग्यारह सौ रुपए में उपलब्ध कराई गई। इसी तरह जो यूरिया 280 रुपए प्रति बैग मिलता था वह प्राइवेट कम्पनियों द्वारा 450 रुपए प्रति बैग खरीदना पड़ा। आज दूसरा सबसे बड़ा घृणित काम इस सरकार ने यह किया है कि हमने उत्तर प्रदेश के लिए खास तौर से जितने फर्टिलाइजर की सप्लाई की मांग की थी, उसकी आधी सप्लाई की है और वह भी लेट दी है। इससे किसानों को भारी नुकसान हुआ है, एक तो उनको सब्सिडी का लाभ नहीं मिला है,



सेकंड, जो सप्लाई दी है वह बहुत कम दी है, जिससे किसानों में मारा-मारी भी हुई। चूंकि इनकी नीयत साफ नहीं है, यह किसानों के ऊपर राजनीति कर रहे हैं। आज यह सत्ता हासिल करना चाहते हैं कि जो गैर कांग्रेसी सरकारें हैं, चाहे वह उत्तर प्रदेश की हो, मध्य प्रदेश की हो, छत्तीसगढ़ हो या बिहार की हो, उनकी लेग पुलिंग कर रहे हैं कि उनको कैसे बदनाम किया जाए।

(2Z/GS पर क्रमशः)

GS-MKS/2Z/3.50

**श्री गंगा चरण (क्रमागत):** अब ये नहीं समझते हैं, लेकिन किसान सब समझने लगा है। किसान इतना बेवकूफ नहीं है। अब वह यह समझता है कि डीएपी कहां से मिलती है, यूरिया कहां से मिलता है। खादों का इम्पोर्ट होता है और जब फर्टिलाइजर समय से नहीं मिलेगा, समय से फसल नहीं बोयी जाएगी, गेहूं की बुवाई समय से नहीं होगी, मटर की बुवाई समय से नहीं होगी तो आने वाले दिनों में खाद्यान्न की कमी होगी, उत्पादन कम होगा तो महंगाई और बढ़ेगी। आज गरीब किसानों और मजदूरों के ऊपर राजनीति हो रही है। उनका हक छीनकर राजनीति हो रही है। उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा आपके माध्यम से सरकार से अनुरोध है कि कम से कम वह किसानों और गरीबों के ऊपर राजनीति न करे। वे कहते हैं कि कांग्रेस का हाथ गरीब के साथ, कहीं कहते हैं कि कांग्रेस का हाथ आम आदमी के साथ। इनके इस तरह के बड़े-बड़े पोस्टर लगे हुए हैं। मुझे नहीं लगता है कि कांग्रेस का हाथ गरीब के ऊपर है, गरीब के साथ है या किसान के

साथ है। अभी आने वाले दिनों में आप देखेंगे कि जिस तरह की इनकी उर्वरक नीति है, उसका परिणाम यह होगा कि डीएपी तीन हजार रुपये प्रति बैग बिकेगा और कम से कम दो हजार रुपये प्रति बैग यूरिया बिकेगा। क्योंकि अभी इन्होंने प्राइवेट कम्पनियों से कहा है कि धीरे-धीरे दाम बढ़ाओ और धीरे-धीरे किसानों को मारो। आज किसान सरकार की गलत नीतियों के कारण आत्महत्या करने के लिए मजबूर है। आप किसान को तबाह करना चाहते हैं। एक तरफ डीजल के दाम बढ़ा रहे हैं, उर्वरक खादों के दाम बढ़ा रहे हैं, कीटनाशक दवाओं के दाम बढ़ा रहे हैं और दूसरी तरफ किसान के गेहूं का दाम सिर्फ 10 रुपये प्रति क्विंटल बढ़ाते हैं। पिछले दस साल में दस-दस रुपये करके गेहूं के दाम बढ़ाये गए हैं। लेकिन डीजल और पेट्रोल के दाम हर दो-तीन महीने में बढ़ जाते हैं। इस बार बाजार में कीटनाशक दवाइयों की बहुत शार्टेज रही जिसके कारण कीटनाशक दवाइयों की दुकानों पर किसानों की लम्बी कतारे लगी रहीं, क्योंकि इनका वास्ता तो किसानों से नहीं है, इनका वास्ता तो उन घरानों से है जिनके पास देश की दो-तिहाई दौलत है। कांग्रेस पार्टी 8 हजार घरानों का नेतृत्व कर रही है जैसी की अभी हिन्दुस्तान टाइम्स में खबर छपी थी कि देश की दो-तिहाई दौलत देश के मात्र 8 हजार घरानों के पास है। इनका हाथ उन 8 हजार घरानों पर रहता है कि उनको कोई नुकसान न होने पाये। उनकी दौलत कैसे बढ़े, वे दुनिया में नम्बर एक पर कैसे पहुंचे ? देश का गरीब और किसान नम्बर वन पर कैसे पहुंचे इसकी इनको चिंता नहीं है। हमारे उद्योग मंत्री जी बैठे हैं, वे बातों में

मशगूल हैं। कांग्रेस के भाई बातों में मशगूल हैं, वे हमारी बातों को सुन नहीं रहे हैं।  
उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आप जरा..। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्रीमती विप्लव ठाकुर :** आप कहिए हम आपकी बातें सुन रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री गंगा चरण :** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, जो सुन रहे हैं, उनके पास कोई अधिकार नहीं है। जिनको सुनना चाहिए, वे सुन नहीं रहे हैं। सर, मेरा कहना है कि यदि सरकार किसानों को रासायनिक खाद उपलब्ध नहीं करा पा रही है, उस पर कंट्रोल नहीं कर पा रही है, तो वह कम से कम आर्गेनिक खेती को बढ़ावा दे। आप आर्गेनिक खेती को बढ़ावा क्यों नहीं देते हैं ? इससे ग्लोबल वार्मिंग भी रुकेगी, इससे क्लाइमेट चेंज भी रुकेगा, इससे जमीन का स्वास्थ्य भी ठीक होगा। जब जमीन का स्वास्थ्य ठीक होगा, तो मनुष्य का स्वास्थ्य भी ठीक रहेगा। जैविक खेती और आर्गेनिक खेती हमारी पुरानी परम्परा रही है। हमें गोबर की खाद, हरी खाद और vermin compost को बढ़ावा देना चाहिए। मैं एक महत्वपूर्ण बात यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि यदि हमने आने वाले दिनों में आर्गेनिक खेती को बढ़ावा नहीं दिया तो जिस तरह आदमी रासायनिक दवाओं को खाकर खोखला हो गया है, उसके शरीर में साइड इफेक्ट के कारण अनेकों तरह की बीमारियां पैदा हो रही हैं, जिसके कारण वह शक्तिहीन हो रहा है - हम रोज अखबारों में विज्ञापन पढ़ते हैं कि शक्तिशाली दवा खाइए - शक्ति बढ़ाने के लिए दवा खाइए, यही हालत जमीन की हो रही है। रासायनिक खादों के अत्यधिक उपयोग के कारण हमारी जमीन बंजर होती चली जा रही है, वह ऊसर होती

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

चली जा रही है, वह शक्तिहीन होती चली जा रही है, वह रोगी होती चली जा रही है, वह अस्वस्थ हो गई है। उसमें आज जो उत्पादन होता है, उससे लोगों को कैंसर हो रहा है, उससे लोगों का ब्लड प्रेशर बढ़ रहा है, उससे 40 परसेंट लोगों को शुगर हो रही है। मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि सप्लीमेंट्री डिमांड्स फॉर ग्रांट में 13778 करोड़ रुपया इन्होंने कृषि में उर्वरक खादों की सब्सिडी के लिए दिया है, यह पैसा सीधे किसान को मिलना चाहिए।

(3A/ASC पर जारी)

ASC-TMV/3.55/3A

**श्री गंगा चरण (क्रमागत)** : आप पहले कहते थे कि हम किसानों को डायरेक्ट सब्सिडी देंगे, आपने डायरेक्ट सब्सिडी कहां दी है? मैं कहता हूँ कि किसान के खाते में 5 हजार रुपए पर एकड़ डायरेक्ट सब्सिडी देनी चाहिए, ताकि किसान का भला हो सके। आप कहते कुछ हैं और करते कुछ हैं। आप जो कहते हैं, वह कभी करते ही नहीं हैं।

महोदय, मैं Standing Committee Rural Development का सदस्य हूँ। आपने *मनरेगा* चलाया और इसके लिए बजट में 40,000 करोड़ रुपए का प्रावधान किया। इसके तहत दस लाख लोगों के job card बने हैं। इसमें एवरेज प्रति व्यक्ति मजदूरी 120 रुपए है। यदि दस लाख लोगों को सौ दिन का काम दिया जाए, तो 1,20,000 करोड़ रुपयों की आवश्यकता पड़ेगी। आपने इसके लिए केवल 40,000 करोड़ रुपए दिए हैं। इसका सीधा अर्थ है कि आपकी मंशा

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

दस लाख लोगों को सौ दिन का भी काम देने की नहीं है। आप देश के गरीब मज़दूरों को गुमराह कर रहे हैं। यदि आप उनको सौ दिन का काम देना चाहते तो बजट में 1,20,000 करोड़ रुपए का प्रावधान करते। मैं स्टैंडिंग केमेटी का मेम्बर हूँ और मैं जानता हूँ कि यह पैसा भी गरीबों तक नहीं पहुंचता है। उत्तर प्रदेश को *मनरेगा* की दूसरी किश्त आज तक भी नहीं भेजी गई है। हमारी नेता बहन माया कुमारी ने कहा है कि मज़दूरों को सौ दिन का काम नहीं, बल्कि 365 दिन का काम मिलना चाहिए। यदि आप उनको सौ दिन काम देंगे, तो क्या मजदूर 265 दिन भूखा रहेगा? उसके घर का चूल्हा 265 दिन कैसे जलेगा? जो एससी,एसटी के लिए स्पेशल कम्पोनेन्ट प्लान का पैसा था, आपने पांच हजार करोड़ रुपया कॉमन वेल्थ गेम्स में लगा दिया। आपने कहा था कि हम इसको वापस कर देंगे, लेकिन आपने अभी तक एससी,एसटी का वह पैसा वापस नहीं किया है। इससे लगता है कि आपकी मंशा सीधी नहीं है और आपका दलितों, पिछड़ों, किसानों और मज़दूरों से कोई वास्ता नहीं है। आपका गरीबों से कोई वास्ता नहीं है। आप गरीब विरोधी हैं, किसान विरोधी हैं, दलित विरोधी हैं और पिछड़ा विरोधी हैं। आप गरीबों के घर में चटनी रोटी खाकर, उनको बहलाना चाहते हैं ....(समय की घंटी).. और उनको बेवकूफ बनाना चाहते हैं। ....(व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E. M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):**

Kindly address me. (Interruptions)...

**श्री गंगा चरण :** आप थोड़ा अनुशासन रखिए। ... (व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E. M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):**

You address me. (Interruptions)...

**श्री गंगा चरण :** सर, मैं आप से ही कह रहा हूँ।

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please conclude.

**श्री गंगा चरण :** सर, इन्होंने अपने घोषणापत्र में लिखा था ... (व्यवधान).. सर, कांग्रेस के घोषणापत्र में है कि हम छोटे राज्यों के पक्षधर हैं। जब हमारी नेता बहन कुमारी मायावती ने उत्तर प्रदेश का विभाजन करके छोटे-छोटे राज्य बना दिए, तब इन्होंने कहा..... (व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Your time is over.

**श्री गंगा चरण :** ठीक है, सर। जब प्रस्ताव भेज दिया और प्रधान मंत्री जी को पत्र भेजा गया, तो ये कहते थे कि पत्र से क्या होता है, आप विधान सभा से प्रस्ताव पारित करके भेजिए, तब विचार किया जाएगा। हमने बुंदेलखंड प्रांत, हरित प्रांत, पूर्वांचल, अवध प्रांत बनाकर और दोनों सदनों से बहुमत से वह प्रस्ताव पारित कराके भेज दिया है। हमारी नेता बहन मायावती ने जो प्रस्ताव भेजा है, हम मांग करते हैं .... (व्यवधान)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN :** Please kindly conclude. Your time is over.

**श्री गंगा चरण :** आप चार प्रांतों का प्रस्ताव स्वीकार करें और बुंदेलखंड, हरित प्रांत, पूर्वांचल और अवध प्रांत बनाएं। आप अपने वचन पर अडिग रहें।

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E. M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):**

Thank you so much. Your time is over.

**श्री गंगा चरण :** क्या मेरा समय समाप्त हो गया?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Yes.

**श्री गंगा चरण :** सर, अभी तीन मिनट और बचे हैं।

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Your time is over. (3B/LT पर आगे)

VK-LP/3B/4.00

**श्री गंगा चरण :** सर, मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि ..(व्यवधान)..बुंदेलखंड में ..(व्यवधान)..आप कहते हैं कि 7400 करोड़ का स्पेशल पैकेज दिया, आपने जनता को बेवकूफ बनाया। जब मैंने एक सवाल पूछा तो पता चला कि मात्र 860 करोड़ रुपये दिए। सर, कहां 7400 करोड़ रुपये और कहां 860 करोड़ रुपये? आप पूरे देश में ढिंढोरा पीटते हैं, लेकिन यहां तो ऊंट के मुँह में जीरा मात्र दिया है। अब बुंदेलखंड की जनता जान गई है कि आप उन्हें बेवकूफ बना रहे हैं। सर, हम मांग करते हैं कि बुंदेलखंड प्रांत बनाया जाए। वहां जब कहा गया...(व्यवधान).. कृपया करके आप तो बंद हो जाइए। जब कहा गया कि हम हर प्रांत में एम्स खोलेंगे, तो हमारी मुख्यमंत्री ने कहा कि हम आपको बुंदेलखंड में फ्री जमीन देते हैं, बुंदेलखंड पिछड़ा है, आप बुंदेलखंड में एम्स बनाइए। ऐसा करने से उत्तर प्रदेश, मध्य प्रदेश, दोनों बुंदेलखंड को लाभ मिलेगा, वहां के गरीबों को अच्छे इलाज की व्यवस्था मिलेगी। आपने कहा कि नहीं, हम रायबरेली

में ही बनाएंगे। जब रायबरेली ही उत्तर प्रदेश है, तब बुंदेलखंड याद नहीं आता है। चटनी रोटी खाएंगे बुंदेलखंड के गरीबों की और एम्स बनाएंगे रायबरेली में। जब बहिन जी ने बुंदेलखंड के विकास के लिए रेल डिब्बों का कारखाना बनाने के लिए कहा कि यह बुंदेलखंड में खोला जाए, तो कहा कि वह भी राय बरेली में होगा। जब राय बरेली ही देश हो गया है, तब और कहीं का पिछड़ापन उनको नजर नहीं आता है। मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि मैंने एक प्रस्ताव दिया था कि महोबा से राडभिंड होती हुई रेलवे लाइन निकाली जाए। तीन बार सर्वे हो गया है, अब ये उसको स्वीकार करें, ये कुछ तो बुंदेलखंड को दें। मैं बुंदेलखंड का रहने वाला हूं, वहां डाकूग्रस्त इलाका था। आज बहिन जी ने सारे डाकू साफ कर दिए, लेकिन वहां के पलायन को रोकने के लिए, गरीबी को रोकने के लिए, वहां का विकास जरूरी है..(व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please sit down.

**श्री गंगा चरण :** सर, प्रधानमंत्री सड़क योजना में उत्तर प्रदेश को कोई पैसा नहीं दिया है। सब जगह आठवाँ प्लान चल रहा है, दसवाँ प्लान चल रहा है, लेकिन उत्तर प्रदेश में तीन साल से कोई पैसा, फूटी कौड़ी भी नहीं दी है। आज मेरा बिजली की सप्लाई का प्रश्न था। मुझे थोड़ा गुस्सा आया, मेरा प्रश्न नहीं आ पाया। सर, उत्तर प्रदेश को 5000 मेगावाट बिजली मिलनी चाहिए। इन्होंने कोटा तो दिया है, लेकिन आज तक कभी कोटा पूरा नहीं किया। 3000 और 4000 मेगावाट से ज्यादा बिजली की सप्लाई नहीं होती है, फिर भी हमारी नेता अपना प्रॉडक्शन



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

करके किसानों को 18 घंटे बिजली दे रही हैं। इसी तरह से कोल ब्लॉक में सप्लाई..(व्यवधान)..वह भी भारतीय जनता पार्टी ने उठाया। हम तो कभी-कभी इनकी बात कर देते हैं, लेकिन हम कहते हैं कि उत्तर प्रदेश का क्यों नहीं करते हैं? उत्तर प्रदेश में कोल ब्लॉक भी नहीं दे रहे हैं। कोयला नहीं देंगे, तो हमारी जो परियोजनाएं हैं, जिनसे बिजली उत्पादन हो रहा है, वे बंद हो जाएंगी। सर, ऐसा जान-बूझकर कर रहे हैं। जहां इनकी सरकार बनी, इन्होंने शपथ ली की हम भेदभावरहित काम करेंगे। सर, मंत्री यही शपथ लेते हैं न कि वे दुर्भावनारहित काम करेंगे? यह ब्रीच ऑफ ओथ है, ये अपनी शपथ का उल्लंघन करते हैं, ये भेदभावपूर्ण काम करते हैं। ये उन प्रदेशों की सरकारों में ऐसा करते हैं। इनकी निगाह खास तौर से उत्तर प्रदेश पर है। सर, ये नहीं जानते हैं कि ये आयरन लेडी से टकरा रहे हैं। उत्तर प्रदेश से टकराओगे, बहिन जी से टकराओगे तो चूर-चूर हो जाओगे, पता नहीं चलेगा। ये एक दलित महिला, दलित की बेटी से टकरा रहे हैं। ये दलित की बेटी से टकरा रहे हैं और कहते हैं हम दलितों की पार्टी..(व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):**

Please conclude. Your time is over.

**श्री गंगा चरण :** दलितों की पार्टी हैं..(व्यवधान)..आप एक दलित महिला को, गरीब महिला को परेशान कर रहे हैं। आपको उत्तर पच नहीं रहा है..(व्यवधान)..

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

शुक्ला जी, आपको पच नहीं रहा है.(व्यवधान)..आप यह समझ लीजिए कि बहिन जी से टकराओगे, पूरे देश में आपको जो दलित वोट देता था, आपको उसके लाले पड़ जाएंगे, कांग्रेस का सफाया हो जाएगा। पचास साल से दलित के वोट पर राज कर रहे हो, बहिन जी से टकराओगे.(व्यवधान)..आज उत्तर प्रदेश , मध्य प्रदेश, राजस्थान और पूरे भारत में सफाया हो जाएगा .(व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN:** Please sit down. Nothing is going on record. Please sit down.

**श्री गंगा चरण :** हम आपका समर्थन भी कर रहे हैं, फिर भी आप हमारी टाँग खींच रहे हैं.(व्यवधान)..हम समर्थन भी कर रहे हैं, फिर भी आप टाँग खींच रहे हैं। आप फिर भी हमें परेशान कर रहे हैं, इसीलिए मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि मत टकराओ। अभी हमारी रैली हुई थी, उसमें लाखों की भीड़ थी, 18 तारीख को फिर रैली होने जा रही है, फिर लाखों की भीड़ होगी। है किसी की ताकत? इतनी बड़ी-बड़ी रैलियां.(व्यवधान)..आज प्रदेश का दलित.(व्यवधान)..प्रशासन .(व्यवधान)..बहिन जी के साथ है, इसलिए मैं आगाह करना चाहता हूँ कि हमारा पैसा हमें पूरा दे दीजिए, वरना परिणाम ठीक नहीं होंगे। आने वाले चुनाव में जनता सबक सिखा देगी। जो प्रांत निर्माण नहीं करेगा.(व्यवधान)..बुंदेलखंड प्रांत नहीं बनाया.(व्यवधान)..जमानतें जब्त हो जाएंगी। इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ मैं समाप्त करता हूँ। धन्यवाद। (समाप्त) (3c/akg पर आगे)

RG/4.05/3C

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, in his introductory remarks, the hon. Finance Minister said that it is an opportunity to look back at the economy. At the beginning of my speech, I would like to inform that the World Economic Situation and Prospects 2012, released by the United Nations in December, 2011, notes that there was growth slowdown of the world economy from four per cent in 2010 to 2.8 per cent in 2011, warning that the risk for a double-dip recession had heightened. This has not been said for developed countries alone. This important Report has also mentioned that the economic growth is also projected to slowdown in the developing countries of Latin America and Asia, including Brazil, China and India, in 2012. In this perspective, with this Report having come, I would like to know as to what plan the Government is preparing to protect our nation from the double-dip recession which is likely to occur throughout the world, including the developing countries of India, Brazil and China, more so, our country. It is an opportunity to look at the economy of our country.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

When we look at this second batch of Supplementary Grants, -- I am not in a position to quote data now — it is a fact that it has stood the approval for additional expenditure for the current year. The same thing happened in last August. If we add up the two additional expenditures, this will be more than Rs.70,000 crores, which is five per cent more than the Budget Estimates. I am not against this Supplementary Allocation. But it is a hard fact that income is less and borrowing is more. So, the situation is that the Government is relying on the borrowed money in both the tax sectors, direct and indirect taxes, and collection is trailing behind, as was estimated. So, the market borrowing is increasing. What is the present scenario of the Indian economy? There is a decline in infrastructure growth. It is the slowest in the last 31 months. Revenue deficit has shot up three-fold in six months. We are already seeing the economic slowdown. Sir, according to the Sixty-sixth Round of the NSS, what is the condition of employment? It shows a dramatic decline in total employment. Non-agriculture employment fell from 4.65 per cent to 2.53 per cent, despite the operation of the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme. Sir, employment is not increasing in

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

any sector. It is decelerating in all the sectors. So, this is the present situation. One of the indicators of our economy is the condition of farmers, and the Government is not in a position to consider the suggestion of the Swaminathan Committee Report. Now, what is the growth? It is three per cent during the Eleventh Plan. We have not met the four per cent target. Right from the Ninth Five Year Plan, until now, we have been trailing behind in our targets.

(Continued by 3D)

3d/4:10/ks

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN** (contd.): Since long, there has been no public investment in agriculture. What has been the result of that? The result has been the rising cost of inputs. My friend earlier mentioned that everybody knows the price of urea and DAP in rural areas. It is not the question of price alone. It is not available in the market. It is now available even in the black market. The farmers have been suffering and, on the other hand, we have non-remunerative prices of crops whether it is paddy, sugarcane or jute. So, on the one hand, there is high input cost, high cost of pesticides

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

and, on the other, you have non-remunerative prices of crops. Moreover, so far as seeds are concerned, good, certified seeds are virtually not available. It is because of all these reasons that, since 1995, more than 2.5 lakh farmers have committed suicides. What has caused this turmoil? The reason is that the Government has followed a neo liberal policy which has driven the farmers into distress. This is one of the important indicators of Indian economy today. Take price rise. Last time, in this very House, price rise was discussed in a big way; it was discussed at length. I am not going into all the points. But we feel we must repeat our suggestion again. We are not in a position to forget it; the roll back of fuel price hike is very much necessary. Secondly, control fertiliser prices by enhancing the subsidy. Thirdly, stop forward trading. Fourthly, universalise public distribution system. Otherwise, it is not possible to control the price rise in our nation. People are not in a position to get food at cheaper rates. I come to the tax problem. I am astonished to see this. In 2009-10 how much tax was foregone and for whom? According to the Government records, taxes to the tune of Rs. 5.02 lakh crores were foregone. Percentage-wise, it was 7.59 per cent of the total tax

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

collection. It was mostly in favour of corporate and affluent classes. You had foregone tax collection for these people but you could not give any fertiliser subsidy for the farmers or universalise the PDS. You give concessions to big people, those who are tax defaulters. I feel it is a crime and an offence on the part of the Government. That is why there has been this deterioration in the Indian economy. Sir, take fiscal deficit target. The economy is slowing down. I have already said that. Sir, inflation has remained high. I must say that the approach should be to change the policy. Do not get obsessed with the fiscal deficit target of 4.5 per cent. It has been discussed many times. Learn from the developed economies. Austerity measures have worsened the situation of unemployment and poverty. For that reason, 'Occupy Wall Street' incident has happened in New York. It is not limited only to New York. It is happening across 1500 cities of the world.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):**

Please conclude.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN:** Step up expenditures for improving the conditions of the poor working class, provide funds for employment generation and rural development.

I come to my last point. Talking about taxes, the Standing Committee on Finance had made a recommendation in this regard, and I quote from that Report, "The Government should review the present regime of tax exemption and deduction, which is obviously loaded in favour of the corporates and big tax payers at the expense of small tax payers and the salaried class".

(cd. by kgg/3e)

3e/4.15/kgg

**SHRI MOINUL HASSAN (contd.):** My main speech depends on that philosophy—save the common people, save the hundred crore people, those who are working in the villages and small towns; your intention should not be to save the corporate people, the affluent people; save the common people, living in the remote corners of the country. This should be our attention. For that reason, people vote for you. This is the serious condition of the Indian economy. We should



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

stand up and take proper action. Otherwise, this situation will get further deteriorated and we should stop it.

With these words, I thank you.

(Ends)

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (BIHAR):** Sir, thank you very much for giving me this opportunity.

Sir, this debate has been initiated by the Leader of the Opposition; he has dealt with some of the more far-reaching issues which affect the present configuration and the conjuncture in which this debate is taking place. On Friday afternoon, the hon. Finance Minister circulated the mid-year analysis of the economy to the Lok Sabha, which I had an opportunity to read over the weekend. Even a cursory reading of this mid-year analysis makes a rather sombre reading. Sombre, in spite of every diplomatic skill which has been used by the Cornell and Pristine trained economists to put a bit of a spin on where some of the more negative features of the economy has been highlighted.

I will bring to your attention, Sir, what I believe are some of the six critical issues which the Finance Minister may like to consider. The

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

first and foremost, Sir, the Leader of the Opposition had already brought to our notice that the Finance Minister needs to work out a new path of fiscal consolidation. It is clear that the target of the Thirteenth Finance Commission is off-track. The target which he accepted for himself in the Budget, of 4.6 per cent, is off-track. I am not a fiscal fetishist in the traditional sense of what fiscal economists are. But, clearly, the centre piece of any macro-economic management is the credibility of the path of fiscal consolidation.

What is the path of fiscal consolidation? Sir, this report brings out that the revenue sluggishness in the first half of the year has been entirely attributed to refunds which have been given and to sluggish amount of what has been realised from disinvestment. Both these, Sir, are not likely to be reversed because the growth trajectory has come down significantly, notwithstanding the compensation effect of non-refunds in the last half of the year, and the fact that this is not an opportune time to pursue disinvestment programme in a credible way gives us reasonable reason that 4.6 per cent may become 5 per cent, or may be even higher. Perhaps, there is no escape from it. But, then,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

we need to be assured of a new path of fiscal consolidation to which the Finance Minister would like the country to focus.

My second point, Sir, is that even while this report was being printed, this report has become obsolete! Because, the chapter which they have on financing of the external sector on the balance of payments, clearly is no more valid considering that the export growth has been over-stated in this document by 8 to 9 billion dollars and, therefore, the real current account deficit exceeds 3 per cent. The financing of a 3 per cent current account deficit needs serious consideration if macro-economic management is to be maintained. I must commend the Reserve Bank of India that they are not unduly using the reserves which we have, which are quite robust in trying to defend an unrealistic exchange rate.

(Contd. by tdb/3f)

TDB/3F/4.20

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD.):** Because, clearly, I do remember, Sir, that during the Asian Crisis, if you recall, Thailand had a reserve of 67 billion dollars in the time of the Asian Crisis. That was quite large for a country of the size of Thailand. But in order to defend an artificial

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

exchange rate, they ran down their reserves, Sir, in four to five months' time. We are cautious of not making that same mistake, and the Reserve Bank is no doubt acting with prudence in not trying to defend an artificial exchange rate of the rupee. But, nonetheless, Sir, a current account deficit of 3.1 per cent of the GDP requires a plan for financing the current account deficit, which the market will accept.

My third, Sir, important point is that looking at the fact that the contribution of agriculture to GDP has come down substantially, and that the contribution of the services sector, Sir, which continues to be exceedingly robust, but the lagged effect of a recession in Western markets is bound to affect the services sector, and we willy-nilly, will therefore, need a plan in the short run of reviving the manufacturing sector. That is, Sir, linked with employment; that is linked with GDP growth; that is linked with poverty alleviation. Therefore, Sir, what is the short term plan? In the long term plan, fortunately, Sir, they have come out with a National Manufacturing Policy. Regrettably, there is no implementation plan which is attached to that National Manufacturing Policy. There is no credible policy on labour; there is no credible policy on land; there is no credible policy on environment.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Merely to come up with the wish of a National Manufacturing Policy will not improve the manufacturing sector, at least, in the short run. So, that requires, Sir, a short term plan of what can be done to really revive the manufacturing sector to improve the GDP numbers.

My fourth point, Sir -- and I will hurry as soon as possible -- is that what are the steps that the Finance Minister has in mind to reverse the declining rates of growth of GDP because you may come down to the new Hindu rate and settle down not at 3 per cent Hindu rate of growth, but that new Hindu rate of growth for India could be something like five to six per cent rate of growth. What is to be done to get us out of this five to six per cent conundrum, to, at least, climb on to seven per cent? I know, the exogenous circumstances are not favourable, the internal circumstances are also difficult, but, Sir, look at the real sectors of the economy. In the morning, we realised that the power sector is in a colossal mess. Not necessarily because the Power Minister has not been efficient or effective but coal has declined. Telecom is in a difficult shape; power is in a difficult shape, Sir. So, what are the concrete steps to be taken by the Government? Civil Aviation, Sir, is nearly in a shut down stage. There is no credible

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Civil Aviation Policy because the cost of aviation fuel is too high, the cost of landing charges are too high, the sales tax is too high. You do not have, Sir a credible Civil Aviation Policy. So, what are the policies for structural changes in the economy which can set the economy back to where we were a six to seven per cent rate of growth?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):**

Your time is up.

**SHRI N.K. SINGH:** Finally, Sir, I think, I will just end with one last point. Sir, I submit to you that this is the last time that this House will have the opportunity to focus on the economy; next time will only be the Budget. I wish to draw the hon. Finance Minister's attention to Part II of this Statement, which has been placed before us. That, Sir, you will also find, I am sure, of interest. That, Sir, is the Status of Implementation of Major Budget Announcements. The Annexure I, Sir, does a remarkable job, of listing out, in the left-hand column, what were the Budget announcements, and in the right hand column, what has been the compliance. I wish to submit to you, Sir, that the quality of compliance and the quality of what has been said here is something which is laughable. I will just give two examples, Sir, and then sit

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

down. What did the Finance Minister, for instance, say? He announced that there would be an enhancement of subvention of interest rates on loans to farmers by three per cent. That really meant that the loans to farmers would come down by three per cent of those who have made a prepayment. What does the Mid-term Appraisal say? It merely says that a Note for approval of the Cabinet has gone, which is still awaiting the Cabinet approval. One year down the line, we have not been able to reduce interest rates to farmers by three per cent, which you had promised in the Budget.

(Contd. by 1g-kl)

KLS3G-4.25

**SHRI N.K. SINGH (CONTD):** You had promised of strengthening the NABARD capital base by infusion of Rs.3000 crores. What does the Sr. No. 41 in the Entry say? 'Cabinet proposal is still awaited and is pending'. Finally, there are so many things, on page 101 of this, there was a promise in the Budget of issuance of Tax Free Bonds of Rs.30,000 crores. What does the proposal say? It says, 'a proposal is being formulated for the consideration of the Department of Expenditure.' I really do believe, Sir, that the quality of compliance,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

one year down the line, to the promises made by the Finance Minister needs to be substantially improved. Finally, I will end up by saying this that I realize that extraordinary circumstances are not favourable, the room for fiscal manoeuvre is exceedingly limited, economic growth has platted down to what I call the new Hindu rate of growth, we are in the downward trajectory on unemployment. Empirical studies have revealed that a one per cent decline in GDP leads to a two per cent increase in unemployment and decline in wage rates. We need, Sir, a credible plan how to put the economy back on track by addressing some of the issues which you have been indulgent enough to listen to bring to the notice of the hon. Finance Minister. Thank you.

**(Ends)**

**SHRI RANJITSINH VIJAYSINH MOHITE-PATIL (MAHARASHTRA):**

Thank you very much, Sir. After listening to the informative speech by Shri N.K. Singh Sahib, I have only a few suggestions to make. Sir, 65 per cent of our population lives in rural India. I am standing here to support the Bill. I have only some suggestions, questions or queries. Sir, we are coming across the problems of rural India as well as urban India. The problems are not going down. They are going up day by



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

day. Sir, the main point of rural economy is the water management system. If we have proper irrigation system, the people living on agriculture will be satisfied and, at the same time, the number of people moving to urban India will also be reduced because the problems will be solved at the village level itself. Sir, I would submit that the Government had thought of two-three major projects and one of them, which has been implemented, is the Golden Quadrilateral Express Highways. In the same way, if we take up the project of Inter-State water linking, it will be a major step. If this is taken up, issues can be solved at both the ends, in the rural and urban areas as well. As we are witnessing climatic changes and as we are seeing farmers committing suicides, in addition to many other concerns, the main concern is water. If this is taken up at a large level, many of such problems can be solved. Though it is not an issue for the Central Government, but I would submit that my State Maharashtra has taken up the work of maintaining the land records. In 1931 in Maharashtra the British Government had done the work on land records and land mapping systems. The State Government of Maharashtra has taken up this issue. If the funds are allotted and the Central Government

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

considers this issue of maintaining the land record of agricultural land, governmental land, defence land, forest land, etc., that problem will be sorted out. As we know much of the administrative cost, as we know, is related to land records.

(Contd by 3H/SSS)

SSS/3H/4.30

**SHRI RANJITSINH VIJAYSINH MOHITE-PATIL (CONTD.):** The cases start off with land records and so the administrative cost is more because of land record and pending cases. If that is solved, the land record is maintained, many of the socio-economic problems of the village will be solved and many of our administrative cost will be taken care off because of the maintenance of land records. At the same time, Sir, to improve employment, as we have seen and as everybody is looking at, the heritage properties, the monumental properties with the State Government and the Central Archeological Department has to be maintained. As in Maharashtra and in many of the States, we have the best of monuments and the best of heritage properties but if they are taken care, naturally the employment generation will grow. The population of tourists coming to India is 30 lakhs and population

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

going outside is almost 55 lakhs. So, tourism can be developed inside the country and employment generation can be done after doing a major makeover of the heritage and monumental sites. Sir, I would like to give my submission that to cut down the drop outs in schools, if toilet facilities for girls are given then, the drop outs would be cut down and that would give a healthy educational system and a healthy young India. Finally, Sir, I would like to give my submission. There is a scheme that we can take up. If direct donation has to be done, it can be done to the villages. A committee can be formed with the help of *Sarpanch*, the officers at the Taluka level; officers at the district level and a director at the village level. He can be monitored. There will be accountability and transparency and the donor knows that whatever he has donated has been implemented and he gets tax evasion and if he gets a tax benefit out of that, he is not donating for the purpose of tax but he can donate and he will be accounted and there will be transparency that whatever he has donated is accounted and village development can take place as Mahatma Gandhi has said, 'Go back to the villages.' People want to go back to the villages. They want to go back to their roots. They want to give donation but there is no

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

proper format or system. If Government thinks of these new ideas, naturally, we can have a healthy economy. Thank you.

(Ends)

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA (ODISHA):** Sir, I rise to oppose this Motion. I don't feel that this Government deserves to be given a single rupee in vote in this House not only because what Mr. Jaitley said here or Mr. N. K. Singh said but about the economic performance or the economic indicators. That is a lot. A whole lot taken together is presenting such a situation as on today that we are silent spectators to the economy scuttling down towards recession. This Government was admired for having fought the recession when the rest of the world was reeling under recessionary pressures. But, today the same Government because of leadership crisis, because of divisive tendencies within itself is not able to really manage the economy and letting it get out of hand and this sole 120 crores of population will suffer because of the Government. Why should it be? I will not go into the economic or financial issues any more. My own opposition is also based on this Government's lack of loyalty to a

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

federal structure to which it is wedded by virtue of taking a Constitution oath.

(Contd. by NBR/3J)

-SSS/NBR-NB/3J/4.35.

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA (CONTD.):** It has neglected the States which are not governed by Congress or UPA partners. This morning my party walked out of this House because there is discrimination in giving us funds. There are 19 backward districts in Odisha, out of 250 in the country, and we have been given Rs. 340 crores a year. Suddenly because something happens within the UPA, you are giving more money to a particular State! You give Rs. 8,000 crores to Bengal. So, you also give us Rs. 8,000 or Rs. 7,000 crores or Rs. 6,000 crores to us. We don't mind. Give money to Jharkhand and Chhattisgarh which are much more backward. In the backward category, Odisha, Jharkhand and Chhattisgarh are together. Why do you discriminate? Why do you not honour the federal structure? All the States should be treated equally. Besides, you have been discriminating against non-Congress, non-UPA States in matters of flood grants. There have been repeated heavy floods in Odisha this

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

year. Your team has gone, it has recommended for financial assistance, your Minister went there and made very favourable noises. But, not even a single rupee has been given till now against the demand Rs. 3,300 crores.

Then, look at the BPL. Your National Advisory Council's Member, Shri N.C. Saxena, goes there and says that 84 per cent of people from Odisha should be under the BPL category. Sir, Suresh Tendulkar gives another figure, though a lower figure but much higher than what you are prepared to give. And, you say that you want to fix it from here! Fix it! Is it fixing? Do you fix the number of poor people? They are either poor or not poor. Your commitment should be to see that every poor family in this country becomes a viable family. Commitment has to be to the family, to poor families, not to rich or help in creating 8,000 billionaires.

This morning the issue of coal blocks was raised. It was also raised how the States have been discriminated against. Now, may I ask you one question? If you say that coal, as a resource, belongs to the nation; yes, it does. So, why wheat, as a resource, should not belong to the nation? We don't grow wheat. Give us a portion of

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Punjab and Haryana where we grow wheat. If somebody from Maharashtra can go and dig for coal in my State, I should also be allowed to go and cultivate wheat in Punjab or Haryana. You are not recognizing the poor people. They are not outside the country; you are not dealing with the other side of the international border. Sir, for poor people, poverty should be the only criterion for giving any special package or declaring a State as a Special Category State. You had some justification at that point of time -- after Independence -- because the North-East was in turmoil and there was some difficulty in J & K. So, we declared those States as Special Category States and the criterion was different. Today that criterion should not be there. It should be poverty, poverty and poverty. And, poverty should be taken as the criterion for declaring a State as a Special Category State. We, in Odisha, Jharkhand and Chhattisgarh, do not want your mummifications either. On power and ore, we must have 50 per cent of the value. Today, you are giving it all away -- Rs. 7,000 crores per tones of iron ore.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN):**

Time is over, Sir.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA:** I will take a minute, Sir.

Sir, on Rs. 7,000 worth of iron ore, Rs. 350 is spent by the mining lessee. Before 2009 we used to get just Rs. 27 per ton and rest you gave away to the mining lessee. You must know the reasons behind this. Now, we get 10 per cent and about Rs. 6,000 is the profit of the mining lessee. The people of these areas are not with you. The mining lessees are with you. That is the only conclusion that I can draw. Thank you.

(Ends)

(FOLLOWED BY USY "3K")

-NBR-USY-MP/3K/4.40

**SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I rise to support the proposal. But I have some reservations on other aspects. The point is that while you have potential, you are not collecting as much total Direct Taxes as we should have collected, for the simple reason that there is no tax on dividend, there is no tax on estate. I don't mind saying that giving some impetus to the investment, you do give some impetus to the investors. The United States still has Estate Duty, which has been there for about 100 years. So, it is a normal process.



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

I understand -- I may be wrong, but I read it in a magazine — that we have a tycoon in India whose dividend income is between Rs. 4000-5000 crores and he does not pay even a single paisa of tax; whereas if a man, who belongs to the BPL category, smokes a branded *bidi* or strikes a cigarette, he pays excise duty on both. So, it looks rather regressive in a progressive system of ours that a man, belonging to the BPL category, pays tax just to light a *bidi* and whereas a big gentleman who earns thousands of crores of rupees does not pay any tax. I may not be sure of the veracity, but I have read it in a magazine. So, there is some problem in the tax structure. We should make the tax structure a little more progressive. Now, it is almost second decade of our new liberal economic policy and we must be able to do that. So, it is through the direct taxation by including the people who can pay and exempt the people who have problem to pay, I think, some element of balance could be restored. That apart, I would like to submit that we had some problem in Bengal and the Government of India has been very gracious to give us some support. But you must understand the problem of Bengal. The new Government of West Bengal has got an outstanding debt liability of rupees two lakh crores.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Therefore, we are in a very difficult situation to make both ends meet. I have no objection to our friends in Orissa, Chhatisgarh, Jharkhand, getting what they want. But our position is slightly different. If we have one State with Rs. 70,000 crore debt burden and another State with Rs. 2,00,000 crore debt burden and if the latter is given some preference, that is not discrimination. Of course, we are grateful to the Government of India that it did it. The only point I would like to make is that I would fervently request the Government of India to have a re-look at the fiscal taxation policy to make taxation a little more progressive than what it is today. That may help in raising more revenue and we may not have to go to the market for getting more money.

Thank you very much.

(Ends)

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि** : आपको जो पैकेज दिया गया, वह ...(व्यवधान)... के कारण दिया गया या फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर के कारण दिया गया? ...(व्यवधान)...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (डा. ई.एम.सुदर्शन नाच्चीयप्पन)** : पाणि जी, कृपया बैठिए।  
...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री महेन्द्र मोहन (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी ने जो Appropriation Bill रखा है, उसके संबंध में मैं इतना ही कहना चाहता हूँ कि लीडर ऑफ अपोज़िशन ने बहुत डीटेल में बहुत सारी बातें कहीं। हमारे साथी एन.के.सिंह साहब ने भी बहुत डीटेल में कहा, लेकिन इसके साथ ही साथ मैं यह भी कहना चाहूंगा कि इस फिस्कल डेफिसिट को अगर हम बढ़ाते चले जाएंगे, तो महंगाई की जो मार हमारी गरीब जनता पर पड़ रही है, वह समाप्त नहीं होगी।

**(श्री उपसभापति पीठासीन हुए)**

माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी को यह देखना होगा कि किस प्रकार हम सरकारी खर्चों में जो unproductive खर्चे हैं, उन्हें बचाएं, उन्हें खत्म करें। हमारे यहां इतना delayed decision making होता है कि ऐसे खर्चे चलते रहते हैं और जो लोग जेल में डाले गए हैं, जिन्हें मृत्यु दंड दिया जा चुका है, उन्हें जीवित रखने के लिए, सुप्रीम कोर्ट के ऑर्डर के बाद भी, हम उनके ऊपर करोड़ों रुपए खर्च कर रहे हैं।

(3L/SC पर क्रमशः)

-mp/sc-pk/4.45/3l

**श्री महेन्द्र मोहन (क्रमागत) :** क्योंकि जो पेटिशनस हैं, वे पेंडिंग पड़ी हुई हैं - चाहे वे प्रेज़िडेंट ऑफ इंडिया के पास पड़ी हों या गवर्नमेंट ऑफ इंडिया के कार्यालयों में पड़ी हों। उनके संबंध में जो भी निर्णय लेना है, लिया जाए, उन्हें छोड़ा जाना है, छोड़ा जाए, सजा दी जानी है, सजा दी जाए, लेकिन इस प्रकार से जो

अनप्रोडक्टिव खर्चे हैं, उन्हें बचाया जाए, जिनसे भारत सरकार का डेफेसिट बढ़ता है। भ्रष्टाचार एक बहुत बड़ा मुद्दा है। आज करप्शन बहुत बढ़ रहा है। जिस प्रकार से टैक्स का कलेक्शन होता है - चाहे एक्साइज़ ड्यूटी हो या इन्कम टैक्स हो - जितना रुपया सरकार के पास एक्साइज़ ड्यूटी और इन्कम टैक्स में पहुंचता है, उतना ही रुपया पैरलल इकॉनमि में अधिकारियों के पास दूसरे माध्यमों से पहुंच जाता है। हम किस प्रकार से इसको स्ट्रीमलाइन करें, कैसे हम सिस्टम को सही करें, इस ओर ध्यान देने की बहुत जरूरत है। महोदय, टैक्स रेट बढ़ा देने से काम नहीं चलेगा, टैक्स का सही कलेक्शन हो और जो भी हमारा पेअर है, करदाता है, उसका जो एक्सप्लॉयटेशन हो रहा है, वह किस प्रकार से खत्म हो, यह देखना बहुत जरूरी है। मेरा आपके माध्यम से माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी से अनुरोध है कि हमें सरकार का इकबाल फिर से कायम करना होगा। आज कुछ ऐसी स्थितियां बन गयी हैं - चाहे इंडस्ट्रियलिस्ट्स हों, चाहे लेबर हों, चाहे नौकरीपेशा कर्मचारी हों, सबको ऐसा प्रतीत होने लग गया है कि हमारे देश में केन्द्र में कोई सरकार ही नहीं है। यह जो इकबाल समाप्त होता चला जा रहा है, यह बनना बहुत जरूरी है। अगर सरकार का इकबाल नहीं बनेगा, तो हम देश की इन समस्याओं का हल नहीं निकाल सकेंगे। आज हमारा प्रोडक्शन बराबर कम होता चला जा रहा है। महोदय, बैंक रेट्स को 13 बार बढ़ाया जा चुका है। अगर हमारी कॉस्ट ऑफ प्रोडक्शन बढ़ेगी तो हमारे एक्सपोर्ट भी कम हो जाएंगे। इसके साथ ही साथ हम यह भी देख रहे हैं कि आज जो इंडस्ट्रियलिस्ट है, जो

उद्योगपति है, जो व्यापारी है, वह यहां पर अपना रुपया इन्वेस्ट करने का सही माहौल नहीं पा रहा है। वह बाहर ले जाकर ऐक्विज़िशन कर रहा है, बाहर फैक्ट्रियां खरीद रहा है, यहां से अर्जित धन से वह बाहर कार्य कर रहा है। वह यहां पर अपनी कैपेसिटी को नहीं बढ़ा रहा है। ऐसा क्यों हो रहा है? इस पर हमें रोक लगानी चाहिए कि जो भी पैसा अर्जित किया गया है, उससे पहले यहां पर इंडस्ट्री लगायी जाए। अगर हमारे देश में इंडस्ट्री लगेगी, तभी हमारे लोगों को रोजगार मिलेगा, हम आगे बढ़ पाएंगे तथा अपने देश की गरीबी को दूर करने में सफल होंगे। हमें इसको रोकना चाहिए कि हमारा पैसा बाहर न जाए, जिसके कारण हमारी स्थिति बहुत खराब होती चली जा रही है। हम अपने उन खर्चों को काटें। हमारी जो अंतर्राष्ट्रीय साख थी, वह भी बहुत गिर गयी है। अंतर्राष्ट्रीय साख की स्थिति यह हो गयी है कि पिछले तीन-चार महीने में डॉलर के मुकाबले हमारे रुपए की कीमत 18 परसेंट गिरी है, जिसके कारण जो भी सामान हम इम्पोर्ट कर रहे हैं, उसकी लागत बढ़ रही है और उसके कारण हमारे प्रोडक्शन की कॉस्ट बढ़ जाती है, फिर हमारे एक्सपोर्ट वगैरह पर भी उसका असर देखने को मिलता है। मैं जानता हूँ कि भारत सरकार की अपनी समस्याएं हैं। कुछ ऐसे क्षेत्र होते हैं, कुछ ऐसी जगहें होती हैं, जहां पर उनको अधिक पैसा देना पड़ता है, लेकिन इसके साथ ही साथ हम उन गरीब किसानों, उन गरीब मजदूरों का भी ध्यान रखें। महोदय, मैं माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी का ध्यान कानपुर की ओर आकर्षित करना चाहूंगा जहां पर टेक्सटाइल एक बहुत बड़ा उद्योग हुआ करता

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

था। वहां सारी मिलें बंद पड़ी हुई हैं। अनेकों बार भारत सरकार ने कहा कि हम वहां पर पैकेज देंगे और उनको रिवाइव करेंगे, लेकिन वह कार्य भी अभी तक नहीं हुआ है। आज TEFCO बंद पड़ी हुई है। इसी प्रकार से सारे उद्योग उत्तर प्रदेश में मर रहे हैं। उसके और भी कारण हैं, लेकिन केन्द्र सरकार अपना जो योगदान दे सकती है, वह दे, जिससे हम उत्तर प्रदेश को आगे बढ़ाने में सफल हों। मैं माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी को बधाई देता हूं क्योंकि हमारे माननीय वित्त मंत्री प्रणब दा तो संकटमोचक हैं। जब भी यह सरकार संकट में आती है, वे उसे बचा लेते हैं और किसी भी प्रकार से बचाकर आगे निकाल ले जाते हैं। उसी प्रकार से वे उन गरीबों और मजदूरों के लिए भी संकटमोचक बनें जो महंगाई से त्रस्त हैं, जिनको दो जून का खाना भी मुश्किल से मिल पाता है। इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ, मैं आपका आभार प्रकट करता हूं कि आपने मुझे समय दिया। मैं चाहूंगा कि इन समस्याओं की ओर माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी ध्यान दें और इनका निराकरण करें। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, at a time when this House is going to pass this Appropriation Bill, I would like to raise a few critical issues which relate to our economy and future of the Nation. Sir, I think India stands at crossroads. After two decades of our economic journey on the basis of the neo-liberal economic reforms, this

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

happens at a time when the world economy is in deep crisis. The United States of America, the European Union and all developed countries are in deep crisis. Sir, it is time that the Government should look at new ways to overcome this crisis.

(Contd. by 3M/PB)

-PK/PB/3m/4.50

**SHRI D. RAJA (CONTD.):** Sir, it is not a question of good economics and bad politics. I can say, it is bad economics and bad politics. That is what is being practised by the Government. Politics and economics can never be divorced, and, in fact, economics is the best politics and politics is the best economics today. In such a situation, what we witnessed with the present Government is bad economics, bad politics.

The question is, how do we change this? This is what I am trying to raise. I agree with my previous speaker that poverty should be considered as No. 1 priority for the Government. India is a signatory to the Millennium Development Goals of the United Nations. By 2015, the world is aiming at ending poverty. Sir, I was a participant in one of the international conferences of Asian political parties. There

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

was a representative from Indian National Congress; one representative from BJP; and from CPI and CPM also, there were representatives. China could get up and declare that 'it may not be possible for China to end poverty by 2015; but China will be able to end poverty by 2020.' I do not know whether our country has that courage to declare that India will be able to end poverty and provide food and employment to all its citizens.

Sir, I have the copy of Mid Year Analysis which is given to all of us. Even many previous speakers referred to it. Here, on poverty it is said, 'It is very alarming.' The poverty line at June 2011 price level has been estimated at Rs. 965 in urban areas and Rs. 781 in rural areas. Sir, I do not think anyone in Delhi city will be able to live with Rs. 965 per year. Is it the outcome of our two decades of economic reform process? I am asking this question. It is a question of justice for the people living below poverty line or poor people. Who are these people? They are overwhelmingly the Scheduled Caste people, Scheduled Tribe people. How far is the Scheduled Caste Component Plan implemented? How far is the Tribal Sub-Plan implemented? Let us make a serious introspection. I appeal to the conscience of



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

everyone in this House, including the Government. The Government should make a study to see how best the Scheduled Caste Component Plan is implemented, Tribal Sub-Plan is implemented. Without giving priority to such Plans, how can you overcome the poverty? That is the problem which we witness today in Indian economy. The Mid Year Analysis says that the growth in manufacturing sector is very slow and employment generation is not taking place in the manufacturing sector. But I agree with what the hon. Finance Minister says in the Mid Year Analysis, 'India did very well during the first phase of the global crisis. Thanks to its strengths in prudential management of the finance sector and quick and responsive fiscal stimulus and momentary easing measures. As a result, India's growth slowdown was the shortest and least among all major economies.' If it is so, what are the financial sector reforms that we are talking about? If at all the fundamentals are sound, as our hon. Finance Minister claims, Sir, which are these fundamentals? These fundamentals are our public sector undertakings, our public sector banking industry, our public sector insurance industry. But the Government is trying to open up all these public sector undertakings,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

banks, insurance, etc., to Foreign Direct Investment? How? Why should we weaken our public sector undertakings which provide strength to our economy, which provide self-reliance to our economy? Why should we weaken it? Even today, the Insurance Bill was passed in the Lok Sabha. I do not know what will happen when it would come to Rajya Sabha. ...(Interruptions)...

(Continued by 3n/SKC)

3n/4.55/skc

**SHRI D. RAJA (CONTD.):** The entire crisis, the crisis which we witnessed in the United States ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please, conclude, Mr. Raja.

**SHRI D. RAJA:** I mean to say that the crisis that originated in the United States had originated in the financial sector. The crisis that originated in the Eurozone countries originated in the financial sector. If we go in for liberalization in the financial sector recklessly, without giving any priority to our own national interests, then the economy cannot develop; it would do badly. When we discussed price-rise, we raised several issues. When we discussed FDI in the retail sector, we raised several issues. I agree with the LoP when he talked about

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

consensus. The Finance Minister is quite an intelligent and experienced Minister in the Government. He would not take it as a consensus between the Congress and the BJP. There had been a reference to the UPA-I Government. Yes, there was the UPA-I Government and the Left Parties supported that Government from outside. There was a Common Minimum Programme. We protested when disinvestment was sought to be implemented recklessly and, in fact, we refused to cooperate with the Government when BELL was sought to be disinvested. So, we tried to protect the economy during that time. Now, in UPA-II, what is happening? I think, it is in the public sector, the banking industry and the insurance industry where Government will have to prioritize its agenda. It is time that Government goes in for a mid-term review of the economic policies and fiscal policies that it has been pursuing so far. Also, there is need for a mid-course correction. If such a mid-course correction does not take place, people will have to intervene. People will have to effect a course correction. They will do it at a political level. They will do it when elections are announced. That is what would happen. We would then have to go to the people.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please, conclude.

**SHRI D. RAJA:** So, the Finance Minister will have to soberly take the views expressed in the House, and even though it is a coalition government, the government will have to take everybody's opinion into consideration. We are all speaking for the country. We want our country's progress, our country's economy to grow, our country to prosper and people to enjoy the benefits. Now, look at the sufferings of our people, Sir. They do not have a house; they do not have a job; they live in poverty. Why should India continue with that?

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please, conclude.

**SHRI D. RAJA:** Now, the time has come when the neo-liberal economic paradigm of development needs a thorough review and a course correction is needed at this point of time. With these words, I conclude.

(Ends)

**SHRI N. BALAGANGA (TAMIL NADU):** Thank you, Mr. Deputy Chairman Sir, for giving me an opportunity to speak on the supplementary demands for grants placed here by the hon. Finance Minister.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Sir, as far as the common man is concerned, the problems continue unabated. The common people are distressed at the way this Government is functioning. I would like to dwell on some of the issues. There is all-round failure on the part of the Government, name any sector, industry, agriculture, education or power. The statistics indicate that the rate of food inflation is hovering over 18 per cent when it comes to the consumers. During the past two years, whenever there was a discussion on price rise, the hon. Finance Minister said that inflation would ease within two or three months.

(contd. at 3o/hk)

HK/3o/5.00

**SHRI N. BALAGANGA (CONTD.):** He has been saying this for the past two years. But the country has not witnessed any relief from high inflation. It continues to go up and up. One of the reasons for the rise in prices of essential commodities, all of us know, is the continuous price rise in petrol and diesel. The UPA Government from 2004 to 2011 increased the diesel price from Rs.29.30 to Rs.43.80 per litre and petrol price from Rs.41.25 to Rs.67.22 per litre. The oil companies

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

which hiked the prices are all Navratna companies. The Government is helping them at the cost of the common man. So, I request the Government to look into this seriously whether deregulation of petrol prices is good to our economy and to our people or not. Sir, there has been a continuous attack on Tamil Nadu fishermen by the Sri Lankan Navy. Though there have been assurances from the Government, no tangible action is taken. Our hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu has written many letters to the hon. Prime Minister, but no concrete steps have been taken. The fishermen issue of Tamil Nadu should not be taken as an isolated incident. Sir, I wanted to raise an important point. Tamil Nadu which was receiving 52,806 kilo litre kerosene per month, it was suddenly reduced to 44,058 kilo litre per month from June 2011. People of Tamil Nadu have been put to great hardship. Our Chief Minister has sent a letter to the hon. Prime Minister to restore the kerosene supply as it was in April 2011 and requested for the 5 per cent enhancement of the kerosene supply. Due to the mishandling of erstwhile Government in Tamil Nadu, there is acute shortage of electricity power. Our Chief Minister also

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

requested (Interruptions) to allocate 1000 megawatt from the Central pool to Tamil Nadu. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY:** What is this? ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Let him say what he wants to say.

...(Interruptions)... There is nothing unparliamentary.

...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Nothing will

go on record. ...(Interruptions)... What are you doing?

...(Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY: \***

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** It is his right. ...(Interruptions)... Please

sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

You cannot tell what subject he will talk about. ...(Interruptions)...

Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... What is this?

...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI N. BALAGANGA:** Finally, I would like to point out that due to the

mismanagement of the Government during 2006-2011, the financial

---

\* Not Recorded.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

position (time-bell) of Tamil Nadu is in a precarious condition.

Therefore, the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu, hon. *Puratchi Thalaivi Amma* has also requested the Prime Minister to kindly sanction Rs.25,000 crore as special package on the lines of West Bengal for development projects. I urge upon the Government to consider and look into the demands of our Chief Minister at the earliest. Thank you.

(Ends)

**SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I am thankful to you for giving me this opportunity to speak on this Bill. Though we have definitely most experienced Finance Minister in the world, the present Government has presented three General Budgets but none of the Budgets has tried to give any direction to our economy, not to say about the supplementary Budget.

(Contd. by 3p/MKS)

MKS-SCH/5.05/3P

**SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY (CONTD.):** The Government is not able to tame the inflation and the common people of the country are/have been suffering from high inflation and skyrocketing prices.



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Out of the additional expenditure proposed, 93 per cent is for non-Plan expenditure whereas a meagre four per cent is for creating durable capital assets; hence, 96 per cent is for revenue expenditure only.

Of the Supplementary Demands of Rs.63,180 crores, only ten per cent, i.e. Rs.6,330 crores, is proposed to be met through increased revenues while the rest 90 per cent will have to be necessarily borrowed. Thereby, it can have two undesirable consequences -- (i) increased in high interest rates, leading to higher inflation and (ii) sucking the liquidity from the market, thereby reducing the funds' availability for investments. This eventually will lead the private sector to postpone the capital assets' investments, which will automatically stagnate the Government revenues, and with continuous rise in non-Plan expenditure, the revenue and fiscal deficit will further rise and the country will be caught in the vicious circle of lower growth and rising fiscal deficits and Government debt.

We need to guard ourselves against such uncontrolled growth in public debt so that our country does not face the serious default

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

situation as we have been seeing in the case of Greece, Italy and Spain.

To guard against this, I have two suggestions. If the Government is seeking supplementary grants in December, it means that a twelve months' budgeted expenditure has been spent within eight months. Why should only the expenditure increase at all times? If the revenue is not growing and growth in some categories of expenditure is inevitable, why shouldn't the Government plan and reduce expenditure under other heads well in advance, instead of approaching the Parliament for Supplementary Grants at the last minute?

The budgeted expenditure, this year, was over Rs.12 lakh crores. In making budgets for all large projects, it is a general practice that five per cent we normally keep as contingencies. Why not we start following the practice of keeping five cent as contingency for each head? And, thereby, it can be monitored in a better manner for avoiding this kind of last minute approaches.

The other subject is, we all know that agriculture is the backbone of our economy and about 70 per cent of the people are

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

engaged in agricultural activities. But this Government, for some or other reason, has not been able to do anything for the agriculture sector substantially.

There is no sustainable credit policy for the farmers and the cases of farmers' suicide are/have been continuing. The main reason for farmers' suicide is lack of credit, high rate of interest, non-availability of credit in time, and lack of other infrastructural facilities, though the Government has done so many studies for the infrastructure. Of course, State Governments are not in a position to provide any required benefits, financially, to the farmers. Thereby, a national fund is required to be created to address the problems of farmers. ... (Time-bell) ...

Even after 64 years of Independence, it is visible that governments after governments have been taking all actions only keeping in view to attract the voters and we are not able to develop any sustainable, long-term solutions.

Sir, I feel, now the time has definitely come to work with cooperation and coordination, and particularly, we have got an opportunity to learn lessons from the various mistakes already

committed by the so-called developed countries and we need not repeat those things. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

(Followed by TMV/3Q)

PSV-TMV/3Q/5.10

**श्री राजनीति प्रसाद (बिहार):** महोदय, सबसे पहले मैं आपको धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ कि आपने मुझे बोलने का मौका दिया है।

महोदय, मैं इस बिल का समर्थन कर रहा हूँ, लेकिन मैं दो-तीन सवाल करना चाहता हूँ। आपने दो-तीन साल पहले 'मिड-डे मील', 'नरेगा' और 'सर्वशिक्षा अभियान' में बहुत पैसा खर्च किया। आपने सारी योजनाओं को इधर-का-उधर रखा, लेकिन इन पर ज्यादा पैसा खर्च किया। कई सारे विद्वान साथियों ने यहाँ भाषण किया है। मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि आपको इन योजनाओं की utility कितनी हुई और आपको कितना फायदा हुआ है? बच्चों का droup-out कितना घटा है या बढ़ा है, आपने इस पर भी विचार किया है या नहीं? सर्वशिक्षा अभियान में बच्चों को कैसी शिक्षा मिल रही है? क्या उनको चपरासी वाली शिक्षा मिल रही है, बड़े बाबू वाली शिक्षा मिल रही है या आई.ए.एस. वाली शिक्षा मिल रही है? इस पर भी आपको विचार करना पड़ेगा। मिड-डे मील में आपने करोड़ों रुपए लगाए हैं। आपको यह देखना पड़ेगा कि बच्चों को जो मिड-डे मील मिल रहा है, वह सही मिल रहा है या गलत मिल रहा

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

है, क्योंकि यहाँ पर utility of money का सवाल उठता है। अगर utility of money के बारे में आप विचार नहीं करेंगे तो फिर टैक्स का मार्जिन बढ़ाना पड़ेगा और unutilised money का कोई फायदा नहीं हो रहा है, उसके बारे में आपको बहुत समस्या होगी। मैं इन तीन विषयों पर आपका ध्यान आकृष्ट करना चाहता हूँ तथा इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ। धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

**श्री उपसभापति:** अहलुवालिया जी, वैसे आपकी पार्टी का समय तो समाप्त हो गया है, लेकिन आपको supplementary grants की तरह समय दिया जाता है।

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (JHARKHAND):** Hon. Deputy Chairman, Sir, while initiating the debate, hon. LoP spoke in detail on the Appropriation (No.4) Bill, 2011 and on the state of the economy. I am on a limited issue.

Sir, Sikkim is a small State. The merger of Sikkim took place in 1975. Prior to the merger the Sikkim ruler had maintained a register of his subjects, and prior to the merger, many Indian citizens from the mainland, especially, Bengalis, Biharis and Marwaris had settled there to pursue trade and other professions, and permanently settled there. In the Finance Act of 1989 the Government of India provided for exemption under section 10 of the Income Tax Act, 1961 of the income

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

from Sikkim Lottery of Sikkim Government appointed agents who were residents of Sikkim State by inserting clause 26AA. It reads as under and I quote :

“26AA. Any income of a person by way of winning any lottery, the draw of which is held in pursuance of any agreement entered into on or before the 28<sup>th</sup> February, 1989 between the State Government of Sikkim and the organising agents of such lottery where such person is resident in the State of Sikkim in any previous year.”

Sir, I am giving an example of lottery. I am not a supporter of lottery. But I am giving an example of income tax exemption in the case of lottery in Sikkim. In the Finance Act of 2008, for the first time, the Government, in the matter of giving exemptions under section 10 of the Income Tax Act, 1961 chose to make a discrimination between the Indian citizens whose names were registered in the Register of Sikkim Subjects and the Indian citizens residing in Sikkim prior to 1975 but did not opt to register themselves as Sikkim Subjects because that would tantamount to dual citizenship and violation of Indian law. That was prior to 1975. They have not registered themselves. But after that in the new clause 26AAA inserted in section 10 of the Income Tax

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Act, 1961 through the Finance Act, 2008, it is stated and I quote:

(Contd. by 3R/VK)

VK-VNK/3R/5.15

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (CONTD):** It said, "26 (AAA) in case of individual, being a Sikkimese, any income which accrues or arises to him (a) From any source of the State of Sikkim; or (b) By way of dividend or interest on securities provided that nothing contained in this clause shall apply to a Sikkimese woman who, on or after the 1<sup>st</sup> day of April, 2008, marries an individual who is not a Sikkimese".

Even they have deprived a woman also. If she marries a non-Sikkimese, she is also deprived of this. They have deprived all the non-Sikkimese from this exemption. The point is, the non-Sikkimese Indian citizens residing in Sikkim have been making fervent appeals for the end of this discrimination but of no avail so far.

My Leader concluded his speech by saying that the Government should come with a big heart. There is a difference between big heart and large heart. This decision in the Finance Act has been taken by a large heart. Big heart is generous and humble, but large heart is a disease. If your heart enlarges, you become a heart patient. The

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

hon. Finance Minister may recall that on 19<sup>th</sup> October in the Economic Editors' Conference one question was asked to you. There you said, "Yes, I am aware of the problem; I am addressing the issue". Sir, my point is, they are very small in number, but they are deprived of their rights. They are part of Sikkim. They are proud Sikkimese. They are proud that they are the people of Sikkim. But they are deprived of all these rights. This should be withdrawn immediately so that justice can be done to the people of mainland who had settled prior to the merger, before 1975.

Apart from this, I would like to submit that recently we have seen natural calamity, a serious earthquake. The people and the Government were expecting good amount of money for rehabilitation of Sikkim. But the amount given by the Government of India from the Natural Calamity Fund is not sufficient. I hope you would be generous. You should also give money with big heart to this tiny Himalayan State, which is the only organic State, pollution free State. We should be proud of that. You must come out to help that State and send more relief and rehabilitation material so that they can come



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

forward again. With these two submissions, I conclude. Thank you.

(Ends)

**श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि:** महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी से अनुरोध करता हूँ कि उड़ीसा को special package दिया जाए और EPF का interest rate नहीं घटाया जाए। ... (व्यवधान)...

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (NOMINATED):** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I thank you for allowing me to participate in the discussion on the Appropriation (No. 4) Bill, 2011. Before I say something on the Appropriation Bill, I must share my pleasure with this House and compliment and congratulate the Government for taking the stand at the United Nations Climate Change Conference. I was privileged to be the Member of that Parliamentary Delegation along with the Minister, Shrimati Jayanthi Natarajan.

**SHRI S.S.AHLUWALIA:** The whole House should compliment the Minister. She got a standing ovation. She is the youngest Minister. While expressing the views of the Government of India, she got a standing ovation there for her articulation. It is a matter of pride.

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR:** Ahluwaliaji, I am making this point.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

**SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA:** The whole House should support this.

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR:** She had spoken about the Government's stand in unmincing words that as regards climate change the responsibility of the developing countries would be with equity and differentiated responsibility. As it was mentioned just now, 135 nations gave a standing ovation despite the differences. This is one of the greatest achievements of the UPA Government. I want to put this on record.

(Contd. By 3S)

RG/5.20/3S

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (contd.):** I just want to mention two or three issues. One, obviously, is inflation. I find that sometimes there is confusion. In the entire debate on inflation, there is failure to distinguish between economics of inflation and political economy of inflation. There are no two opinions in this House or anywhere in the world that inflation affects poor people adversely by encroaching upon their purchasing power. But, nevertheless, what is the dynamics of inflation? What is the process of inflation? There is inflation in a static economy and inflation in a dynamic economy. If this distinction is not

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

made, then, we shall be beating around the bush. And, I would submit that inflation, is essentially a result of mismatch between demand and supply. Between 2004-05 and 2010-11, the average annual rate of growth of Indian economy was about 8.5 per cent, which is unprecedented. This is despite the global economic and financial crisis of 2007-09 and India is the only country, other than China, to experience such growth scenario. I congratulate the Government for making it possible. When I hear that the Government does not have the infrastructure policy, that it does not have the monetary policy, that it does not have the financial policy, that it does not have the social policy, I sometimes wonder whether the Government is just operating on behalf of the Newton's First Law of Gravitation, that it is working on forces from outside. Are all these continuous growth rates of 8.5 per cent — it is even now 6.9 per cent — happening in the absence of any kind of economic policy on the part of the Government? I, absolutely, find it difficult to agree. This impressive growth rate has been made possible due to the prompt stimulus measures taken by the Government and the Reserve Bank of India that protected the economy from global financial crisis.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Undoubtedly, the money injected in the economy through the stimulus packages contributed to the building up of inflationary pressures in the economy. In fact, a closer examination of the inflationary process in the Indian economy would reveal that it could very well be traced to the counter-cyclical measures adopted by the Government to overcome the global financial crisis. If global economic crisis had not been dealt with by the counter-cyclical financial measures, the Indian economy, as Mr. N.K. Singh was mentioning, would have been at the lower rate of growth than at the higher rate of growth, that is, six per cent. Following the commitment to inclusive growth in the Eleventh Five Year Plan, the UPA Government has initiated several flagship programmes such as Mahatma Gandhi NREGA Scheme, Bharat Nirman, NRHM and housing schemes for the poor. It is unprecedented that from 1<sup>st</sup> April, 1951 till the Eleventh Five Year Plan, the Eleventh Plan was a turning point in India's economic history where 60 per cent allocation of resources, amounting to Rs.14.45 lakh crores for the first time, have been allocated for the social sector. Sir, I am closely aware of the shortcomings and anomalies in some of these things including some corruption. And I would urge upon the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Government to rectify these anomalies and improve their implementation for better results. But is it right to under-estimate the importance of these schemes and dismiss them which, for the first time, are helping the rural poor in a substantial manner? I shall just mention one such scheme. Under the MGNREGA Scheme alone, nearly 4.5 to 5 crore poor, rural labour households are annually getting employment. In the financial year 2010-11, more than 5.3 crore households got employment through 50 lakh works that generated 250 crore person days' employment. What is gratifying, more than 50 per cent of the workers are belonging to the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, and a substantial number of them being women. This is, basically, inclusive growth. I heard the earlier speeches of my respected colleagues on this, without any reference to inclusive growth. We are discussing micro fundamental economy; we are discussing the growth trajectory; we are discussing infrastructure. But ultimately for what? Ultimately, the growth purpose is not to alleviate poverty of the members of the Planning Commission and Members of Parliament for disrupting Houses again and again. Basically, economic growth is for alleviating poverty and distribution to

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

the poor people. I was talking about dynamics; increase in money supply is an importance source of inflation. In a growing economy, money supply is bound to increase.

(Continued by 3T)

3t/5:25/ks

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR** (contd.): Between 2008-09 and 2010-11, the money supply increased by about Rs. 1,20,000 crores. Between 2009-10 and 2010-11 alone, it increased by about Rs.89,000 crores. Between 2009-10 and 2010-11, bank credit to commercial sector increased by Rs.2,67,000 crores. The Budget for 2010-11-12 has provided Rs.3,75,000 crores towards agricultural credit alone. In this context, what is completely lost sight of — again, we are not talking of money supply — is what is called in monetary economics as the velocity of circulation of money in a growing economy that tends to rise, which also equally contributes to the inflationary pressures. Sir, this is the dynamics of inflation in a growing economy so far as the demand side is concerned.

During the last four to five years, the Government has been continuously raising the Minimum Support Prices. Each and every

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

political party, day-in-and-day-out, is swearing on the interests and welfare of the farming community. What happened to the procurement prices during the last six-seven years? Let me quote. Between 2004-05 and 2010-11, the Minimum Support Price of paddy (common variety) was raised from Rs.560 to Rs.1000 per quintal. For this year, that is, for 2011-12, it has been further raised by Rs.80 to make it Rs.1080 per quintal. This constitutes a 90 per cent increase over 2004-05. This has been happening with respect to all major agricultural crops. During this year, for instance, the MSP for Urad dal and other pulses has been increased to about Rs.3400 per quintal. Isn't it a fact that all political parties unanimously swear in the name of the farmers and demand higher Minimum Support Prices? Is it not elementary economics that increase in the MSPs would contribute to a rise in open market prices of the agricultural commodities? Sir, Dr. Ashok Mitra, in his classical work on *Terms of Trade and Class Relations*, has demonstrated for econometric modelling that whenever you are raising prices you are providing signal to the market and the market follows the Minimum Support Prices. In no economy

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

in the world you can have immunity from the rise in open market prices once you raise the MSPs.

But, Sir, what is extremely important is that in order to control the prices, the RBI has taken protective measures and during the last nineteen months it has raised the rate thirteen times and it has, to some extent, affected the rate of growth. But having followed it closely, I understand that even by raising the repo rate thirteen times during 19 months, the RBI has not allowed the rate of growth to be substantially affected. Sir, times are changing very fast in the global economy. So far as the Indian economy is concerned, the cumulative effect of these changes is that the rupee is depreciating very fast. I urge upon the hon. Finance Minister that this is not only making our imports costlier but with the growing intensity of imports, the exports are affected. This would adversely affect the trade balance and ultimately widen the current account deficit. I, therefore, suggest that the RBI should make appropriate intervention in the matter.

Sir, coming to inflation proper, the Wholesale Price Index of food inflation has moderated to 6.8 per cent in March, 2011 after reaching 20 to 22 per cent in February, 2010. Of its two components, primary



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

food inflation touched the historic high of 21.85 per cent in February, 2010 and, thereafter, declined to 9.41 per cent in March, 2011. Manufactured products also showed a similar trend. I compliment the hon. Finance Minister for taking some measures to contain the prices of essential commodities that included select food items on exports and futures trade in food grains, zero import duty on select food items, import of pulses and sugar by public sector undertakings, distribution of imported pulses and edible oils, through public distribution system, and release of higher quota of non-levy sugar. In addition, the State Governments were empowered to act against hoarders of food items, by holding in abeyance the removal of restrictions on licensing, stock limits and movement of food articles under the Essential Commodities Act, and so on.

Sir, prices of petrol, diesel and kerosene are seriously affecting inflation and they are extremely sensitive and no expert knowledge is required to spell out the impact of rise in their prices on the overall structure of the cost of production in the economy and how they fuel the cost-push inflation.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Sir, coming from the teaching profession myself and not being a politician *per se*, I refrain from making political points and yet I am constrained to mention that in April 1988 when NDA first formed the Government, the price of crude oil in the international market was 12.50 dollars per barrel and, in May, 2004, when NDA was voted out of power, it rose to 36.25 dollars per barrel.

(contd. at 3u/kgg)

3u/5.30/kgg

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (contd.):** Despite such overall stability in the international crude oil prices, the available information shows that the NDA Government increased the prices of petrol 21 times and that of diesel 24 times! I would like to quote from the Economic Times of 28<sup>th</sup> June, 2008: “The Vajpayee led NDA regime, which increased fuel prices gradually throughout its tenure, went scot-free even as it raised prices of PDS kerosene and diesel by 258 per cent and 110 per cent respectively. The UPA government, on the other hand, tried to shield people till the fag end of its five year term, that is, 2008-09, and felt penalised for keeping prices of PDS kerosene unchanged and raising the price of diesel by only 60 per cent

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

in its regime.” This was despite the fact that during the first four years of the UPA-I the international oil prices had increased by 203 per cent. I thank the Government for rolling back the recent rise in petrol prices and for showing concern towards the *aam aadmi*.

Sir, now having said this, I would like to make the following suggestions for the consideration of the hon. Finance Minister. I am democrat to the core because I believe in the right of criticism. That is why I do not believe in the authoritarian Government; I do not believe in any kind of dictatorial Government. But, when I hear the criticism without any kind of concrete alternative suggestions to the Government, I fail to understand the entire purpose of the debate. I would make now specific quick suggestions, regarding the inflation control, to the Government, to the hon. Finance Minister, before I come to two-three rather important points.

Sir, it is a fact that during the last 15 years, Indian agriculture is suffering from crises. During the last 10 years, more than 2 lakh farmers committed suicide. This is the culminating result of the sustained agrarian crisis. On 4<sup>th</sup> May, 2010, in my maiden speech, I had mentioned that continuously during the last 15 years, the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

investment in agriculture, as a proportion of GDP, is declining. This is the major crisis which is responsible for the demand and supply gap.

Sir, pulses form the most important protein component for the poor. They cannot afford meat, egg and fish. What worries me is the fact that per capita net availability of pulses per day during the decade 1951 to 1960, the first decade after Independence, was 66.4 grams, and it declined to 44.6 grams during 1999-2008. We have been talking of the Second Green Revolution during the last 40 years. It is too late. By this time, we should have actually the Third Green Revolution.

Sir, we have to seriously think about amending a plethora of Agricultural Produce Marketing Acts that make agricultural produce market imperfect--that is, oligopolistic. These Acts and regulations protect the vested interests in the rural areas more than in the urban areas.

Sir, the public distribution system is the most important instrument to control inflation and is suffering from several shortcomings including the rampant corruption. Therefore, it needs total restructuring, rehauling and reorientation. Sir, we are privileged today to have more than 60 MT of food grains and I do not think there

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

is any justification for rising prices of food grains such as rice and wheat.

Sir, distribution of kerosene through public distribution system has become a big failure, as, according to my ordinary guess, 40-50 per cent of the public distribution system kerosene goes to the petrol pumps for adulteration. Something drastically needs to be done in this. I had suggested in my maiden speech that the BPL families should be given a one-time subsidy for installation of LPG cylinders and the kerosene subsidy should be totally eliminated in a phased manner for over a period of four to five years.

Sir, I submit to the hon. Finance Minister that the futures trading should be totally banned at least for the essential commodities for a foreseeable future. The prices of fruits and vegetables are absolutely vulnerable and are fluctuating. In this context, I beg to express my concern towards the recent decision of the Government to allow 51 per cent in FDI in multi-brand trade and 100 per cent in the single brand trade. There is no doubt in my mind that our entire agricultural marketing system needs a total restructuring. But, my concern with respect to FDI in retail market is related to employment. According to

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

the National Sample Survey Organisation' report of 2009, the retail sector provides 35 million jobs of which 25 million in urban areas and 15 million in rural areas.

(Contd. by tdb/3w)

TDB/3W/5.35

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (CONTD.):** This means, it is providing livelihood to about 170 million people in the country. Since the problem of unemployment is becoming very acute every day, what is the impact of this decision on employment/unemployment need to be carefully seen.

I would like to suggest to the hon. Finance Minister that the Government should take initiative in opening up thousands of retail shops on the pattern of Kendriya Bhandars in Delhi for fruits and vegetables in all cities with population, say, more than one lakh. Sir, Kendriya Bhandars on Delhi pattern, if they are opened in all the cities having population between one and two lakhs, then, we will be giving substantial relief to the consumers. And it will give direct relief to consumers and producers.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Sir, my seventh point is, people perceive that no strong deterrent measures and actions have been taken against the hoarders, profiteers and black-maketeers. The people feel that they are at the mercy of the anti-social elements. I, therefore, suggest the Government to take stern action in this regard, as far as possible.

Sir, I would raise two or three issues very quickly. Sir, so far as social justice is concerned, I had mentioned last time that when we discuss poverty, the discussion becomes statistical in nature. The entire discussion on poverty -- Rs.26, Rs.32, one dollar, two dollars - - without referring to the social groups as to who are poor, becomes a statistical exercise. The Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, minorities, particularly Muslim community, rural widows, unemployed, helpless and destitutes are forming more than 75 per cent of the poor people. The entire debate during the last 50 years or 40 years on poverty is absolutely devoid of which are the social groups which are poor. Sir, I have sufficient data, so far as the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes are concerned. Sir, there are two schemes. One is the Special Component Plan for the Scheduled Castes, and the other is the Tribal Sub-Plan for Tribals. Both of them together constitute 25

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

per cent. The Planning Commission had appointed the Task Force, which exempted 41 Ministries out of 61 that they need not pay anything to the Special Component Plan and the Tribal Sub-Plan. I urge upon the Finance Minister and the Government to withdraw this Report, and restore the earlier policy that the allocation of Plan funds for the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes which have been there from 1974-75 and 1979 respectively should be restored.

Sir, there is one related issue. The House might be aware that in Maharashtra, the people who consider Dr. Ambedkar as their gospel are demanding 12 acres of land for that Chaityabhoomi Development Project. The Chaityabhoomi is called Chaityabhoomi because Dr. Ambedkar was cremated there. I urge upon the hon. Finance Minister and the entire Government that before this issue escalates, and becomes full-fledged confrontation between the followers of Dr. Ambedkar -- though we believe in social justice -- and the Government, and the entire House to join with me, to give that 12 acres of land, disregarding its price, for the development of Ambedkar Chaityabhoomi. That will be a tribute to Dr. Ambedkar, so far as social justice is concerned.



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Sir, another important issue is regarding women and child development. When I was hearing the speeches, I did not hear anything about the social sector development. We are talking of empowering of women. In Rajya Sabha, we have already passed the Bill giving 33 per cent reservation to women in the Central Legislature. We have made 50 per cent reservation for women in the local self-governing bodies. Sir, women in this country are not allowed to be born! What is the ratio per thousand of men? It was 971 women in 1951, as against, in 2001, they were just 931. The ratio increased; from 990 to 931 during a period of ten years. Is this the kind of empowerment we are talking of? What is the stand of the Government on this issue? I am surprised to know that even the political class in the country is not sensitive to what is called disgracefully as honour killing. When we are talking of culture, and when we are teaching culture to the entire world, and we say this is the land of culture, this honour killing is happening in our country. Is there any country in the world where lovers, boy and girl, 16, 17, 20, 25 years, just because they are loving each other, they are kidnapped and they are burnt alive, and that is disgracefully called as honour killing? There is no

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

word in the dictionary to describe this kind of disgraceful act. I urge upon the Government not to treat honour killing on par with normal killings or normal murders, and the Government should enact a law immediately, so far as this particular act is concerned.

(Contd. by 3x-cls)

KLS/3X-5.40

**DR. BHALCHANDRA MUNGEKAR (CONTD):** The last point is about atrocities against the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. Sir, this country never suffers because of the scarcity of Acts. Prof. Dantewala, who was my professor, told me that this country does not suffer from the scarcity of Acts, from the famine of Acts. It suffers because of the implementation of the Acts or the bad implementation of the good Acts. Five thousand Scheduled Caste women are annually raped so far as the Report of the Scheduled Castes Commission is concerned. This country is not agitated even for a single time on this. There has not been a motion of adjournment for a single time on this. Therefore, people will ask the question, which Ambedkar asked Gandhi in the Round Table Conference, "Mr. Gandhi, I do not have motherland." In order to provide satisfactory

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

answer to 2011, I think the Government adopts serious measures to deal with the menace of atrocities against the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. Thank you very much, Sir.

(Ends)

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS (ASSAM):** Sir, this is a Bill which has been passed by Lok Sabha. I would like to give some observations in the light of the discussion by our hon. Members. The Government is actively pursuing the economic reforms for the sustainable growth of our economy. Sir, my suggestion is that the Government should more and more concentrate on micro economic policies to promote growth, develop products as well as financial markets and increase social spending for providing a stronger foundation to protect the poor. The growth rates projected by the World Economic Outlook, WEO, for the year 2011-12 are 6.6 per cent and 6.4 for emerging and developing economies and 8.2 per cent and 7.8 per cent for India. Now the growth rates for emerging and developing economies and for India projected by WEO for the year 2012 is less than that for 2011. Sir, it means the growth has shown a declining trend. On the other hand, we must understand that we will have a due role to reduce

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

unemployment. The present economic growth fails to reduce unemployment. In its latest Country Overview of India, the World Bank says, "A long section of the population, especially the poor, the Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Backward Classes, minorities and women lack access to the resources and opportunities needed to reap the benefit of the economic growth." Sir, the unemployment rate in India was last reported at 9.4 per cent in fiscal year 2009-10. From 1983 to 2000, the unemployment rate averaged at 7.20 per cent reaching historically high of 8.30 per cent in December 1983 and a record low of 5.99 in December 1994. There is every need for greater investment in infrastructure as priority for generating employment. I should mention here that resources mobilization on the part of the Government is tardy as well as it fails to tap new avenues. What the Government needs to do is to exercise its fiscal power formulating and enacting good structured policies that will encourage growth and employment. The Government should take more effective steps to boost up agriculture productivity, modernizing agriculture and cutting the fiscal deficit and should sharply enhance farm productivity and control inflation.

(Contd by 3Y/SSS)

SSS/3Y/5.45

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS (CONTD.):** Sir, now I am coming to my State, Assam. My State Assam is the largest State in the North-Eastern Region. Sir, Assam has a moderate growth rate of 5.3 per cent between 2000-01 and 2009-10 as compared to country's average of 8.7 per cent. Large scale illegal migration has eaten up the whole economy and development process of our State. Our economy is dominated by service and agriculture sector. Going into the details of sectoral growth experience of the States, out of 78.44 lakh hectares, only 23.86 lakhs hectares (excepting tea plantation area) is not cropped. Assam is a major producer of rice and tea in the country. Tea is the major industry in Assam. It provided huge opportunity in employment. But tea industry now is in a stress. After tea, the petroleum refinery industry is at Guwahati, Bongaigaon, Numaligarh besides Digboi. But, these refineries are also in stress. The new financial decision taken by the Government on Excise duty and Customs duty affects the refineries in the North-Eastern Region very much. I urge upon the Government to fix the Excise and Customs duty earlier. (Time-bell) Sir, I want only one minute. Every year,

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

considerable portion of the cropped area has been chronically affected by floods and droughts. Let the Government take steps to take flood and erosion problem of the State as a national problem. Let it take steps to adopt more scientific and progressive methods to save the cropped land as well as life and properties of the State for speedy economic growth. State needs change of the presently dominated traditional service by the business services like IT and ITES industry in the State. Sir, corruption is the one of the main hurdles in our sustainable growth of economy. Let us take the example of food and public distribution system. We are talking about development of *aam admi*. It is a fact that according to Chief Economic Advisor, Government of India, 44 per cent of the foodgrains meant for the poor never reach them through the Public Distribution System. Sir, you will be surprised to note that at the tune of Rs. 30,000 crores PDS....

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please conclude.

**SHRI KUMAR DEEPAK DAS:** Sir, I am concluding. It has been unearthed in our State that there is corruption to the tune of Rs. 30,000 crore in PDS by way of issuing fake ration cards. I urge upon the Government to look at such type of serious problems and such

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

type of serious issues so that they can be resolved and the State. As a whole, India can go for a sustainable growth of economy. Thank you very much.

(Ends)

**SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (PUNJAB):** Sir, India clocked an enviable growth of almost nine per cent in the five years from 2003 to 2008. This made us optimistic that we could perhaps have a double digit growth and soon our economy would overtake that of China. Unfortunately, thanks to the miserable performance of UPA-II which is not only a prisoner of indecision, but, also perhaps the most corrupt that the country has witnessed after the Independence of India. There is a sense of despondency, gloom and pessimism all around. Only blaming the world financial crisis for all the ills that face our economy would be too simplistic. Sir, there are several initiatives that the Government needs to take and should have taken. The foremost initiative should be in the field of agriculture. Although it comprises only 15 per cent of our GDP yet almost two-thirds of our population is dependent on it.

(Contd. by NBR/3Z)

-SSS/NBR-GS/3Z/5.50.

**SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (CONTD.):** The foremost challenge before the Government is to step up agriculture production and productivity. For this, we have to make agriculture a viable business. Today, overwhelming majority of the farmers, all over the country, is mired in deep debt. They are dependent on *Artiyas* and money-lending sharks in the absence of organized farm credit facilities. To make matters worse, the MSP that they get is not in line with the cost of production. For example, in the last one year, prices of fertilizers have gone up by almost 60 per cent to 70 per cent. Seed prices have gone up by more than 25 per cent and fuel/energy prices have gone up by more than 40 per cent. Yet, the MSP has gone up by merely 10 per cent to 12 per cent. Since this Government came to power, the MSP of wheat and rice has gone up by only 8.5 per cent and 9.5 per cent per annum compounded whatever the other figures show. As a result, we see thousands of farmers committing suicide every year.

Sir, we have millions of tons of foodgrains rotting in the open. Yet, the poor go hungry to bed. Why have we not invested in modern



Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

storage facilities? The Government needs to rope in the private sector to set up modern silos which would help in eliminating waste as well as theft.

I would like to suggest to the hon. Finance Minister, like in the case of power generation, the Government should allow a predetermined rate of return on investment to the private sector, say 14 per cent or 15 per cent, to set up silos and provide infrastructure status to this industry so that bank credit is available to this sector. Engineers India Limited or any other Government agency can be asked to design and work out the cost of setting up of silos. You will see an overnight change in the investment scenario in this sector and millions of tonnes of our foodgrains are saved.

The second challenge before the Government is expanding our employment base. We have to put millions of our young people to work and make them a national asset and not a liability. For that, we need to invest in education and especially in skill development.

Our experience with the 7,000 odd ITIs has not been very encouraging. Again, we need to involve the private sector if we are to

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

bridge the gap between demand and supply. We churn out 3.5 lakh engineers every year, but barely a quarter are employable.

May I suggest to the hon. Minister that in the next Budget, please give a weighted deduction for expenses incurred in establishing and running skill development centres to companies. Similarly, corporate that hire people from these skill development centres should get some credits when it comes to payment of excise by way of incentivizing them to hire more people.

This brings me to a very important point of labour reform. Right now, there is a perverse incentive to push labour into the unorganised sector. Liberalization of labour laws need not necessarily be anti-labour. We must have a compassionate policy, but it does not mean that this subject should be a closed chapter for all times to come. If we have to compete with China and make India an industrial and manufacturing hub to ensure jobs for our young population, then labour reforms is the need of the hour. I hope the hon. Finance Minister, with his well-known persuasive skills, would be able to build a broad consensus on this issue as well along with the FDI in multi-product retail and GST.

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Finally, I would like to reiterate that a stable and predictable macro economic environment is a pre-requisite for growth. May I suggest to the hon. Finance to revisit the MGNREGA to ensure that it not only generates employment but more importantly creates assets and enhances productivity for the economy. As things stand, this scheme has only created a shortage of labour for labour-intensive industry as well as agriculture without creating any corresponding asset or increasing productivity. Unfortunately, in this Government, power and responsibility are totally divorced -- the Government keeps on wasting money on populist schemes without a delivery mechanism in place, with only an eye on the elections and not the economy. I would only like to remind the hon. Finance Minister that in the ultimate analysis it is only good economics that makes good politics.

(CONTD. BY USY "4A")

-NBR-USY/4a/5.55

**SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (CONTD.):** Finally, Sir, I have six suggestions for the hon. Finance Minister's consideration: (1) Simplify the rules of taxation under the new tax code. Discretionary powers of assessing officers should be eliminated. Clearly define

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

what is short term, long term and business income. Presently, huge bribes are being demanded by some unscrupulous assessing officers because of lack of clarity on this issue. Reduce the direct taxes and increase the indirect taxation so that savings are encouraged and consumption is taxed; (2) while I welcome the package that the hon. Finance Minister has given to his home State of West Bengal, I would like to remind him that Thirteenth Finance Commission had recommended that the case of West Bengal, Kerala and Punjab should be considered. I hope the Finance Minister will not ignore the claims of the Punjab, the Prime Minister's home State; (3) we used to have the Food For Work Programme in the 70's. Since the country has unmanageable reserves of food stock, the MNREGA should be amended by giving some food and some cash for those covered under this scheme. It would help contain food inflation as well as wastage of our food reserves; (4) the country is headed for huge power shortages because fuzzy environmental concerns have put the brakes on the development of our coal reserves. A fast-track GoM should be constituted to provide clarity on the issue and give expeditious clearances to projects which are held up; (5) Hasten the

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

privatization programme. The Government is no where near its target for the year. This would reduce the pressure on banks as Government's borrowings would be reduced and it would help in containing the deficit; (6) may I suggest that the Government recalibrate the currency? I would suggest the hon. Minister to please remove, at least, one zero, if not two zeros from the currency. The currency has lost value in the last sixty years. This would help in (a) eliminating black money that has been stashed away; (b) eliminating the counterfeit currency that is circulating in the market today. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

**DR. ASHOK S. GANGULY (NOMINATED):** Sir, I was not planning to say anything, but I could not resist from making a few points. And, as usual, I will take two minutes. Whenever the Budget deficit grows, it is a sad event. I can't see that the Finance Minister is listening to all the speeches with a great happiness. But it is a very sad event that our deficit is growing. I don't wish to quote statistics, I don't wish to go into depth because my friends have done that. India is losing a golden opportunity to get out of the gloom. All major reforms, in

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

recent days, have been blocked. Let us not forget that; let us not tell the Finance Minister how to run the finances of this country alone. We are all responsible. People are apprehensive the way this House wishes the nation to move and in what direction. People are waiting for direction from this House and the Lower House. They are not looking to us to quote statistics to the Finance Minister. It is not too late yet to reverse our self-inflicted setbacks. Let us not blame each other. Nature has been very kind to us. Nature will not continue to be kind forever. Let us not turn our backs on the India story by making this country, which has got everything going for it, into a country that falls prey to its own ill wishes. Mr. Finance Minister, I wish you all the best. You don't have an easy task. We are not making it any easier for you. But we wish you all the best. I watched you for the last forty years. You have led this country's finances with great skill.

(Contd. by 4b — PK)

**DR. ASHOK S. GANGULY (CONTD.):** I am only praying that you are able to rise to the challenges that we face with the help and support of all of us in this House, in order to understand the gravity that this country and every Indian is facing and not pretend that we have solutions to some of the insurmountable problems we face. I thank you, Mr. Deputy Chairman, for this opportunity for a brief talk.

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The debate on the Appropriation Bill is concluded. The reply to the debate and passing of the Bill will be made tomorrow.

#### **MESSAGES FROM THE LOK SABHA**

- ( I )        The National Capital Territory of Delhi Laws (Special Provisions) Second Bill, 2011.
- ( II )        The Life Insurance Corporation (Amendment) Bill, 2011.

**SECRETARY-GENERAL:** Sir, I have to report to the House the following messages received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha :-

( I )

“In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of

Uncorrected/Not for Publication — 12.12.2011

Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the National Capital Territory of Delhi Laws (Special Provisions) Second Bill, 2011, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 12<sup>th</sup> December, 2011. “

( II )

“In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Life Insurance Corporation (Amendment) Bill, 2011, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 12<sup>th</sup> December, 2011.”

Sir, I lay a copy each of the Bills on the Table.

(Ends)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The House is adjourned to meet tomorrow at 11.00 a.m.

.....

**The House then adjourned at one minute past  
six of the clock till eleven of the clock on  
Tuesday, the 13<sup>th</sup> December, 2011.**